

## COUNCIL CHAMBER

Regular Meeting

May 8, 2018

The fifty-fourth meeting of the City Council of Charleston was held this date convening at 5:10 p.m. at City Hall.

A notice of this meeting and an agenda were mailed to the news media May 2, 2018 and appeared in The Post and Courier May 6, 2018 and are made available on the City's website.

### PRESENT (12)

The Honorable John J. Tecklenburg, Mayor

Councilmember White	District 1	Councilmember Waring	District 7
Councilmember Shealy	District 2	Councilmember Seekings	District 8
Councilmember Lewis ( <i>absent</i> )	District 3	Councilmember Shahid	District 9
Councilmember Mitchell	District 4	Councilmember Griffin	District 10
Councilmember Wagner	District 5	Councilmember Moody	District 11
Councilmember Gregorie	District 6	Councilmember Jackson	District 12

Mayor Tecklenburg called the meeting to order at 5:10 p.m.

The Clerk called the roll.

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Lewis wants everyone to know that he is absent because he is at his nephew's graduation in Spartanburg."

Councilmember Waring said, "And where is that?"

The Clerk said, "U.S.C. – Spartanburg, where my son attended."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. If everyone would like to join us, Councilmember White will lead us in a prayer and the Pledge of Allegiance."

Councilmember White opened the meeting with an invocation.

Councilmember White then led City Council in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you very much. Now, just to let everyone know, in the most unlikely event that we have to evacuate the building, these are our two exits. There is an exit door from the room to my right, and in that event, please do not use the elevator. Just use the two stairs that are going down and then the one stair out to the front. It's very unlikely, but just in case we have to evacuate, I wanted everyone to know."

Now, for a little plug for Piccolo Spoleto, which will be beginning May 25<sup>th</sup>. I believe we have the booklets outside that everybody can take a copy of. There are over 500 events of local artists who will be presented at Piccolo this year. It's an amazing festival, and I must say, in the past, both my predecessor, Mayor Riley, and myself for a couple of years, had the practice of having a little reception on the day that Spoleto starts. There are so many things going on that day, I've decided not to do that anymore and instead invite everyone, Council and the public, to enjoy a little preview of Piccolo Spoleto. So, next Wednesday, May 16<sup>th</sup> at 6:00 p.m. at The Schoolhouse, West Ashley, we will have a West Ashley preview of Piccolo with some performers. Then, the next night, Thursday, May 17<sup>th</sup> at 5:00 p.m. at the City Gallery on Prioleau Street, we will repeat the show, so to speak, and have a preview of Piccolo Spoleto. The public is welcome to attend, of course, and Council, as well, so I hope you all can make one of those two preview receptions for Piccolo Spoleto.

Next, we have no public hearings tonight, so we're going to go straight to approval of the City Council minutes for April 10<sup>th</sup>."

Councilmember Moody said, "Move for approval."

Councilmember Griffin said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion to approve and a second. Are there any additions or deletions?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Moody, seconded by Councilmember Griffin, City Council voted unanimously to approve the minutes of the April 10, 2018 City Council meeting.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "The April 24<sup>th</sup> meeting minutes are deferred until the next meeting. So, next, we have our Citizens Participation Period. I don't know how many people have signed up, but while we're looking for that, I'd like to call Margaret Seidler to come forward and introduce some guests that she has visiting Charleston from China, and tell us briefly about their visit. Please share with them that we Charlestonians and the Chinese have something in common. We both tend to eat rice every day and worship our ancestors, so we have that commonality, and welcome you to Charleston. Margaret."

Margaret Seidler said, "Good. Thank you so much, Mr. Mayor. I am so excited to introduce Taylor, if you will stand, Rex, and Joy, and they're all living in Florida right now. Rex and Taylor just finished a Master's Program, and I think they're hoping to stay in the United States. The way we got connected is, Taylor and I had the same professor. I had a professor 25 years ago, who actually went to China to run a Young Women's Leadership Program that Taylor was in. This professor now lives in Arizona, so when she knew that Taylor was coming to Charleston, South Carolina, she knew who to connect her with. I thought it would be really good for these young people to see what a self-governing democracy is all about, and they're really excited to be here, so thank you so much."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you for being with us. Next, we have maybe a dozen or so folks signed up. We have 30 minutes, and we're going to allow a couple of minutes for everyone. Madam Clerk will call out the names. So, please, just come forward, state your name and address before speaking."

The Clerk said, "We'll start with Mohammed Idris, followed by Ann Birdseye, and then, Claire Curtis."

1. Mohammed Idris thanked Councilmember Gregorie when he told Mt. Moriah Church they had the land and resources to help. He had heard the Mayor talk about how good the staff was, but if he worked for the City and drove a police car and got his gas paid for, etcetera, he would work hard, too. He said, 'To whom much is given, much is expected,' and he said Moses' staff turned into a snake, and the City of Charleston was full of snakes.
2. Ann Birdseye was a member of Circular Congregational Church and CAJM. Greater Charleston was a tale of two cities for tourists visiting Charleston, and it was the best of times. They could soak in Charleston culture, eat at fine restaurants, and relax. On the other hand, Charleston was an increasingly difficult place to live. People who had lived in Charleston for generations could barely afford housing, and many experienced the worst of times. Some people said that they couldn't afford to do anything about housing, but they couldn't afford not to. The last time the City of Charleston gave money to the South Carolina Community Loan Fund was through a \$25,000 grant in 2017. In researching what made housing trust funds successful, they could dedicate an ongoing funding source as the key. Representatives from CAJM were attending three public meetings. There were several in the audience who supported CAJM, and she asked them to stand.
3. Claire Curtis was a member of KKBE and CAJM, and they had been asked why they were pushing for this when the City of Charleston had already passed the \$20 million bond. It was a good first step, but would not solve the problem alone, as it was a one-time bond, and an ongoing solution was needed. Mayor Tecklenburg's call to action, from his 2017 State of the City Address, recognized that when he said, 'On housing, it is clear that housing affordability is a regional issue at a crisis level, and we must use every tool at our disposal and work with all partners to provide more affordable housing products in the Charleston region.' They applauded the City for moving forward with the Charleston Redevelopment Corporation. Land trust and housing trust funds worked well together. The most important component needed for land trust was money to buy land, and a housing trust fund could provide funds for the Charleston Redevelopment Corporation to buy land. Charleston had been the leader in providing housing for all citizens and they thanked Councilmembers Gregorie, Waring, Jackson, and Lewis for supporting the housing action plan. They urged the Mayor and the rest of Council to meet with CAJM and other allies to take concrete steps to solve the regional housing crisis.
4. Brett Barry was a member of the Charleston Historical Monuments Coalition, which was a group of local residents who wished to preserve the historic monuments in the City and their history. Many of them belonged to some of the over 40 various heritage organizations in Charleston, and some were descendants of the City's earliest citizens, while others were recent arrivals. They applauded the inclusion of the figures that were being presented as part of the 'Completing the Story' project, as it added to Charleston's history. Their mission had always been to protect this valuable asset by protecting three main pillars, in regards to how Charleston's history was presented: historical accuracy, presenting the facts, which provided the full picture, and allowing individuals to make up their own minds by barring opinionated language and leading narratives. They were

also there to become better informed and were interested in what the process would be for making changes to the audio messages in the future. He asked if City Council would be required, in the future, to approve any changes or would the authority be delegated outside of the City Government? They wanted to hear the specific details on how that would be addressed moving forward, and they hoped Council would retain some type of oversight.

5. Dr. Bobby Baker was a resident of Charleston, which was one of the most visited and friendliest cities in the United States. They knew Charleston was steeped in history. He often stopped and talked to tourists and tried to offer any information they might find useful. He believed that the single most valuable aspect of Charleston was that it was an undivided community and was friendly because people respected each other and their differences. This could not be said all over the nation. While many communities were struggling with a deepening divide, Charleston had stayed on solid ground. He expressed his support for providing an accurate account of all of their ancestors and the efforts to avoid any attempt to divide the community. As long as they stayed true to presenting factual, non-opinionated information, then he believed they had honored the ancestors of Charleston with integrity. He said to let everyone join efforts to ensure that the truth was being presented, and that they preserved Charleston's unbroken and undivided course for everyone's prosperity.
6. Marc Knapp said he was sitting at Highway 17 and Sam Rittenberg, looking at a row of green lights two miles down, and two lights turned red, but no cars came out. He couldn't believe how bad the roads in Charleston had gotten, and somebody needed to either get on DOT, the City, or the County, and start smoothing them out. He said something had to be done about jaywalkers. He knew Council didn't have a lot to do with the Housing Authority, but their buildings were atrocious. He had been repairing water mains that were cast iron, and someone had threaded the opening, which was a tap, and had put PVC pipe into the opening. Council needed to bulldoze Gadsden Green, along with a few others that were before World War II, and build the high rises first, and put the people in them and sell the property, as the City could make a mint.
7. Phillip Dustan said, in early November, Norm Levine and himself had the opportunity, at Council's request, to show what they had been working on to members of the Department of Stormwater Control, the Planning Department, and the Engineering Department. He explained the structure of Johns Island and presented the work that he had put in front of Council. Mr. Levine had explained there were similar issues in Cainhoj and Long Savannah and throughout the Lowcountry. Johns Island was not a special situation. People's homes were being flooded, their septic systems were failing, and their foundations were cracking. Current zoning and building practices were woefully out of date. Work had been developed by the U.S. Geological Survey for 20 years, and they used the information to real-time disaster flood predictions in helping people and saving lives. This was real data that they presented, not just the findings of their own particular works. The current building practices were actually destructive because not only did they divert the surface water to other people's houses, but they disrupted the hydrology of the land. The Lowcountry forests, especially on Johns Island, had evolved over thousands of years, and they controlled the water cycle. Without them, a tremendous amount of resilience was lost for the communities, with respect to sea level rise and storms. It was time that Council took a serious look at it. He reminded Council that their first duty of government was to protect the lives and safety of the people, not the commercial interests of the developers.

8. Carrie Agnew was a resident of Charleston, and she applauded Council's efforts to have cigarette-free parks for kids and the air they breathe. She found it a little ironic, since they had been trying so hard to get shore power for the cruise ships, which belched out far more dangerous emissions in a very invisible and breathable way that spread over 350 miles from where those cruise ships docked. They had worked tirelessly, at a grass roots level, and had gotten the approval at the State level to require shore power at the new cruise ship terminal and yet, with the passage in 2015 of the Tourism Management Plan, one of the issues was that City Council was going to work hard at getting shore power utilized. As far as she was aware, there had been no conversations with the State Ports Authority. She knew, from a personal level, that they were not necessarily nice conversations to have, and their favorite word was 'no'. She also knew that SCE&G had offered to significantly defray the cost of putting shore power on the Eastside, and that was going to be required with any development that happened along Joe Riley Park. At some point, grass roots people needed the support of their elected representatives to back them up, and it wasn't going to be as expensive as they thought. Last she had heard, it was nominal, what they would have to pay. She stated, while thinking about the health of the children, to also think about the health of everybody.
9. Anthony Bryant said he received a letter from the Federal Court regarding his litigation. The premise was that the frail court didn't recognize African Americans as whole persons and a local rule in 1895 adversely possessed the African American's right to vote, assemble, and speak. The court recognized the local rule of standards for a small business person filing a claim in the local, County, or State court and on their own pro se. Such a complaint could not be filed within the Federal Court as a local business person, in particular, an African American. In terms of him being in the BZA, HUD, and all of this, he knew Senator Scott didn't matter. He said African Americans were still epithets, no matter if they were a U.S. Senator or a Congressman. His grievance was based upon that fact, and he said he would continue to keep the struggle going on his own. He also spoke of infringements on his freedom of speech.

The Clerk said, "So, that's it, Mayor, that concludes."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Did we miss anybody?"

No one else asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next, we're going to have a report of the History Commission and 'Completing the Story', a wonderful community effort bringing the community together. This group that's been formed, under the leadership of Mr. John Rivers, is The Rainbow Group, but first, if I may, call on the Chairman, and I thank you for your service of our History Commission, Harlan Greene."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Mr. Mayor, before they come forward to do their presentation, I would ask my colleagues to really listen carefully to the presentation. I'm also a member of the History Committee, and what they're going to say is something that's really valuable to the City in dealing with the history, with the plaques that we have in the City of Charleston. If we think about history, this will share more because you will be hearing more about it. Once you go to those particular plaques, you will be able to do thus and so, but they're going to explain this to you. I want to put this out now, to my colleagues, to listen very carefully to the presentation. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, Councilmember Mitchell."

Harlan Greene said, "If I may bring Jonathan Green up here as well, too. What we thought we would do, very briefly, is talk about the proposal, talk about the Rainbow Group, and 'Completing the Story'. Jonathan Green will do that, and then I'll take over and talk about what the Commission on History did with the information that came to us."

Jonathan Green said, "Thank you, Harlan. Good evening, Mayor, Councilmembers, and City staff. We are a group called The Rainbow Group, and our interest, simply, is to enhance the City, the culture of the City, the art of the City, for the community and for visitors alike. There's only one way that can be done, and that is by simply telling a fuller story of the history and the culture of Charleston, which has really never been told before. So, this group is working collectively. We are all volunteers and we're not asking of any funds from the City. That's already been taken care of. I'll pass it back over to Harlan Greene, and he will give you more information."

Mr. Greene said, "The Committee consists of myself, Dr. Bernie Powers of the College of Charleston and Jonathan Green. We were called together and asked to come up with, to follow, a model that was done first in London and has now been done in Chicago, Illinois where, as people now approach particular spots in town through a QR Code or some other information, they can actually then punch in a number and then, it's living history. It's three minutes of text when, if you stand, let's say, in front of the Pollitzer Sisters Monument on Pitt Street, you will queue in something, and then you will hear three different voices representing the Pollitzer Sisters talking about their contribution to history. So, that's quickly what it is about, and we think if you don't use technology it will be forgotten. Then, the way this worked is these things were drafted, and they were presented to the Commission on History on March 7, 2018. That Commission, of which I am the Chair, approved, with some emendations, the proposals for Septima Clark, the Grimké Sisters, Robert Smalls, Denmark Vesey, the Pollitzer Sisters, Philip Simmons, Alonzo Ransier, and J. Waties Waring. These are the first ones, and we see that there will probably be more in the future. If you all have any questions or would like to hear a sample, we're prepared."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Mitchell.

Councilmember Mitchell said, "First of all, I would like to make a motion that we approve it, but I would like Mr. Rivers also to come up and give us a little information on that, because I spoke with him briefly, and I think this is something that we all will be proud of with the history part of it."

John Rivers said, "Well, thank you, Representative Mitchell. The goal is to 'Complete the Story' of history and to bring this community together, and I got this idea when I visited London. I was standing next to this statue, and it had a blue dot on it, and it said, 'Put your phone up, and put it next to the QR Code, or to dial a certain number, and the statue will talk to you.' So, this particular statue was Rowland Hill and I said, 'This is kind of crazy', but I did it anyway. I get a phone call back from Rowland Hill, the statue, and he says, 'I founded the Penny Post, and let me tell you why I did it.' So, he told a story about how he was in love with this particular woman, and he sent her a letter. He never heard back from her, and he said, 'My goodness, what have I done to offend my darling? I'm so in love with her. I want to marry her.' So, he got on his horse and rode for four days, and he got to her and he said, 'Darling, what have I done? How did I offend you?' and she said, 'I didn't have enough money to pay for your letter.' Back then, the recipient paid for the letter, and he said, 'Well, we've got to fix that. We'll turn it around where the sender pays for the letter, and they paid a pence.' Most of you here are too young to remember, but the first postcards that were sent from here were a penny and then two cents for a letter. So, that's the basis for the postal system in the United Kingdom, which

was then adopted by us here in America. I said, 'Well, that's a pretty good idea', and I learned something. So, we assembled this group, not knowing what to call ourselves and ended up with the name The Rainbow Group. The whole premise is to use Walter Edgar, who is considered the guru of history for the State of South Carolina, and edit some of his works, not so that they're politically leaning one way or the other, but so that the facts are historically accurate, as was referred to earlier, and then have people that are mostly local read whatever the text is. The text is meant to be 600 words or maybe up to two minutes, and I actually have a demonstration here.

If you walked up to the statue, and you see this sign right here, it tells you what to do, so you put it up to the QR Code, and you get a picture of Alonzo Ransier. Well, I never heard of Alonzo Ransier, but listen to Alonzo as it says, 'Go'. He's calling me from his statue. I answer the phone. 'Greetings from the past. I'm Alonzo Jacob Ransier, South Carolina's first, and to this date, only, Black Lieutenant Governor, delighted to make your acquaintance.' There's a story that when the imminent African American activist Booker T. Washington visited Charleston he heard some brick mason shout from the top of a building. 'Governor', they called. 'Hurry up and bring up more bricks.' Washington asked his companion, who was this Governor they spoke to? Turns out, it was me, former Governor of South Carolina now struggling to make ends meet as a street laborer. It was a sad end to my political career. Born a free man in Charleston in 1834, I worked as a shipping clerk, but entered politics as soon as I was legally allowed. It was a time of exciting possibilities. The end of the Civil War had given four million slaves their freedom, and as newly enfranchised Black people gained a voice in government for the first time in American History, biracial governments came to power. I was part of that history, elected to South Carolina's House of Representatives during the Reconstruction Period. A moderate, I successfully opposed literacy requirements for voters and supported provisions to prohibit racial discrimination. I believed in the right of women to vote, attending the 1870s Women's Suffrage Convention in Columbia. After my term as Lieutenant Governor, I was elected to the U.S. House of Representatives in 1872 but, with the end of Reconstruction in South Carolina, I lost all political support, and my career came to an abrupt end in 1877. I never did find comparable employment and was forced to make ends meet as a laborer and night watchman. I died of malaria in 1882 at the age of 48. My tragedy was America's tragedy. In less than a decade, those golden years of interracial democracy ended in violent backlash and White supremacy was restored. It was another long entury before our legacy was revived during the Civil Rights Movement of the 1960s. So, remember my story, and don't ever forget to fight for the freedoms owed to you and to us all.' Then, you hang up."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mr. Rivers continued, "So, that one was a little bit longer than the normal one, but we will bring to life, Septima Clark. You see, I always thought of her as Septima Clark, but her real pronunciation is Septíma Clark. Robert Smalls, the Grimké Sisters, Philip Simmons, Alonzo Ransier, Denmark Vesey, the Pollitzer Sisters, and so my thinking is that this is an opportunity for us to join together as a community, to also be leaders, leading in bringing people together, but also being a leader in education because how many people walk up to one of these markers and they'll read it, but there's really no emotion to it. Does reading it really pique your curiosity where you might want to go find out some more about Alonzo Ransier or Septíma Clark, or any of the other people that are here? So, what we're asking for, as The Rainbow Group, is your permission to go forward and to, as Representative Mitchell said, please, give us the go-ahead to 'Complete the Story.' Thank you."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Mr. Mayor, since we already have a motion on the floor, I wanted to say that I was very interested in this because I was part of the Civil Rights Movement

in the 1960s, when I mentioned that I got arrested 25 times back right here in Charleston, demonstrating and things. So, history was something that I will always, along with Keith Waring's father, Louis Waring, he was out there with me, and that's why they always call me another name, but this is something I was very, very interested in. Mr. Rivers came and spoke to me about it and, I said, 'I don't have a problem with it, it's good.' It's something nice that we needed to know the history of a lot of different people, and this is not a racial thing. Everybody would be there hearing the history of the different people that came forth in that movement, if you may. So, this is why I wanted it to come to Council, and I wanted him to talk about it, so we can go ahead. I'm asking my colleagues to vote unanimously on this. Thank you very much. Mr. Mayor, you can call for the question."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, Councilmember Mitchell."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring said, "I won't be long. I just want to thank a group of citizens, like those who volunteered to do this kind of work. I just think that's awesome. So, not to belabor any longer, I'm certainly going to support this one. Thank you all for what you have done. I think it's the beginning of something very good."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, "Just out of curiosity, as a kind of a practical thing, I assume what we would be voting on would be these seven names tonight, but I understand there's 200 or so that you have planned. Is that correct? Is this all of them or what?"

Mr. Rivers said, "No, this is the beginning, and the idea for the future is to select additional names and places, go through the same process of the Commission on History, go back and get City Council approval again, so that it's totally transparent, and then, ultimately, hopefully, have writing contests to encourage school children to write a history of a particular person or monument and then, have a Committee who would select the winner of that. There would be some kind of financial remuneration, but all of this isn't going to cost the City a dime."

Councilmember Moody said, "No, I just wanted to hear what your plans in the future were. This is not the end of it. This is really just the beginning, is the point I wanted to make. Is there any, liability is not the right word, these are being attached to monuments, and those silver plaques and things like that all over the City. Is it limited to just Charleston, or is there any other place we can take it, or do you have plans to take it? Do you have to get permission to put this on this stuff, I guess, is really my question? We're not just approving the words. We're approving permission for you to put it on, and I don't even know if we own those plaques or not."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "If I may give my interpretation of the answer to that question, I might ask our Counsel to weigh in, as well. Honestly, historically, it has not been the practice of City Council to approve every word on every plaque and every word of every statement. That's been left to the History Commission. I think the matter that came before us a few months ago, with John C. Calhoun, I felt that it was of such significance that it needed to come to Council's approval. I feel that the History Commission is empowered with representation from Council, Councilmembers Griffin and Mitchell now serve on the Commission, to be able to make the decisions to do the historical research and approve, I wouldn't say everyday matters like this, but matters like this and the wording on plaques throughout the City. That's what they're charged with. In this case, it's maybe a peculiar little addition. We do have to approve the placement of any markers on our property, so in the case where it's a sticker like this that's put on City property, normally that's approved by our Design Review Committee, which I'm a

member of, and doesn't necessarily require Council approval either. So, of course, if they're doing a personage or a topic that does not involve City property, The Rainbow Group is, actually, free to make arrangements with whatever property owner you want to. I felt that this effort is so thoughtful and such a benefit to telling the whole story for our City that, in addition to being approved by the History Commission, just in a general direction, we would like to bring it to City Council tonight for your approval. It's not that we're approving every single word that's written in here, and that's not our job, but to give a general direction of approval for you to proceed with our blessing."

Councilmember Moody said, "Well, that's kind of what I was trying to figure out, what are we approving? I'm fine with the words. Are we going to allow them to do anything? Do they need to bring those back? Do we just agree that that's the kind of plaque we want? I agree, if Mr. Rivers has a monument down on his building that he wants to put it on, he's free to do that."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, I think we're giving them a blessing for a general direction with the approval, with the understanding that they will always come back to the History Commission for specific approval on the wording and that they will come to the Design Review Committee about placement of stickers or markers on our property."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregorie.

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Yes, Mr. Mayor, of course I'm going to support it, but I'm hoping that in the future we follow procedures. It should come before the Recreation and Parks because the History Commission falls under the Recreation Standing Committee."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thanks for reminding me."

Councilmember Gregorie continued, "So, in the future, bring it before us, and then we can do it before the body, as a whole."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I see."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilwoman Jackson.

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Mayor, I would suggest that maybe we are approving the new initiative, so it literally is something that would be brand new in front of the Parks and Rec Committee. Then, at that point, I would be happy to authorize the History Commission working under the auspices of Parks and Rec to approve any other additions to this brand new project."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Right. Alright."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Mitchell.

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Mr. Mayor, next time we'll do that. We will remember next time. We'll get that done and take it through the Recreation Committee, but I think we can go ahead and approve this now, and next time we'll make sure we go through those channels."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you. Are there any further questions or discussion?"

No one else asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Mitchell, seconded by Councilmember Waring, City Council voted unanimously to approve the Report of the History Commission: "Completing the Story – Bringing the Community Together – The Rainbow Group".

--INSERT COMMISSON REPORT--

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Mr. Rivers, Mr. Greene, and Mr. Green, and other members of The Rainbow Group, thank you so much for bringing this to the City. We applaud you."

Mr. Rivers said, "Thank you."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, we're going to pass over the next item on the agenda because the Ambassador is not here yet, I don't believe."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring said, "Well, that just gives me a good segue to move out of order. I think we have some housekeeping to go back and correct. We have Citizens Participation and, for the most part, we have freedom of speech, but when that speech is disparaging to our staff, we need to go back and correct that. When Mr. Mohammed referred to our staff as being 'snakes,' I can't tell you how incorrect that is. Many of these people in here today have already put in eight hours working on behalf of this City. They extend themselves to be here just in case any citizen or Council or certain Mayor would have a question on any given subject. So, today, would be in some cases a 12-, 13-, 14-, 15-hour day. That goes above and beyond. I can't tell you how proud we are of this staff. During the meltdown, we had somewhere north of 1,900 employees. Today, we have about 1,700 employees, and we are literally experiencing record growth right now, and it's still being accommodated. They're overworked, they're underpaid, and they don't deserve that. So, I thought you would want to say something and I know, I think all of us feel, that our staff need to be celebrated and not be the subject of a cheap shot."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I don't normally allow outbursts in the City Council Chambers, but I ask everyone to join me in a round of applause for our staff."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregorie followed by Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Yes, just speaking of staff, because I totally agree with my colleague here, that staff really does not get the kind of recognition that they need. For instance, it's been flooding at Fishburne and President Streets all of my life. It's been flooding at Ashley and Sumter all of my life. The pump stations are not even in yet, and it doesn't flood there anymore. I think we need to make sure, when these kinds of things happen, that we applaud our staff because, as you know, that's been an issue in this City most, if not all, of our lives. So, our staff does a remarkable job, in terms of delivering to the citizens of this City, and I applaud them."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, "Yes, I just wanted to pick up on what Councilmember Waring said, and I think that the Chair of any Committee, in this case, it would be you, but Ways and Means or any other Committee, if there are personal attacks like that, they ought to be ruled

out of order, immediately, when it occurs. So, I would ask you to be observant and all of us, as we chair Committees, to be observant of that. Thank you.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Well, thank you, sir.”

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilwoman Jackson.

Councilwoman Jackson said, “Yes, I would agree with Councilmember Moody on that basis, Mr. Mayor, but I wanted to say that we have an opportunity quarterly to celebrate our staff at their employee awards breakfast. It’s a great time and it’s a wonderful spot. The sun always shines at the Maritime Center, I’ve been told, and you get a great breakfast. We hear the stories of amazing employees and really get to sit with them and shake their hands. So, I would encourage you to come to the next one which, I think, is in June, right? Thank you.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “I hear you. I don’t want to give the impression that I don’t listen to every word of each and every citizen, so I would welcome an objection from any Councilmember, in the future, for me to rule upon.”

Councilmember Moody said, “I accept that challenge, Mr. Mayor.”

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Alright. Thank you very much. So, since we’re out of order a little bit, and we’re waiting for the Ambassador to arrive, I would like to call on Councilmember Shahid to come forward and share with Council an award that the City recently received.”

Councilmember Shahid said, “Would Councilmember Wagner come up with me? Councilmember Lewis is not present, but the three of us serve on the West Ashley Revitalization Commission. Last week, on May 1<sup>st</sup>, we were attending the Historic Charleston Foundation Founders Day Charter Meeting and we, being the West Ashley Revitalization Commission, received the Robert N.S. and Patti Foos Whitelaw Founders Award. If I could just read to you the letter that we received in recognition of this:

*‘The Whitelaw Award recognizes individuals, groups, or government entities for the long term protection and preservation of important buildings and places, as well as those involved with the preservation advocacy. We believe that the hard work and community engagement by the West Ashley Revitalization Commission will make a positive difference for West Ashley and the entire City of Charleston as this plan is implemented in the coming years.’*

So, for the work that we have done to date, on the approval that Council did, of the Plan West Ashley and the work that the Commission has done to date, we are recipients of this award. So, it was a great recognition by the Foundation.”

There was applause in the Chamber.

Councilmember Shahid continued, “So, thank you all for your support, and we appreciate this. I’ll be taking this to the Commission meeting with us tomorrow. We’re meeting tomorrow at 5:30 p.m. at the Town and Country on a workshop. Please come if you have the ability to join us tomorrow. Thank you.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, WARC members, all. Next, to move along, until I know our delegation is in place, we have the matter of approval of a Planning Commission Appointment that was printed to you."

Councilmember Moody said, "Move for approval."

Councilmember Griffin said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion to approve and a second. This is to appoint Donna Jacobs as a member of the Planning Commission."

Councilmember Seekings said, "I have a question. Is this filling an expired term, or did somebody resign?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Someone resigned. Terry Seabrook resigned."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, sir. Is there any discussion?"

No one else asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Moody, seconded by Councilmember Griffin, City Council voted unanimously to approve the appointment of Donna Jacobs to the Planning Commission.

--INSERT APPOINTMENT MEMO--

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Then, we had two Councilmember Appointments to both CARTA and the Carolina Art Association."

Councilmember Waring said, "I'm thinking about a filibuster."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "I am too."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Have at it."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, we'll approve Items I(d) and I(e). Do I hear a motion?"

Councilmember White said, "So moved."

Councilmember Griffin said, "Second."

The Clerk said, "So, we're taking those together?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, ma'am."

The Clerk said, "So, it will be Councilmember White and Councilmember Griffin for both?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Right."

On a motion of Councilmember White, seconded by Councilmember Griffin, City Council voted unanimously to approve the appointments of Councilmember Lewis and Councilmember Seekings to the CARTA Board and the appointment of Councilmember Seekings to the Carolina Art Association Board.

-- INSERT APPOINTMENT MEMOS --

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next, we'll move along with our Council Committee Reports. First, on Community Development, Councilmember Mitchell."

Councilmember White said, "So moved."

Councilmember Griffin said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Would we like to highlight anything from that Committee Meeting, Councilmember Mitchell?"

Councilmember Mitchell said, "The only thing, if you will, Items J(1)(a), J(1)(c), and J(1)(d) were for information only. On J(1)(b), we approved the 2018-2019 Federal Housing and Community Development Budget. So, the only thing I need your approval on is that one."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Right, and actually I think it was approved as part of the Ways and Means Committee, as well."

The Clerk said, "Yes."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright, but we'll receive the report on the whole Committee."

On a motion of Councilmember White, seconded by Councilmember Griffin, City Council voted unanimously to adopt the Committee on Community Development Report, as presented:

---INSERT COMMITTEE ON COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT REPORT---

- a. Presentation and Update: Housing Authority of the City of Charleston Cooper River Bridge Redevelopment Site (INFORMATION ONLY)
- b. Review and Approval of the 2018-2019 Federal Housing and Community Development Budget
- c. The Day Resource Center at 529 Meeting Street (INFORMATION ONLY)
- d. Presentation and Update to Housing Development Opportunities in the City of Charleston (INFORMATION ONLY)

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next, our Committee on Public Safety. Sorry I didn't make that today."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shahid.

Councilmember Shahid said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor and members of Council. The Public Safety Committee met yesterday with one item on the agenda, and that is the review and recommendation concerning the Charleston Citizen Police Advisory Council. Our brand new Chief, Luther Reynolds, was present with us yesterday. This proposal came out of the work by his predecessor, Chief Mullen, and the Illumination Project. I don't know if any other members

of the Illumination Project, yes, Margaret (Seidler) is still with us. So, this recommendation from the Illumination Project is right on point with this Advisory Council. It's an Advisory Council. It's not here to accept direct complaints and rule on those complaints. It's here to create open and transparent dialogue between the community and between the Police Department. I'm going to ask the Chief if he wouldn't mind just coming forward, and then I'll give a follow-up report, as to some of the concerns that the Committee had, regarding the makeup of this Council."

Chief Luther Reynolds said, "I've been able to get briefed by Margaret (Seidler) and the Committee, from Legal with the City, with my team, and some of the community members. I think it's a great idea. I look forward to embracing this and getting it across the finish line. I think that's what we're voting on tonight. I think it's going to be a good way of continuing the healthy dialogue, the healthy engagement, and the healthy discussions that, I think, already exist. This is a formalized way of people having an audience with the Chief, with some of my team, who are here tonight. We welcome this as another way of collaborating and partnering. I see it as a very positive thing. It hasn't necessarily always been viewed that way, but I think it's a great idea, and I look forward to getting it done and moving forward."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Thank you, Chief. Let me just highlight some of the questions that the Committee had yesterday in reviewing this. Number one, is the number of members, not the composition of the members, but the number of members on this. Each member of Council would have a selection, and the Mayor, eight, plus three high school seniors, so we're getting up to 26 total, if you include the Mayor and the Chief, as members of this. That's a huge number of folks, and so, one of the concerns we had was, Mayor, reducing your number from eight to four, not to do that to exclude anybody, obviously, but to keep it open and to keep the composition in a pragmatic format, so that you and the Chief are working together and being forward-moving with the things on your agenda that may pop up from time to time. The other question that came up was, are we excluding any members of the Chief's senior staff from participating and attending these meetings, and we do not want to do that. I think his senior staff members need to be present with that and, like I said earlier, the three high school seniors would be a part of this. We wanted to make sure that they were of legal age of 18, or at least 17, and gotten their parents' permission to do this. So, just some pragmatic questions that we had raised concerning those issues regarding that but, overall, the Committee gave its full support for this being implemented and approved by Council."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, "In terms of the Councilmembers picking someone, is there a selection criteria?"

Councilmember Seekings said, "They have to live in the City, or work in the City, and not have a criminal record, or be under indictment."

Councilmember Moody said, "Yes, but anything specifically, other than that, that you're looking for? I guess I'm trying to figure out, so that we don't have --"

Councilmember Shahid said, "Yes, and let me address that, because I came up with Councilmember Wagner's concerns that we, who represent the majority of West Ashley, may have too much of a broad representation from West Ashley, and dilute with maybe more areas of concern for the downtown or the Peninsula part. So, the Mayor's choices could adjust that. When you read the mission statement, 'To bring together people of diverse backgrounds encompassing ethnicity, academia, business leaders, faith-based organizations, elected officials, media, and law enforcement', we need to make sure that we are following somewhat

within that criteria. If we're not, then the Mayor's Appointments could fill that gap, as well. As Councilmember Seekings just said, the qualifications require not only that you have no criminal record, but that you attend Policing 101 training and participate in police ride-alongs, plural. This is a working Committee, a working Council, so I think one of the issues that you may want to make sure that you've gotten in mind is, whoever is appointed is going to have to roll up their sleeves and work. But, yes, that was the only criteria that we had, so I think you could elect or appoint somebody even outside your district area or--"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings.

Councilmember Seekings said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. This is an important Committee, and the timing of it probably couldn't be any better, except we don't have one yet, and the Chief is embarking on his career here in Charleston, and it's a chance for him to get citizen input from the very beginning. I applaud the Chief, I applaud you, Mayor, and I applaud Councilmember Shahid for leading this charge. I'm sort of the one, I think, that brought up the concern about the size of this Committee, only because we've had lots of other large Committees before, and when they've gotten down to brass tacks and gotten their job done, it's when that Committee has been pared down a little bit. The West Ashley Revitalization, the Short Term Rental Task Force, all of that, just getting 26 people in one place at one time is a very difficult chore. On this Committee, not only do you have to have a clean background check, you've got to work. You've got to actually go to school, and you've got to go to Policing 101. You've got to do ride-alongs. In order for them to be cohesive and to move forward and to give you all of the tools that you need, particularly you, Chief, I just think 26 is unwieldy, and if we can get that number down, I think it would probably be a much more effective Committee. So, that was what was sort of brought up yesterday when we were at this Committee meeting. I'd like to hear the Chief's sort of thoughts on this, and then go forward from there. It's not a deal breaker by any stretch of the imagination, but let's get a Committee that's actually going to go to work."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Mitchell.

Councilmember Mitchell said, "I just want to ask one question. I know you have it on there with the qualifications that say 'no criminal record', or whatever the case may be, but I don't believe that has anything to do with a person's serving on a Committee. Those particular individuals might be able to give more insight sometimes on things that are happening in this community, even with giving out information, even with the program that they are working on with young men that are coming through the City of Charleston, where we're giving them a second chance, if you may. I don't understand, because I worked with them in the penal system for a while. I just don't understand that. We are still, to me, discriminating other people again. I don't think that really has anything to do with it, if you have a criminal background that you don't serve on a Committee, that you wouldn't be able to give the information out, to work on it, to use this with the Advisory Committee, if you may. I got arrested all of those times, 14 times, so I might be a criminal, too, when I've been in the Civil Rights Movement. So, look, I'm here now."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Mitchell continued, "So, I'm being serious, very, very serious about that. I'm very serious about that."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I hear you."

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Councilmember Mitchell, in due respect, I think, reading closely, it's talking about people who would be in the active system, so people who are currently

under probation or parole or have outstanding warrants, because I totally agree with you, that people have learned from their mistakes and have the insights of what it's like to be on the other side of the policing system in our community, and to volunteer to better the relationships that we have, would be an invaluable member of this Committee. I do think that we need to be cautious about having somebody who would be actively in some sort of--"

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Well, I believe they need to make that specifically clear."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Can I ask Councilmember Shahid if he can clarify this point?"

Councilmember Shahid said, "Yes, so, it doesn't prohibit anybody from having a prior criminal record. It's just those that have an outstanding legal warrant, or are currently under indictment, or serving a sentence like parole or probation. I agree with you, Councilmember Mitchell, those who have gone through the system have some valuable experience and insight as to how they were treated, what took place as they went through the process, but I think from a legal standpoint, we just need to be careful that if they've got something pending or outstanding, that may cause some other concerns."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I would make a point to use one of my appointments."

The Clerk said, "Mayor, is your microphone on?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "How's that? I'd be happy to use one of my appointments to nominate one of our former offenders that has either come through the Turning Leaf Program or one of those similar programs that, frankly, I've been involved with over the last 10 or 15 years, because people do deserve a second chance, and we've proven in the City of Charleston, we've hired folks, I believe in recycling. We have fine employees that have come out of three different former offender programs. I'd be happy to appoint one of those. So, I think that clarifies that question, and let me state that I'm very happy to reduce the number by eight to four for my appointments, to bring the Committee size down to a manageable number. I would ask that you all go ahead and get me your recommendations first, so if there is some need for consideration for diversity, that I'd be able to fill in the gaps."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Wagner.

Councilmember Wagner said, "A quick thought. One, a great idea. It's about time we got here, that's the first thought that I have. A second thought, I believe that we have too many people here. This basically, as proposed, is about the same size as the West Ashley Revitalization Commission, so that was a lot of people. Now, the third thing is that I think we have a recipe, and we're just not sure what to put in it, and then sometimes rather than throw it all in at one time, just put it in one at a time. In other words, if we start a little bit smaller, then if we need more salt, more pepper, more oregano, more whatever, we've left room to grow and actually tweak the membership a little bit, as opposed to throwing it all in there at once and not being positive what we're going to get, so that's my only thought. By the way, welcome, Chief. Glad to see you, and glad to have you."

Chief Reynolds said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Is there any further discussion?"

No one else asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you. So, the proposal would be to approve this Committee with a reduction of four members?"

Councilmember Shahid said, "Yes, sir."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Six. Four from you and two high school students."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Down to one high school student?"

Councilmember Seekings said, "Yes."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay. So, we're going to reduce by six. Is that a consensus?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring said, "I understand that, Councilmember Seekings, but Mrs. Seidler is here, and one of the things about the Illumination Project is, we had too many gray-haired people in the room, and I think she can speak to that. We got some younger people in the room and got different voices and aspects that, I think, we would have never heard, had they not been there. I think the high school piece, hopefully, can be worked around, and maybe it won't be that bad. Excuse me."

Councilmember Seekings said, "That's alright."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I'm easy. I'll be glad to appoint three. We have a Mayor's Youth Council that comprises high school students really from all over the district. They're wonderful young men and women, and I could easily ask three of them to serve just a year at a time because they graduate and go off to college, but very simple for me to do that."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Griffin.

Councilmember Griffin said, "I think it is important to try to keep the numbers down, so since I'm the youngest, I'll appoint somebody under the age of 25."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Griffin said, "Somebody maybe in college or in high school."

Councilmember Waring said, "Do you know any?"

Councilmember Griffin said, "I know plenty of them."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Shahid said, "Councilmember Waring, at the reception we had yesterday, the only person carded at our alcohol-related reception was Councilmember Griffin."

Councilmember Griffin said, "I wish you all were carded."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I know we'll have another youth member there, but do you all still want to reduce the number on the Committee from three to one, or meet you in the middle and make it two? What do you all want to do?"

Several Councilmembers said, "Two."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Two. We'll make it two. So, we're going to reduce by five members, four from the Mayor and one less youth member. Is there any further discussion?"

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Mitchell.

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Yes, I just want to make sure that we have some young people on there, because a lot of the time we are leaving the young people out of a lot of these things that we are doing. The young people are what we need now in this community to come forward, so we need the young people out here. I don't know what people are doing. Like I tell this Council all the time, I am out in this community all of the time, Councilmember Lewis and me. We are here more so than most of the other Councilmembers, because they don't have to be out here because of the elements. We need to have these young people to get involved in these situations that we are doing, so we can try to steer them in the right direction, and they can lead other young people into it, too. So, I have a big thing when they're dealing with young people coming in. We have to have them there. We're going to be moving off soon, moving on, so we need to have these young people in place, too. I don't like eliminating these young people too much. I just have a little problem with doing things like that. I don't know where we're coming from sometimes, saying 'forget the young people', get one here. No, the things that are happening in this community, who is it happening by? We are talking about it all of the time on this Council, young people. So, we need to engage these young people and these things that are happening now, so they can look forward and go on."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. I would suspect and welcome your appointment, as well, to be someone who is young."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "I don't mind, because I'm out there with them. I don't mind, and I'm just going to tell these other colleagues, my colleagues, don't try throwing kids under the bus now, because they'll be having some problems with me."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Seekings said, "Not a problem."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Are there any further questions or discussion?"

No one else asked to speak.

Chief Reynolds said, "Mayor, can I just speak briefly?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, please. Yes, sir."

Chief Reynolds said, "I just want to assure the Council and the community and those people that are listening today, that the purpose of this is to embrace everything and embody everything that was just discussed. Councilmember Mitchell, I think your point is a good one. I'm lucky I'm on this side of the law and not the other side. It could have easily gone in a different direction. We have a lot of things to work through. I think just about everybody in this Country would recognize that there is a history, there's a lot of distrust for the police, and there's a lot of work that we need to accomplish. We're going to embrace the dialogue, the disagreement, the discourse, the history that exists that's unique to this City, the disenfranchised people that have trust issues with the police. That's the whole purpose of this

Committee. We do not want to hide from any issues. We don't want to rubber stamp this. We want to embrace this and make it meaningful. You have my commitment to that."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Thank you, Chief."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, Chief."

The Clerk said, "Mayor, I think what we need to do is Councilmember Shahid needs to finish his report by making a motion. I know you all are in agreement to reducing by five but, we didn't have a motion when that vote was taken."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I thought we had a motion. I apologize."

Councilmember Shahid said, "I would move that we approve the Charleston Citizen Police Advisory Council Guidelines, as submitted, with the amendment that we reduce the Mayor's choice from eight to four and the high school seniors from three to two."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Second."

On a motion of Councilmember Shahid, seconded by Councilmember Seekings, City Council voted unanimously to adopt the Committee on Public Safety Report, as amended:

---INSERT COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY REPORT---

- Approval of the formation of the Charleston Citizen Police Advisory Council (**AS AMENDED**)

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, now, we are wanting to go--"

Councilmember Shahid said, "Mayor."

Chief Reynolds said, "I'm sorry. Councilmember Shahid, I think we were going to recognize the Committee and some of the great people that put so much work into this over the last year."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Yes, I'm sorry. Thank you. If you all could please stand, the members of that Committee who brought this forward. Thank you, Ms. Hamilton, Ms. Seidler."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Councilmember Shahid said, "Mr. Mayor, if you would just notice the presence of Ms. Hamilton and Ms. Seidler. Margaret and Diane are always involved in something and are two of our most leading citizens in the community. Thank you all for your service."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you so much. So, next, we're going to backtrack a little bit on our agenda and welcome our honored guests that are here with us this evening from Barbados. We are celebrating, today, the Barbados/Charleston connection because we've been talking a lot about our history tonight. A big part of our history is that, of course, sometimes Americans have this concept of enslaved Africans coming to America directly from Africa, and Western Europeans coming here directly from Europe, and, of course, the Native Americans that were here when they got here but, in fact, most of those early settlers, both enslaved and free, came to Charleston by way of Barbados. So, we share a history and a heritage with you that we celebrate. We are really honored today to have with us the

Ambassador to the United States from Barbados, The Honorable Selwin Hart. If I could call Ambassador Hart to please come on forward and join me on the podium. We're just meeting for the first time."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I apologize, Ambassador, that I missed the reception last night, but hopefully we can make up for that as the week goes by. I had to attend an important event up in Columbia, our State Capital, yesterday, so I missed the Rum Reception. I'm not a big rum drinker, Mr. Ambassador, but when I drink rum, I drink Mount Gay Rum."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, we have other guests here with the Ambassador. He might do a better job than I introducing them. Do you mind doing that, Mr. Ambassador?"

Ambassador Selwin Hart said, "I don't mind."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I could call everyone's name out on the sheet, but since I wasn't there last night, I didn't get to meet them all. Then, I also want to recognize our own Neita Wiese, who is leading up our Charleston Sister Cities effort, but if I may give you the microphone, the podium, Mr. Ambassador, and introduce our other guests and make any comments and statement you would like to make."

Ambassador Hart said, "Thank you, Mayor, and first let me thank you for this invitation to address you and the members of the Council. It's always a dangerous thing to give a diplomat or a politician a microphone."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Ambassador Hart continued, "I first wish to recognize my colleagues who are here from Barbados. We have Sir Henry Fraser, who is a noted historian, and there's probably no one else in the World who has written more, studied more, the relationship, the historical and cultural relationship between Barbados and the City of Charleston and the State of South Carolina, in general. Sir Henry."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Ambassador Hart continued, "We also have with us Dr. Kerry Hall, who is the Chief Executive Officer of the Barbados Tourism Product, Incorporated. I think I got that right, Kerry."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Ambassador Hart continued, "As well as Ms. Petra Roach, who heads the North American Office of the Barbados Tourism Marketing, Incorporated. Through Petra's excellent efforts, we broke a 30-year record in terms of visitor arrivals from the United States into the U.S. this year."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Ambassador Hart continued, "I also wish to recognize Barbados' Honorary Consul here in Charleston. Rhoda Green who has worked, Rhoda, please stand, and her husband."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Ambassador Hart continued, "Rhoda is an extremely active member of the Charleston community, and like those early Barbadians that visited and settled this great City and State, she is a pioneer and an adventurer. Rhoda, you've done a fabulous job, and we continue to depend on you, and, finally, last, but by no means least, we have another colleague of mine at the Embassy, Ms. Teresa Graves, who is here with us supporting our delegation."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Ambassador Hart continued, "Finally, Mayor and members of the Council, and you should not apologize for missing last night's reception. I was very late. I was stuck in a meeting with the Vice President. It wasn't only myself, but the members of the Organization of American States. We had a Special Protocolary Session that the Vice President of the United States, Michael Pence, addressed, where we looked at some of the challenges that our hemisphere currently faces and how we, in our hemisphere, Countries of the Americas, can work closely to resolve some of those challenges. It's a privilege, again, for me to be here. We are looking for this signing of the Sister City relationship not to be a mere symbolic act. We believe that we can advance deeper cooperation around our shared values, and our shared culture. We are an active democracy, we are pursuing economic development in an extremely aggressive manner, similar to what you are doing here in this great City of Charleston. So, we believe that this represents the basis for a modernized and reinvigorated Sister City relationship. That's why I'm here, and that's why my colleagues are here, to ensure that we can get this up and running as quickly as possible. So, I look forward to working with all of you and also to welcoming you to Barbados. Thank you."

There was a standing ovation in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, if I may, Mr. Ambassador, we have a letter of understanding between the City of Charleston, South Carolina and the City of Speightstown, Barbados, whence we came, and I would like to read this and then have both of us execute this Letter of Understanding."

Mayor Tecklenburg read the Letter of Understanding.

---INSERT LETTER OF UNDERSTANDING---

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Signed this month of May, and I'm going to go ahead and execute this, Mr. Ambassador, and it's May the--"

The Clerk said, "Eighth."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Eighth, I should've known that. Mr. Ambassador, I've got one more for you to keep, and I'm going to keep one. We're going to keep one."

The Clerk said, "When you complete that, Mayor, you need to do a motion, so the two of you can formally pass the Resolution."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright, and we'll entertain a motion."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "So moved."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Is there any discussion?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, "Yes, I just wanted to welcome the Ambassador, and I've been to your Island several times. We've already had some exchange with some of your citizens down there. The first time I went, I was playing golf. I had arrived by ship, and we were playing on one of the golf courses. I was driving, and we had a forecaddie which, for those of you who don't play golf, you've got somebody that rides around with you and tells you where the course is and that. We had to have a forecaddie, and so I'm driving the cart, and he's standing on the back, and we had to go from one hole to the next. We had to go out onto the street. Well, 'bang, bang, bang, bang' on the top of the cart, I hear him beating. I'm driving on the wrong side of the street, and there's a car coming, but he got me on the right side of the street. Anyway, I have nothing but good, fond, original memories with your Country, sir."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Ambassador Hart said, "Thank you so much. Thank you, sir."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Did I call the question?"

The Clerk said, "No."

On a motion of Councilmember Gregorie, seconded by Councilmember Seekings, City Council voted unanimously to adopt the following resolution:

*A Resolution recognizing our continuing relationship with the City of Speightstown, Barbados, a Sister City of the City of Charleston, and inviting the people of Speightstown, Barbados to participate in the relationship between the two cities.*

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, Mr. Ambassador, could I ask all of your delegation to come forward to the podium for a picture."

Ambassador Hart said, "We have a gift for you, as well. I hope this doesn't break your ethics rules here in the City of Charleston."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Well, it's for the City."

Ambassador Hart said, "It's for the City. It's for you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Not for me personally, but it's beautiful."

Ambassador Hart said, "It's beautiful, and it's made from Barbadian wood, mahogany. Thank you so much."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "It's really beautiful. We can't equal this, but we also have for you, Mr. Ambassador, a memento of Charleston, but if all of the delegation would please come forward. That way, we'll have an opportunity up here together, and I'll ask Ms. Wiese, Neita, to come forward and present a gift to you, Mr. Ambassador, from our Sister Cities Organization. Neita, would you come forward?"

A picture was taken.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, thank you, again, for being with us, Mr. Ambassador, and your delegation. We look forward to working with you. It's really a historic occasion to have you all here and God bless you."

Ambassador Hart said, "God bless you, as well."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, God bless you, and maybe we can catch that drink of rum later tonight somewhere, I don't know. Let's just take a minute. Would you like to address the Council about the history?"

Sir Henry Fraser said, "Well, if you would like me to, two minutes."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Two minutes, yes, after everyone gets to shake the Ambassador's hand. Yes, everyone wanted to meet the Ambassador and the delegation. Could I ask that we come back to order and allow Senator Sir Henry Fraser, who is the historian, to give us just a two-minute synopsis of the root of our history and our relationship? Sir Henry Fraser."

Sir Fraser said, "Welcome. It's wonderful to be here. This is my ninth visit to Charleston. I first came in 1985, as part of the Tourism Office in Barbados, as there was a desire for someone with an interest in architectural history to come and research the question of whether the single houses of Charleston had actually evolved from the single houses of Barbados. It was an interesting discussion that had taken place for some time and had been talked about a little bit. Since I'd been writing about architectural history, I was invited to come, but I have the most amazing coincidental connection with Charleston. When I moved into my home, and I asked another historian friend if he knew anything about my home, it was the Bonnet's Plantation. It was the birthplace of the famous, sorry, notorious, Pirate Stede Bonnet, who was hung on the 10<sup>th</sup> of December, 1718 at White Point. So, in six months' time, we'll have the tercentenary anniversary of the hanging of the notorious Stede Bonnet, the gentleman pirate of Barbados, who captured some 22 ships off the coastal waters of South Carolina, and who is reputed to have been far too gentle a man to kill people at the point of the sword. He is said to have invented the walking of the plank, but Barbadians brought many things to Charleston, as you know, other than pirates. We think that we influenced the evolution of the single house of Barbados and the term 'single house', is only used by architects in Charleston, nowhere else in the World, but it was first used in a very important historical book in Barbados, published in 1657, so we think that's relevant. There are lots of other things that we think we have brought. One of them was the Gullah, which is a kind of Creole of English and African language. The accent of people speaking Gullah is remarkably similar to Barbados, and I can use just one term. The first book I bought in Charleston was called 'Charleston Receipts', not recipes. 'Receipts' is an archaic word for recipes, which was preserved in Barbados and preserved in Charleston, so there's so much more about the place. What we like to export is the rum, and we hope that through the Barbados Carolina Legacy Foundation, which Rhoda Green and her colleagues have initiated here in Charleston, that we will further this partnership to re-create the tremendous partnership between Barbadians and Charlestonians. When Charleston was half destroyed by fire in 1740, the Barbadians made a Sunday church collection in every church across the Island to raise hundreds of pounds to send to Charleston in 1740. When the same thing happened in the City of Bridgetown in 1766, the Charlestonians did the same and sent us 758 pounds, which today would be about 7 or 17 million pounds. So, that kind of relationship is what we would like to re-build through the Legacy Foundation and we, of course, would like you, Mr. Mayor, to promote the possibility of a direct flight between Barbados and Charleston."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Sir Fraser continued, "When I first came to Charleston, I had to leave home on the seven o'clock American Airways flight, and I landed in Charleston at 11 o'clock at night. Now, it's only two flights instead of three, and we get here at six o'clock, but we'd like that five-hour flight

between Barbados and Charleston, so that you can all come and go at will and enjoy the most famous Barbados product, the Rum Punch of Barbados, because it is Barbados that the rum comes from. Thank you, sir.”

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “I’m just going to say, I’ll drink to that.”

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Waring was excused from the Chamber at 6:40 p.m.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Thank you all. Well, that was delightful. So, next, we’re going to move forward with our Committee on Traffic and Transportation.”

Councilmember Gregorie said, “Move for approval.”

Councilwoman Jackson said, “Second.”

Councilmember Seekings said, “I move for adoption of the report. Next time, we’ll have more of a report on the vendor spaces.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Report on what?”

Councilmember Seekings said, “I said after the next meeting, we’ll have a report on the vendor spaces because they’re going to go out for bid, but other than that, we’re good to go.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Okay.”

On a motion of Councilmember Gregorie, seconded by Councilwoman Jackson, City Council voted unanimously to adopt the Committee on Traffic and Transportation Report, as presented:

---INSERT COMMITTEE ON TRAFFIC AND TRANSPORTATION REPORT---

- a. Traffic Calming Speed Humps for Approval  
- Gadsden Street – Harleston Village Neighborhood (*DENIED*)
- b. Application for Original Certificate of Public Convenience and Necessity:  
- Jones and Son Limo Transportation (Limo)
- c. (Approval of 2018-2019 Vendor Spaces)
- d. (Approval of 2018-2019 Bid Specifications for Street Vendor Spaces)
- e. (Approval of 2018-2019 Franchise Agreement for Vendor Spaces)
- f. Traffic Signal Retiming Report (Presentation)

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Next, our Committee on Ways and Means.”

Councilmember White said, “Motion for adoption of the report.”

Councilmember Griffin said, “Second.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We've got a motion to adopt the report. Is there any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember White, seconded by Councilmember Griffin, City Council voted to adopt the Committee on Ways and Means Report, as presented:

---INSERT COMMITTEE ON WAYS AND MEANS REPORT---

(Bids and Purchases)

(Parks-Capital Projects: Approval of an amendment to PARD (Park and Recreation Development) Grant #2016061. This grant was originally intended for minor parking lot improvements at the Bayview Soccer Complex as a part of larger improvements related to an agreement with adjacent development project. Delays in that project have created an issue with the grant deadline. SCPRT has approved changing the grant scope from parking lot improvements to the acquisition of park furnishings for use at the Bayview Soccer Complex. This grant will provide \$6,038.23 in funding, requiring a \$1,509.56 match (\$7,547.79 total). The grant deadline remains the same. The approval of the amendment to the grant will institute a \$7,547.79 project budget. The funding source for the project is: 2016 PARD Grant Funding (\$6,038.23) and 2018 Recreation Youth Sports, Non-Capital Recreation Equipment (\$1,509.56).

(Parks-Capital Projects: Approval of Louis Waring Jr. Senior Center Fee Amendment #4 to the Professional Services Contract with Liollo Architecture in the amount of \$42,507.20 for an additional 163 days of construction administration due to extensions of substantial completion dates and other delays resulting in approximately three additional months of construction plus closeout. This is formatted at a not-to-exceed in the event the contractor is able to accelerate their schedule and limit the amount of additional construction administration work needed. This approval will result in a budget transfer of \$42,507.20 to the Liollo Architecture Professional Services Contract from the Project Contingency. The total project budget remains unchanged. The total contract time remains increased by 163 days. The approval of Fee Amendment #4 will result in a \$42,507.20 increase to the Liollo Architecture Professional Services Contract from \$666,537 to \$709,044.20. The funding sources for this project are: 2012 General Fund Reserves, 2014 GO Bond, 2013 General Fund Reserves, and Capital Contributions from Roper St. Francis.

(Parks-Capital Projects: Approval of Change Order #5 to the Construction Contract with AOS Specialty Contractors, Inc. in the amount of \$294,194.29 for additional costs associated with the resurfacing of Spring Street and Cannon Street. These costs are a result of the poor condition of the existing roadway and coordination with other infrastructure project, which delayed the execution and required additional efforts and materials. The total project budget will remain unchanged. The contract time will increase by 135 days. Approval of Change Order #5 will increase the Construction Contract with AOS Specialty Contractors, Inc. by \$294,194.29 from \$4,820,401.85 to \$5,114,596.14. The funding sources for this project are: 2000 General Fund Reserves (\$300,000), Gateway TIF (\$5,852,128) and Charleston County (\$500,000).

(Parks-Capital Projects: Approval of a Construction Contract with NBM Construction Company, Inc. in the amount of \$5,669,070 for the construction of a new Fire

Station #11 in West Ashley on Savannah Highway. With the approval of the project budget, Staff is authorized to award and/or amend contracts less than \$40,000, to the extent contingency funds exist in the Council Approved budget. The Construction Contract will obligate \$5,669,070 of the \$9,505,131.64 project budget. The funding sources for this work are Installment Purchase Revenue Bond (\$7,989,524), Proceeds from the Sale of Real Estate (\$1,135,607.64), Surplus Sales (\$1,130.02) and Hospitality Funds (\$380,000).

(Public Service: Approval of Market Street Division III: Collection System and Streetscape Amendment #13 with Davis & Floyd in the amount of \$131,433 for the designs and project management to relocate water and sewer utilities along Market Street that conflict with the new stormwater collection system. The approval of Amendment #13 will result in an increase of \$131,433 to the design contract (from \$4,781,647 to \$4,913,080.) Funding for this is from the 2012 Stormwater Revenue Bond.

(Recreation: Request authority for Mayor to execute a Memorandum of Agreement between the City of Charleston and IMPACT Melanoma to provide sunscreen dispensers at city parks as a pilot project to allow residents and visitors to use sunscreen, at no cost to the City.

(Review and approval of the 2018-2019 Federal Housing and Community Development Budgets

(Approval of 2018-2019 Vendor Spaces

(Approval of 2018-2019 Bid Specifications for Street Vendor Spaces

(Approval of 2018-2019 Franchise Agreement for Vendor Spaces

(Approval of a Facilities Use Agreement with St. Matthew's Lutheran Church for Piccolo Spoleto Festival in the amount of \$350.00 (405 King Street)

(Approval of a Facilities Use Agreement with John Wesley United Methodist Church for Piccolo Spoleto Festival in the amount of \$400.00 (626 Savannah Highway)

**(Councilmember Moody abstained from voting on this item and completed a Conflict of Interest Form, which is on file in the Office of the Clerk of Council.)**

(Request authorization for the Mayor to execute the Commercial Lease with KQC Investors, LLC for use of the property as a Community Resource Day Center to include providing services for people experiencing homelessness. The property is owned by KQC Investors, LLC. (529 Meeting Street; TMS; 459-05-01-011)

(Request authorization for the Mayor to execute a License Agreement with We Are Family to allow them to operate and manage a Community Resource Day Center, which will include services provided to people experiencing homelessness. (529 Meeting Street; TMS: 459-05-01-011) **(DEFERRED)**

(Request approval for the Mayor to execute the Governmental Real Estate Lease for the lease of office space within 22 WestEdge, the new office building being developed as part of the City's and Medical University Foundation's efforts to create the WestEdge District as Charleston's "Discovery District" (a hub for groundbreaking biotechnology research, collaboration and innovation adjacent to MUSC, Citadel, and Burke High School), a district designed to attract and retain jobs and spur continued economic growth]. The property owner is HP1B Devco, LLC. (22 WestEdge Street; TMS: 460-00-00-021) **(Councilmember White voted nay on this item.)**

(Approval to authorize the Mayor to execute the Agreement of Purchase and Sale between the City of Charleston and Jake S. Thomas for the sale of 1904 Doscher Avenue for \$182,000. This property is being sold subject to the HOME Investment Partnerships Program Resale Restrictive Covenants with an

affordability period of 30 years. (1904 Doscher Avenue; TMS: 464-01-00-189)  
[Ordinance]

(An ordinance authorizing the Mayor to execute on behalf of the City an Amendment to the Lease Agreement with Charleston Parks Conservancy pertaining to land being a portion of Hampton Park, located in the City of Charleston, Charleston County, South Carolina, with improvements thereon known as the café, horse barn, paddock, superintendent's house, and parking area, to reduce the liability limits of the umbrella policy required to be maintained by the Charleston Parks Conservancy from \$10,000,000 to \$5,000,000.

(Consider the following annexations:

- 1791 Wilshire Drive (TMS# 352-09-00-035) 0.35 acre, West Ashley (District 9). The property is owned by David Kaufman and Dee Ann Kaufman.
- 2947 Foxhall Road (TMS# 358-10-00-065) 0.31 acre, West Ashley (District 10). The property is owned by Alex L. Wetherell and Jessica Wetherell.
- Property on Central Park Road (TMS# 340-00-00-046) 0.213 acre, James Island (District 6). The property is owned by Marion Green.

First reading was given to the following bills:

*An ordinance authorizing the Mayor to execute on behalf of the City an Agreement of Purchase and Sale, in which the City agrees to sell to Jake S. Thomas the City's property located at 1904 Doscher Avenue (Charleston County TMS No. 464-01-00-189) for \$182,000, subject to the Home Investment Partnership Program Resale Restrictive Covenants, and further authorizing the City to accept a Promissory Note, secured by a Second Priority Mortgage on the property, for \$40,000.00 towards the purchase price.*

*An ordinance authorizing the Mayor to execute on behalf of the City an Amendment to the Lease Agreement with Charleston Parks Conservancy pertaining to land being a portion of Hampton Park, located in the City of Charleston, Charleston County, South Carolina, with improvements thereon known as the café, horse barn, paddock, superintendent's house, and parking area, to reduce the liability limits of the umbrella policy required to be maintained by the Charleston Parks Conservancy from \$10,000,000 to \$5,000,000.*

*An ordinance to provide for the annexation of property known as 1791 Wilshire Drive (0.35 acre) (TMS# 352-09-00-035), West Ashley, Charleston County, to the City of Charleston, shown within the area annexed upon a map attached hereto and make it part of District 9. The property is owned by David Kaufman and Dee Ann Kaufman.*

*An ordinance to provide for the annexation of property known as 2947 Foxhall Road (0.31 acre) (TMS# 358-10-00-065), West Ashley, Charleston County, to the City of Charleston, shown within the area annexed upon a map attached hereto and make it part of District 10. The property is owned by Alex L. Wetherell and Jessica Wetherell.*

*An ordinance to provide for the annexation of property known as property on Central Park Road (0.213 acre) (TMS# 340-00-00-046), James Island, Charleston County, to the City of Charleston, shown within the area annexed upon a map attached hereto and make it part of District 6. The property is owned by Marion Green.*

The vote was not unanimous. Councilmember Moody abstained from voting on Item 12(b) of the report and completed a Conflict of Interest Form which is on file in the Office of the Clerk of Council. Councilmember White voted 'nay' on Item 12(e) of the report.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next, we have bills up for second reading."

The Clerk said, "Yes, Mayor, we have K-1 through K-8."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have K-1 through K-8. Does anybody have any objections to taking them together? I'll be glad to take them, each one at a time."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "So moved."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We've got a motion to take them all together, K-1 through K-8."

The Clerk said, "That was Councilmember Gregorie. Who was the second?"

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Second."

The Clerk said, "Okay. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Is there any discussion on any of those?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Gregorie, eight (8) bill (Items K-1 through K-8) received second reading. They passed second reading on motion by Councilmember Mitchell and third reading on motion of Councilmember Mitchell. On further motion of Councilmember Seekings, the rules were suspended, and the bills were immediately ratified as:

**2018-054** AN ORDINANCE TO PROVIDE FOR THE ANNEXATION OF PROPERTY KNOWN AS 5TH AVENUE AND DIANA STREET (0.115 ACRE) (TMS# 418-05-00-201), WEST ASHLEY, CHARLESTON COUNTY, TO THE CITY OF CHARLESTON, SHOWN WITHIN THE AREA ANNEXED UPON A MAP ATTACHED HERETO AND MAKE IT PART OF DISTRICT 7. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY ATLANTIC MANAGEMENT LLC.

**2018-055** AN ORDINANCE TO PROVIDE FOR THE ANNEXATION OF PROPERTY KNOWN AS 1357 S EDGEWATER DRIVE (0.58 ACRE) (TMS# 349-13-00-017), WEST ASHLEY, CHARLESTON COUNTY, TO THE CITY OF CHARLESTON, SHOWN WITHIN THE AREA ANNEXED UPON A MAP ATTACHED HERETO AND MAKE IT PART OF DISTRICT 11. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY WILLIAM D. WOLF AND MARY W. WOLF.

**2018-056** AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND THE ZONING ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON BY CHANGING THE ZONE MAP, WHICH IS A PART THEREOF, SO THAT 651 MEETING STREET (PENINSULA) (0.61 ACRE) (TMS #463-16-02-061) (COUNCIL DISTRICT 4), BE REZONED FROM GENERAL BUSINESS (GB) CLASSIFICATION TO MIXED-USE/WORKFORCE HOUSING (MU-1/WH)

CLASSIFICATION. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY 651 MEETING STREET PARTNERS LLC.

- 2018-057** AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND THE ZONING ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON BY CHANGING THE ZONE MAP, WHICH IS A PART THEREOF, SO THAT 36 AND 38 LINE STREET AND SHEPPARD STREET RIGHT-OF-WAY (PENINSULA) (APPROXIMATELY 0.64 ACRE) (TMS #459-05-03-105, 459-05-03-106 AND 459-05-03-138 AND UNZONED RIGHT-OF-WAY) (COUNCIL DISTRICT 4), BE REZONED FROM LIGHT INDUSTRIAL AND GENERAL BUSINESS (LI AND GB) CLASSIFICATION TO MIXED-USE AND MIXED-USE/WORKFORCE HOUSING (MU-2 AND MU-2/WH) CLASSIFICATION. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY EAST LINE PARTNERS LLC.
- 2018-058** AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND THE ZONING ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON BY CHANGING THE ZONE MAP, WHICH IS A PART THEREOF, SO THAT PROPERTY LOCATED ON ZELASKO ROAD (JOHNS ISLAND) (1.19 ACRES) (TMS #313-00-00-335) (COUNCIL DISTRICT 5), ANNEXED INTO THE CITY OF CHARLESTON MARCH 26, 2018 (#2018-030), BE ZONED BUSINESS PARK (BP) CLASSIFICATION. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY LARRY MCCUTCHEN.
- 2018-059** AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND CHAPTER 54 OF THE CODE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON (ZONING ORDINANCE) BY CHANGING THE MINIMUM LOT FRONTAGE REQUIREMENTS FOR NEW LOTS IN THE MIXED-USE WORKFORCE HOUSING ZONING DISTRICTS
- 2018-060** AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND ORDINANCES 2007-128 AND 2007-133 (LDL PROPERTIES, LLC EXPANSION MASTER PLAN AND DEVELOPMENT GUIDELINES) BY AMENDING THE LAND DEVELOPMENT GUIDELINES AND ASSOCIATED SITE PLAN FOR PROPERTIES LOCATED ON MAYBANK HIGHWAY AND SAINT JOHNS WOODS PARKWAY (TMS# 279-00-00-202, 279-00-00-203 AND 279-00-00-204).
- 2018-061** AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND THE CODE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON, SOUTH CAROLINA, CHAPTER 21, TO RENUMBER SECTION 21-133 TO 21-134 AND TO ADD A NEW SECTION 21-133 TO PROHIBIT SMOKING IN PUBLIC PARKS.

Councilmember Waring returned to the Chamber at 6:46 p.m.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, I'll be signing these while we begin discussion, if any, on the bills up for first reading. We just have one and maybe someone from Planning would like to give us a little explanation of this bill, which will remove residential uses from Heavy and Light Industrial Zone districts. Mr. Lindsey."

Jacob Lindsey said, "Well, Mayor, you said the bulk of it. The request came to Council to look at the Light Industrial and Heavy Industrial Districts, to limit those districts to exactly those uses and not to enable other uses within them, and that's exactly what's before you. It's a text amendment that simply removes the Residential components from the Light Industrial and Heavy Industrial throughout the City of Charleston."

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Move for approval."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion to approve. Do we have a second?"

Councilmember Shealy said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody followed by Councilmember Griffin and Councilmember Seekings.

Councilmember Moody said, "Yes, Mr. Lindsey, I'm having a little bit of a problem with this. In other words, you take out all of the Residential out of Light Industrial. I think the problem is a little bit different than that. It seems to me like when we have Commercial zonings like General Business, Light Industrial, and some of those things, particularly areas in the City that maybe some Residential is appropriate, and that's why I'm having a little trouble with this, because some of the areas in the City may be up towards Cainhoy, up in that area. There's a lot of business up in there, and maybe with the Light Industrial, we want people to live and work in the same place. My objection to the Residential is that they take a Light Industrial or a General Business, which has that component, and all of a sudden they flip it upside down, and we've got a Residential use rather than a General Business. That's my concern with that. It seems to me like we ought to maybe allow some level of residential, but if you want more, you have to come back and get an exception, and it might be appropriate to do it in that. I've just got a problem with eliminating all of it. I think it might need a little bit more work here to come back and kind of figure out some minimum level and then allow an exception, if you want to do more of it."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Well, I would just respond, Councilmember Moody, by saying that's the reason why we are not bringing you Limited Business and General Business today, because I would agree with you, that we need to reduce the entitlement on Residential for those categories, but still leave some intact and have a bonus for affordable housing, kind of like we do with the Folly Road Overlay District. The feeling was, and what we bring to your discussion tonight, was just on Light and Heavy Industrial. If you use the word 'Industrial', I just don't think of that as being compatible with Residential if it's really Industrial. So, that's the thought, to just bring these to you first, and then to come back to you later with a different kind of tiered approach for General Business and Limited Business."

Councilmember Moody said, "I guess the Heavy Industrial, I kind of see that more than I do the Light Industrial, but maybe I'm not understanding exactly what all may be allowed under Light Industrial. It might be my shortcoming there, but I just feel like we've got to look at all of these a little bit more because I think that if we want people to work and live together, we're going to have to allow some of that."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Right. Exactly. Well, again, I would say that's more for General Business and Limited Business."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Griffin.

Councilmember Griffin said, "I think that we need to give this first reading the way that it is, but in between, for me, I agree with him to a certain extent, that we have to look for some more Mixed-Use stuff. There's definitely areas in Charleston that are zoned Light Industrial right now that could probably be changed to Mixed-Use, so I would like us to look at that. But, you talk about Johns Island, some of the areas on Cainhoy, as well, that they're our last frontier of our City that have a very rural aspect to them. I was driving on Johns Island last week, and you just don't see that kind of landscape really anymore. It's our last frontier of the City of

Charleston, and one thing that was brought up was, 'Well, if we would have done this a few weeks ago or a few months ago, we might not have another apartment complex that's coming there', so I think we're moving in the right direction here. I'd like to give this first reading, but there's certainly areas that we can look for Mixed-Use and, speaking just for myself, the reason why I was so adamant that we needed to vote down that apartment complex a couple weeks ago is because it was zoned Industrial, and they were going to build apartments and nothing else. A Mixed-Use on that site, we could have probably debated and come to a consensus on, but to take a zoning that is Industrial, I'm in warehousing, I understand, to take what could be a warehouse or a business and turn that into an apartment complex, we shouldn't do that anymore."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "And we didn't."

Councilmember Griffin said, "Right."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings followed by Councilmember Wagner.

Councilmember Seekings said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. I have a couple of questions, please. One is, if this gets first reading, does this go to the Planning Commission and then come back to us?"

Mr. Lindsey said, "This will go to Planning Commission and come back to you."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Okay. You said it was a text amendment, so it's going to go to them."

Mr. Lindsey said, "That's correct."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Do you have any idea how many properties this is going to affect?"

Mr. Lindsey said, "There are about 350 Light Industrial and Heavy Industrial properties in the City of Charleston."

Councilmember Seekings said, "You're our Planning Director. Do you see a problem with that? Are we downzoning these people?"

Mr. Lindsey said, "Well, this is the removal of a portion of it, but I do believe that this is appropriate. I do believe that this is something that is fundamentally moving in the right direction. The majority of the Heavy and Light Industrial properties are located in Cainhoy on Johns Island, near the airport, which you are aware of, and The Neck. There are some high value properties, of course, on the Upper King and Upper Meeting areas, but what we've seen, of course, is that the majority of owners who want to build in those very high value areas come in and do seek a rezoning into MU, so I do think it's appropriate."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilwoman Jackson.

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Yes, thank you. I'm glad to hear Councilmember Griffin use the term 'Mixed-Use'. I do think that we are doing the right thing by giving this first reading, and hopefully the Planning Commission will agree with us and recommend it back for a second reading. I just think that, in the way that Charleston is attracting development that is coming from outside of our area, in ways that we hadn't seen ten years ago, we need to make our

zoning accurate and clear. So, 'Industry' is 'Industry', 'Industrial' is 'Industrial'. I do totally agree that we should be re-evaluating our Mixed-Use zones. That's the kind of smarter growth that we're encouraging. I've heard from, I'm sure you all have heard from, the representatives of the growth and development community, that it's really The Neck and the Upper Peninsula that is probably of most concern. Would we not entertain Mixed-Use in a place that's going to be the transition zone between Charleston and North Charleston and the residential communities that we want to preserve there and help to flourish? So, I think this is the right move, but I do think we need to then make the next move to re-evaluate property for Mixed-Use or create a different Mixed-Use zone. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you. Would anyone else like to be heard?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Wagner followed by Councilmember White.

Councilmember Wagner said, "Jacob, how many zoning categories do we have? I think last I looked it was in pages, but--"

Mr. Lindsey said, "I'm going to fail at this pop quiz. I think it's somewhere, Josh Martin is signaling."

Josh Martin said, "Forty-four."

Mr. Lindsey said, "Forty-four. I was going to say it was in the thirties. I will say this, we only regularly use maybe about 10 to 15, in terms of what is constantly being built upon."

Councilmember Wagner said, "I know this is going to be aggravating to you. How many properties do we have in each? Do we have any way of finding out?"

Mr. Lindsey said, "Yes, we do. We can easily find that out, and I can come back to you with those numbers. It's easy to run it."

Councilmember Wagner said, "I'd appreciate that because here we're picking on one with 300, but there are 44 others out there, and we don't even know what they are. Well, we kind of do. I found that page or pages in the Code, but maybe one day we can get them one-on-one, and you can explain them all to me."

Mr. Lindsey said, "I'd be happy to provide that information."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember White followed by Councilmember Mitchell.

Councilmember White said, "I would say, I think directionally making adjustments like this is, over time, the right thing to do. If you've ever taken the time to go through the tables, and not only the City, but the County is the same way, you go through the tables and you can do this, you can do this, you can't do this, it's the exception. It is quite complex and confusing to something that should be, in my mind, fairly easy. Light Industrial, you're going to put something Light Industrial or Heavy Industrial, but I would say that directionally, I agree we're heading in the right direction, making our zoning categories more consistent with what, by definition, they should be. The other thing about this is that we talked, I think, at the last City Council meeting, about Council acting more like City Planners than politicians. One of the components of that is anyone who has a piece of property currently zoned, let's say Light Industrial, who wants to build an apartment complex, has the right to come and ask to be

rezoned. If this body should choose to make that rezoning, because it's appropriate, they end up, ultimately, with exactly what they wanted to do. It just gives us the purview to say, 'Yes, in fact, that's the right thing to do in a place where it should be done.' So, I think directionally we're heading the right way, and I think it sounds like there's a fair amount of work to be done in the rest of our zoning categories, too. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Councilmember Mitchell, were you good?"

Councilmember Mitchell said, "No, I just wanted to mention the only area I probably would have is The Neck area that would fall into this category, right?"

Councilmember Waring said, "No, Cainhoy, Johns Island."

Mr. Lindsey said, "Yes, sir. In your district, that's correct."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Yes, in my district where I represent. So, that's why I'm looking at it carefully because we have with the Magnolia Project that's going to be coming back."

Mr. Lindsey said, "You may have some in the Upper King, Upper Meeting Corridor, as well, that's in your district."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "The Magnolia Project will be coming back with housing in there and then the properties, the lands that were given to us, we're going to build housing there, hopefully. So, that's why I want to make sure that this is not going to interfere with what they're going to do up there, because we already voted for that and planned for that area to have that because that was a trade-off for giving us these properties to be able to build our own affordable housing in the Magnolia Project. So, I want to make sure that that's not going to interfere with what we want to do in that area, if they rezone."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "With the Magnolia?"

Councilmember Mitchell said, "No, not the Magnolia Project, but then we're going to be building housing in that area because the land was given to us by the company, you see. They said they're not going to build any affordable housing in there, so we had them to give us property that we're going to build our own affordable housing, so that's Long Leaf."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, if there's a parcel we need to rezone, we just rezone."

Councilmember Waring said, "Yes."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "But, that's what I'm saying."

Mr. Lindsey said, "I believe that parcel is governed within the Magnolia PUD, although I would have to defer to our Legal Counsel, but I believe that that's all within the Magnolia PUD. It would not be affected."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "But most of the Industrial is on the east side of Meeting Street along the Cooper River side of the Neck, and most of the Ashley River side, all got covered in the PUD, so even though underlying it might have been Industrially zoned at one point, now it's controlled by the PUD, right?"

Mr. Lindsey said, "That's correct."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, it really shouldn't impact any of that area, and if there is a property that we all agree upon, and it's suitable for residential development, we just need to bring forth a request to rezone it. So, it's just mostly a matter of if it looks like a duck, it's a duck, right, if it quacks? If it says 'Industrial', it seems to me that's just a real buzzword, that it ought to be Industrial, zoned Industrial and not Residential."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring said, "I agree with you, Mr. Mayor. One of the problems, if you go from Single-Family to Multi-Family, you have to have a public process and go through the Planning Commission and eventually Council. You go from Multi-Family to General Business, same thing. General Business to Light Industrial, Heavy Industrial, same thing. But, if you come backwards, then you have earned rights, and you don't have the public input. The public wants input and, frankly, we want the public to have input. The example out on Johns Island, with the property near the airport, they basically had a subdivision. That's what the Planning Commission had to approve. The Planning Commission was in the position of basically having to approve something within 60 days, or the City would have gotten sued and probably lost because they had earned rights. Now, that public, Council, the Planning Commission, certainly wished they were in a position of being able to say, 'Yea' or 'Nay' but, frankly, they were in a position of having to say 'Yea'. I served on the Planning Commission, and there were a couple of times, not a whole lot, where we were in that position. It is extremely frustrating when you've got 100 citizens wanting to have a say-so of what's going to come next to them. Here we are on Council. We wanted to have a say-so in that, and we didn't even have a chance. So, this is, in part, going to take, hopefully going to address, part of that because if they want to go from Light Industrial to a 200-unit house subdivision, everybody should have a say-so, the developer, the Planning Commission, the community, and certainly Council. That particular example, the developer was the final arbiter, not the elected representatives, or even the appointed people on the Planning Commission. That's the opalescence in some of our zoning codes that, right now, the development community is taking advantage of. They are ahead of us in that respect, so we're playing a little bit of catch-up, but I think we can catch up. Thank you, Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, sir. Is there any further discussion?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, "Yes, I just wanted to check on the procedure here. If we give this first reading, it's going to go to the Planning Commission, right?"

Mr. Lindsey said, "Yes, sir."

Councilmember Moody said, "So, why are we sending something to the Planning Commission that we may be looking at Light Industrial, to maybe change to Mixed-Use, or to have some component in there? I mean, that would have to go to them also, wouldn't it? I mean, shouldn't we have this thing a little bit more tied-down as to what we want? If everybody is happy today to eliminate, if that's the motion here, is to eliminate all personal or Residential from this thing, I think I would probably vote 'no', but I think if you're going to work it a little bit to try to work in there some kind of a Mixed-Use component or something like that, then I could probably agree with it. I just don't think we ought to send it to the Planning Commission, unless everybody understands what we're doing."

Mr. Lindsey said, "Well, certainly, Council, you all can do what Council wants to do with this, and we'll take it to PC in whatever form. We do intend to bring forward some MU Zoning

districts that are improved and are intended to be used in other parts of the City, just as Councilwoman Jackson and others have said, the Mayor has said, so that's something we will be bringing forward. We don't have it on hand right now, of course. This is just limited to Light Industrial and Heavy Industrial."

Councilmember Moody said, "Yes, and that's what I'm saying. If you're going to do it on the General Business and some of those, we might learn some stuff that we can apply. I think the Heavy Industrial is probably, I'm kind of fine with that, the Light Industrial, I see where there might be a component, some element, or some way of getting residential use in that and maybe that's what Council wants to do with this, 'Okay, you've got to come back, just eliminate it all, and come back and get an exception.' So, I don't know, I just want to be sure that what we send to the Planning Commission is kind of what we think that we're going to do, and we're not going to try to tweak it somewhere."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregorie.

Councilmember Gregorie said, "I'm sure this has come before us if it hadn't gone through the legal scrutiny, but my question still is can we just arbitrarily change the zoning across the board this way on all of these properties that will be affected?"

Chip McQueeney said, "You can't arbitrarily change the zoning, but as long as there is a rational basis for a decision, yes, you can change the zoning. If the basis is that too many Light Industrial or Heavy Industrial properties are being zoned for Residential purposes, as opposed to a city's need for Industrial or more business uses, certainly that's a rational basis for the decision."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "But, if I bought it for that particular zoning because it had all of those features in it, you're saying the City can just come and--"

Mr. McQueeney said, "As long as the property doesn't have a vested right, yes. They would have to take some step in the direction of developing it before that."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Got it. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings.

Councilmember Seekings said, "Zoning isn't a title, zoning is what's written into the Code, and when someone buys a property, they don't look at the title. They look at what they actually have bought and what they're entitled to when they buy it. Zoning is forever, until it's not. We are changing zoning. We're downzoning. We're shooting in the dark. We don't know what properties they are, we don't know where they are, and we don't even know what the future plan for these properties is. Someone is going to wake up tomorrow, after we give this first reading, and realize their property is being rezoned, and in some instances, downzoned. We haven't posted it, we haven't done anything with it, and no map of where these properties are. I really worry about that, and with all due respect to our Legal counsel, we have to have a good and valid reason not just across the board, but for every one of those properties. So, I think it's fine to give this first reading, to let the World know what we're thinking, that we want to make sure that we have good long term planning, but before this goes through the process, we need a map, we need to know what we're downzoning, if it's a downzoning or not, where it is, who we're affecting, and post it. If I owned one of these pieces of property, although I hadn't put in an application with the City, I've been sitting on it because I was waiting for my architect, or I was waiting on a Trust to become eligible, or whatever, and all of a sudden someone banged on

my door and said, 'Well, all of those plans you have are now gone because we didn't like the term Light Industrial, so we took all of the Residential out of it and we downzoned you,' you would be grumpy about that, Mr. Mayor. I would be. We all would be.

So, zoning is a huge subject. I see Mr. Brandenburg sitting here, who is serving on your Johns Island Council. No one in this room, if we blindfolded them and took them to Johns Island and stuck them on that piece of property next to the airport and we said, 'Aha, it's Light Industrial', not a single person would. They would say, 'This is Agricultural or it might be a couple of houses'. So, we've got to really think about this and be careful because this is a lot of property and, as you said, some of those pieces of property in the core of the Peninsula are super valuable pieces of property. So, I applaud the efforts to get long term planning and get it under control, so we don't have a one-off like we had next to the airport on Johns Island, which is an unmitigated problem for all of us. We don't like it, but that person had zoning rights, and we didn't think about it. So, 350-plus properties that, tomorrow, are going to wake up and see that we gave first reading to a downzoning, that's a problem for me. I'll give this first reading, so we can get it in front of the Planning Commission, but we've got to have a map. I want to see a map, with all due respect, as to what this is all about. Anyway, I've spoken my piece. I just think we've got to be really careful in this and any other zoning going forward. Councilmember Griffin sort of looked with amazement, stark amazement. We have 44 zoning categories. He's right. It's ridiculous. When I was campaigning last time, someone said 'I'll vote for you if you can name every single zoning category'. I did not get that vote."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Seekings continued, "None of us would, you can't do it. It's so complicated, right? So, Mr. Mayor, it's not the heading of the zoning that matters. It's what's written below it, and because we call it 'Light Industrial,' we all know, you said, 'A duck was a duck', but here, unfortunately, it's not. Light Industrial includes current entitlements that we are about to change. So, let's proceed cautiously, let's make sure we let people know about this. I think there is an appetite here for this Council to get a handle of the future of development. We've seen some things come underneath our chins that we couldn't do anything about. We didn't like it. We want to be able to do something about it, but we've got to give people notice. We've got to. It's essential. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Points well taken, and this starts the conversation for a deep dive, not only for Light and Heavy Industrial, but what's allowed in General Business, Limited Business, and some of those other 44 categories. We saw it on Bees Ferry Road, with someone wanting to come in with Limited Business and do an entire apartment complex. We saw it on Johns Island with Light Industrial zoning for a Residential neighborhood. So, we've got to clean these things up, and we've got to start somewhere. I thought this was easiest place for us to start, and that doesn't mean it's easy. It just means that maybe it's easier than some of the other categories, but we'll learn some lessons here and continue on. Yes, sir. Alright. So, I'll call for the question."

On a motion of Councilwoman Jackson, seconded by Councilmember Shealy, City Council voted to give first reading to the following bill:

*An ordinance to amend Chapter 54 of the Code of the City of Charleston (Zoning Ordinance) to remove residential uses, nursing and personal care uses, and school uses from the Light Industrial (LI) and Heavy Industrial (HI) zone districts.*

The vote was not unanimous. Councilmembers Gregorie and Moody voted nay.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. So, we did amend the agenda to have a very brief Executive Session to discuss a personnel matter, if I could entertain a motion."

Councilmember Waring said, "So moved."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion, and we will go to my office just so everybody doesn't have to leave and, by the way, folks, we don't intend to take any action when we come back, so this is, in effect, the end of our business. If you want to hang around though, you're welcome to."

On a motion of Councilmember Waring, seconded by Councilmember Gregorie, City Council voted unanimously to go into Executive Session at 7:09 p.m.

On a motion of Councilmember Seekings, seconded by Councilmember Gregorie, City Council voted unanimously to come out of Executive Session at 7:27 p.m.

No action was taken.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:27 p.m.

Vanessa Turner Maybank  
Clerk of Council