

CITY COUNCIL MEETING

Regular Meeting

February 9, 2022

The one hundred seventeenth meeting of the City Council of Charleston was held this date convening at 5:00 p.m. at City Hall and over video conference call (Zoom).

A notice of this meeting and an agenda were made available on the City's website February 3, 2022 and appeared in the Post and Courier on February 7, 2022.

PRESENT (13)

The Honorable John J. Tecklenburg, Mayor

Councilmember Gregg	District 1	Councilmember Waring	District 7
Councilmember Shealy	District 2	Councilmember Seekings	District 8
Councilmember Sakran	District 3	Councilmember Shahid	District 9
Councilmember Mitchell	District 4	Councilmember Bowden	District 10
Councilmember Brady	District 5	Councilmember Appel	District 11
Councilmember Gregorie	District 6	Councilmember Parker	District 12

Mayor Tecklenburg called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m.

The Clerk called the roll.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "And, now, if you would like to join us, Councilmember Gregorie will lead us in a [prayer and the Pledge of Allegiance.](#)"

Councilmember Gregorie said, "A colleague of mine left on all of our desks a prayer. I think this prayer is very fitting for this Council, and it goes as follows."

Councilmember Gregorie opened the meeting with an invocation.

Councilmember Gregorie then led City Council in the [Pledge of Allegiance.](#)

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Thank you very much. I do want to announce, I think everybody knows this, but just in case, in the very unlikely event that we would have to vacate the building, we've just got these two doors from the main Council Chambers here, and there is one door from the room to my right. If that were to occur, please don't use the elevator but use the steps. There are two steps going down and then only the one exit out to the front, and that's how to get out if we need to.

Next, I would like to recognize our brave firefighters and first responders who responded to just an incredible fire Monday morning at the [Palms Apartments](#), West Ashley. I consider it a miracle of God that no one was injured or killed. I was over there, Councilmember Shahid was, and the fire was incredible, so it's miraculous that no one was hurt, and a tribute to our firefighters. They're there every day, you all, to protect us, every day. You don't think about them except when you need them, maybe, but they're there 24/7, 365 days a year. And the

cooperation, by the way, we have these agreements with the neighboring jurisdictions. So, like in no time, not just Charleston Fire Department, but St. Andrews Fire Department, North Charleston Fire Department, Charleston County Emergency Medical Services, EMS, they all converge, they all, it's like team work, you wouldn't believe, and now the team work is for our community to help those that were displaced by this fire.

So, think about this, 5:30 in the morning, police officers and firefighters were knocking on doors, getting people out of their apartments as quick as they can. So, people woke up, they had their pajamas on, they may have thrown on a coat, and they went out, and everything, all of their belongings were burned, obliterated in the fire, in 56 units. Those people and families had all of their belongings taken away. Now, there has been an outpouring already in our community that I'm thankful for. The Red Cross is coordinating, many houses of faith have stepped forward, and other community organizations. I was out there this afternoon. They had to bring in some of those portable rental units just to hold all of the donations that are coming in. Very thankful for that. We've got to keep it up because it's one thing in the first few days, and then maybe they get another apartment, they've got to stay in a hotel for a while. But think about it, like I said, these folks had everything wiped out, and we want to follow them for the next few months and really help them get re-situated wherever they get moved to, and I think it's going to take a real community effort. There are two places that, if you're not giving clothes or some non-perishable items, that you can donate. One would be the www.redcross.org, and the other would be our own Homeless to Hope Fund that's managed by the Palmetto Project, so it's all charitable donations. All of the funds would go straight to the recipients, to those who have been impacted, so I did want to mention that, and thank everybody who has stepped up to the plate."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shahid.

Councilmember Shahid said, "If I may, Mayor, thank you. I just wanted to echo the comments that you made about that Monday morning fire. One of the most harrowing things is to wake up to a text message from Chief Curia about something that is catastrophic happening in literally my backyard. I shared this with Councilmember Waring while you and I were out there, and we met with several of the residents and you alluded to this, but most of the folks who lived in the Palms Apartments, these were not transitional residents. They had lived in these apartments for a number of years. You and I talked to this one elderly man who I think had been in there since the 1970s, and just looking in these folks' eyes as they were watching their earthly belongings literally go up in flames and the look of hopelessness. That's something that will haunt me for a while, and we're all helpless at that point. I mean, we're helpless as to what we can do for them, as to how we can help them re-group from this, because your home is your castle. It's a place where you can take off your suit, take off your shoes, sit down, relax, and rejuvenate yourself, and if you don't have your home, and if it's an apartment or it's a house that you had, if you don't have that, that is the essence of life. We've seen the pictures of tornadoes coming through, when storms are coming through, and it's distant to us, but when you see it alive and in person, it really is just something that we need to reconcile ourselves with. I do want to give a huge shout-out for our first responders. Being out there, watching these brave men and women, it was raining, and it was cold. The heat was so intense, even though I was several hundred yards away from it, I was warmed by the intensity of the heat, but these men and women were out there in full gear fighting that fire. They were on the rooftop creating a, I forgot the term that they used, but to somehow sort of stop the fire, and I watched them do that standing on that roof. It's a slick roof with the equipment they were using, and it worked. It was just like, all of a sudden the fire stopped because of that. So, our hats off to those brave men and women who responded, and what you mentioned, Mr. Mayor, about the full cooperation from the other responding neighborhoods, St. Andrews Public Service District, North Charleston,

EMS, American Red Cross, their volunteer rescue squad, and then just our citizens who come together. It's just sort of interesting how in a time of a crisis, it's a unifying force, so I just want to echo your comments, Mayor. Thank you. You and I were out there going grocery shopping later that morning just to get some juice and donuts to these folks because, as you said, they woke up and all of sudden it was 9:00 a.m., and they hadn't had anything to eat or drink. So, I appreciate all of your efforts and what you have done and being out there and responding, as well."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, the Publix near Peter's house or the Harris Teeter at Hwy. 7 and Hwy. 61, thank them. I drove over there, and they crammed my car full of stuff, but anyway, thank you Harris Teeter and Publix. Everybody has been pitching in.

So, next I'd like to recognize our newest [Councilmember, Boyd Gregg](#). He is the victor of a special election that we had in District #1, mostly over on Daniel Island, but also a part of the Peninsula. Normally, we would have him sworn in now at a Council meeting, but since we had some committee meetings and a meeting of Council yesterday, we swore him in just this past Friday. So, he is a bonafide City Council member, and I'd like to call Councilmember Gregg to come forward and share a few words with us. Councilmember."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Councilmember Gregg said, "First, I would just like to thank the citizens of District #1 for trusting me. We had a great turnout in our election. I'm very proud of the message of our campaign and I think the folks in District #1 showed up to endorse that message. I would also like to thank all of those folks that helped me, if you are watching. There are too many to name, but I am honored and overwhelmed that they gave of their time, talent, and treasure to help me. I would also like to acknowledge former Councilwoman Marie Delcioppo. She served this district well and certainly set a high standard for me to uphold, but also I would like to thank my family, three of whom are sitting over there, in particular, my wife and children. They went door-to-door during the Christmas season, not probably on their list of favorite things to do, but they did it enthusiastically, and they love me, so I would like to just acknowledge all of their effort and support to me."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Gregg continued, "One of the great privileges of this entire experience has been getting to cross paths with people I never would have crossed paths with. Certainly, the 11 of my new fellow Councilmembers and colleagues, and you, Mr. Mayor, so I would just say that I know we're not going to agree on everything, but I do promise to listen, and I hope that I'll be able to call you all friends, and I hope you would consider me a friend. Lastly, I would just say, hold me accountable, to everybody in District #1 and in the City. I'm honored to serve this City that we all love with you. Lastly, a prayer for my life, it comes from Micah 6:8, 'what does the Lord your God ask of you but to do justice, love mercy, and walk humbly,' and it's a good message for us here in this Chamber, but thank you very much."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, and finally as a recognition, this just occurred, the loss of one of our community members who served our community well, so it's not on the agenda, but I would like to recognize, by way of this resolution, [Dr. David Rivers](#), who, unfortunately, somewhat unexpectedly, passed about a week ago. His funeral is tomorrow in

Atlanta, where much of his family was from. Dr. Rivers, as I'll mention in the resolution, served on the Charleston Water System Board for the last 10 or 12 years, or maybe a little more, and I'll mention here, it's kind of remarkable. He is the first African American that was ever elected to Citywide office in the City of Charleston. Dr. Rivers holds that distinction."

Mayor Tecklenburg read the resolution.

---INSERT RESOLUTION---

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "The family members could not be with us this evening as they are in Atlanta for the funeral services tomorrow, but he was a fine gentleman, a very wise man. He contributed a lot to this community. I'm going to call on Councilmember Waring, if you would like to add any remarks."

Councilmember Waring said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. Anybody who had the pleasure to serve with Dr. Rivers is better as a result of having done so. Dr. Rivers came to a meeting with uncanny wisdom and knowledge. You actually, I would say using an accounting term, it's accretive, you left better, or you picked up information as a result. I never had a cross conversation in a negative way with him. It was always one person spoke at a time and the personality and the goodness that he brought and the difference that he has made to this community, in particular, in diversity over at Medical University. His connections, from local grassroots all the way to Washington, D.C., made an immeasurable difference. Personalities and individuals like Dr. Rivers you just don't replace. You thank God that they came your way. Off and on all weekend, the loss of Dr. Rivers has just been visiting me and re-visiting me, and I just hope and pray that we all realize the gift that God gave us, because it didn't have to be. Those people don't have to grace your community, but by the grace of God he came, so I wanted to say thank you. Thank you for your words, thank you for the resolution, and our prayers to their family. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "God bless."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregorie.

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Thank you, Mayor. Dr. Rivers and I go way back to my beginnings at HUD, and through that experience I really learned a lot, and Dr. Rivers and I became very, very close friends. His political instinct; unbelievable. There is so much that he brought to our City that most people will never know, but the one thing that he helped with was Ashley Tower, and that was \$400 million coming to the Medical University to develop that. David was also the kind of person, 'okay, we've got the \$400 million, how are we going to be able to service the disadvantaged, the minority and women businesses, how can they get a piece of this?' We have several meetings in that regard, and I do think that the Medical University did a pretty good job in terms of making sure that there was that kind of participation. But, that just describes the kind of person David is, and like my colleague, since I heard of his death, it just can't leave me, for some reason. It's just, it's constant, and it's making me understand that when our work here is done, it's done, and I will forever be thankful and grateful for his friendship. I know that he will continue to live through all of the people that he touched throughout his life, and I would be remiss if I didn't recognize my friend, who I loved very much, who was very dear to me, and I learned a side of him that most people probably have never experienced, because when he's ready, he puts you in your place fairly quickly. So, again, Mayor, thank you for the resolution, and the opportunity to speak on his behalf."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Councilmember Waring and I had the honor and pleasure to serve with him on the Charleston Water System Board, and I knew him mostly through that connection. He was a remarkable man, he really was. So, thank you all for that. Next up is our [approval of City Council minutes](#) from both January 11th and the 25th."

The Clerk said, "Just the 11th."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Just the 11th. I'm sorry."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "So moved."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Any changes, additions, or deletions?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Mitchell, seconded by Councilmember Gregorie, City Council voted unanimously to approve the minutes from the January 11, 2022 City Council meeting.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next up we're already at our [Citizens Participation Period](#). Thank you all for coming out and sharing with us. I spoke with Councilmember Waring about this just before the meeting because I thought we had a bigger number, we have 42 people total, here and online. We have a new policy to limit to 30 folks, so I leave it to Council as to whether you all are willing to extend the extra 12 minutes to let everybody be heard. I think it would be reasonable."

Councilmember Brady said, "I would move to suspend the rules to allow for each person to have one minute for public comment."

Councilmember Appel said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "If it were 60, 70, or 80, yes. It's 42, yes."

On a motion of Councilmember Brady, seconded by Councilmember Appel, City Council voted unanimously to extend the Citizens Participation Period.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Madam Clerk will call your name. When you come to the microphone, please clearly give us your name and address, and I'm afraid we can only limit it to one minute each given the number of folks that have come out tonight, but thank you for sharing with us. Madam Clerk."

The Clerk said, "We will start with the in-person speakers first and per the new rules, citizens who provided City of Charleston addresses will be speaking first. Anthony Bryant."

1. Anthony G. Bryant said they definitely wanted to end no-knock warrants throughout the Country after what had happened in Minnesota at the U.S. Mayors' Conference in terms of promoting the serious draconian policies that affected, by and large, Black folks like him. He said he wasn't married and didn't have any children. He said it was Baltimore's ICE at the U.S. Marshal's Office 703, and he was going to register

a FOIA request for it. He requested from Fresno, California in the Criminal Division of the IRS the Inspector General report for no-knock warrants in their community and throughout the Country. He issued another one to the BCDCOG. He lived in and was born and raised in the City of Charleston so the documents would go to them. He wanted to get a performance audit on all of them, and all of their practices.

The Clerk said, "Time. Councilwoman Jackson."

2. Former Councilwoman Jackson said she was there to thank Council in advance for voting 'yes' to adopt the third reading of the ordinance that would create the Human Affairs and Racial Commission along with the Amendment (a) section. She said the Commission did not come naturally, and she knew they had worked hard to come up with the foundation of the work that she knew had always been in the hearts of those of them who wanted the Commission to see its success from the beginning.

The Clerk said, "Time. Nathan Gates."

3. Nathan Gates said he was a City employee in the Fire Department, and some of his fellow firefighters were there, as well. He said in their own community, as well as around the Country, showed the need for a professional, well-trained, and experienced Fire Department. He said they had 45 vacancies in the Fire Department, and they had six leave since January 1st. He said they were trying to remedy that by bringing their entry-level wage from \$12.88 an hour upward. He asked of Council for them to get the additional 3.2%, so they were up with their non-sworn peers who had gotten the 7.7%, as they worked together to further their entry-level pay and re-do their pay plan as a whole.

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg called for order.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Just for future reference, we ask you to refrain from applause and outbursts during Public Participation. It is in our stated rules, as well. So, thank you very much. Appreciate you all being here."

The Clerk said, "Brett Barry."

4. Brett Barry said out of the 357 online comments posted to the City's website, roughly 75% were in favor of Caroline Parker's amendments to the Commission. He said if they added comments opposing the Commission outright, it was 83%. He saw that as a win-win. He said either Council put effective guardrails on the Commission, which was a win for moderates, or they passed largely meaningless amendments which would continue to allow the Commission to spew radical recommendations into the 2023 election cycle. He said the fake critical race theory amendment proposed under L-1(a) would not do, as it only banned the Commission from using the term, and it allowed it to continue to intertwine the racist ideology into its recommendation. He said the CRT amendment under L-1(a) was only there for political cover, but did nothing.

The Clerk said, "Scott Shor."

5. Scott Shor, Managing Partner of the Edmond's Oast Group, said he employed roughly 130 people in the City. He expressed his support and that of many of his colleagues in the restaurant, brewery, and retail communities in Charleston for the Human Affairs Commission. He said they requested that it be passed without amendment. He said that sadly, that seemed to be unlikely, but they stood in full support, and the community that fed everyone stood in full support of it all over town. He said they asked Council to consider it.

The Clerk said, "Renie Forsberg."

6. Renie Forsberg said in August of 2021 the final report of the previous Racial Conciliation Committee was rejected by Council, and the Commission was terminated. She said in response to overwhelming public requests for clarification, Council wisely deferred the vote on the newly named Commission in order to revise and ensure that the terminology clearly reflected the intentions of the newly amended policy. She said Council had repeatedly and publicly stated that it rejected critical race theory, monument removal, reparations, and re-direction of police funds along with other radical recommendations. She said in support of Council's stated position, they strongly urged Council to vote for Councilmember Parker's amendments, which clarified the content of the new report and stated what Council proposed to achieve. She said Charlestonians were willing to work together, looking forward, and growing as a community.

The Clerk said, "Time. George Tempel."

7. George Tempel said he had petitioned to be in the City along with two other properties he was affiliated with. He supported the Commission and asked Council to reject any of the amendments in 1(b) and to vote for it in its current form.

The Clerk said, "Marcus McDonald."

8. Marcus McDonald, Charleston Black Lives Matter leader, said in the words of Martin Luther King, he was tired of marching for something that should have been his at birth. He was joined by over 70 businesses around the City that supported the Human Relations and Racial Conciliation Commission without further amendment. He said the Commission began as a strong reflection of the needs of the community. He said now that outside influences had spent thousands of dollars spreading misinformation, he wanted to know who was being prioritized, Brett Barry and the feelings of the White conservative groups who also tended to march at The Battery with the Confederates? He asked who was being prioritized and how much they should compromise with those groups. He said that in the 1800s, there were parts of the Bible addressing racism that talked about Exodus and freedom. He said history was repeating itself as they eliminated parts of their document.

The Clerk said, "Time. The last name is Simone. Mr. or Mrs. Simone."

No one asked to speak.

The Clerk said, "Jessica Wright."

9. Jessica Wright said she was in strong support of the Commission on Human Affairs and Racial Conciliation without the restrictive amendments. She congratulated Councilmember Gregg on his victory and said he was her representative. She recognized that he represented a lot of rich white people on Daniel Island, but she really wanted him to take to heart when he spoke that night about crossing paths with people from different backgrounds, and to listen to BIPOC community members who asked for the Commission without amendment. She said it was a chance for the City to actively be anti-racist, and she urged all of the Councilmembers to vote in favor of the Commission without restrictive amendments.

The Clerk said, "Belvin Olasov."

10. Belvin Olasov said he supported the Commission, and he voiced blanket opposition to any amendments that would restrict or limit the terms and topics of the Commission to discuss. He asked if the Commission would bury a study that said that repairing homes of underserved communities did more to reduce crime than increasing the police budget year-to-year. He said Councilmember Parker's definition of critical race theory was a belief in systemic institutional racism. He said Black Charlestonians earned 60% less than their White counterparts, and 42% of Black children lived below the poverty line. He said if that wasn't systemic racism, then he would have really liked to know what kind of racism that was. He said Charleston was the former keystone of the transatlantic slave trade and a current poster child for gentrification and Black and Brown displacement. He told Council to take their responsibility to change the status quo seriously. He asked Council to pass the Commission, not to pass reactionary amendments that would preemptively censure it, and to show those recommendations more respect in the future than they had thus far.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, sir."

The Clerk said, "Catherine Dallamura."

11. Catherine Dallamura said she supported all of the amendments that Councilmember Parker had put forward. She said Council had the leadership ability to make Charleston the best city it could possibly be, and they couldn't do that by dividing the community and taking away the rights of some people and giving it to others. She said everybody was equal, and Council needed to get rid of the Marxist, racist CRT, the 1619 policy, and they needed to take care of the police by giving them the money they needed to not only take care of citizens, which they did on a daily basis, but also to take care of themselves. She understood that some of them paid for their own equipment. She said Council needed to worry about the infrastructure of the City and the safety of all people.

The Clerk said, "Time. Sandy Morckel."

12. Sandy Morckel said she represented the Social Justice Racial Equity Collaborative which was a group of 40 concerned citizens and 30 different engagement partners who were all engaged in different, varying aspects of helping the community to better include the YWCA Racial Equity Institute, which she encouraged Council to go through if they hadn't yet. She said they had identified the gap pieces missing, and they brought in racial healing circles, which she hoped Council would participate

in. She wanted to be there in full support of the passage of the Commission. She knew that a lot of work went into the amendments put forward by Councilmember Shahid, and she encouraged passage of them so they could get to work. She said they looked forward to being a very vested partner in helping the community become better for all citizens.

The Clerk said, "We'll move on to our online list. Jerome Harris. If you're on the line, if you could press *6."

13. Jerome Harris said the vote Council took that night was on the ninth day of Black History Month, and what happened that night would be documented. What they said and what they did, but more importantly, what happened going forward was important. He said the passage of the ordinance with the amendments as suggested in 1(a), while not perfect, was better than what was proposed in 1(b). He said 1(b) would silence people, demote, and censure unnecessarily voices that didn't understand there was a consistent interaction in the relationship between African American experiences and White experiences. He said the City could be made better, that they had work to do, and that education was necessary. He brought copies of the Board of Education's Black History calendar to give to each Councilmember to begin their education, if they were not aware of it. He hoped they could all work together and move forward.

The Clerk said, "Time. Steffani Schwerdt."

14. Steffani Schwerdt said she was in District #3, a 5th generation Charlestonian, and she supported forming the Racial Conciliation Commission within its original form. She thought Councilmembers and groups within the community fought to keep the Commission alive, but it still became increasingly clear that the goal of certain Councilmembers was to add restrictive amendments to water down and eventually dissolve the committee. She said the fact that they had to fight to form a Commission on racial equity in Charleston showed how much work they needed to do to move forward, and it also indicated where certain Councilmembers stood when it came to uplifting the community and upholding the very duties they were elected on. She said it was disappointing that certain Councilmembers let campaign politics and propaganda cloud their vision for the City.

The Clerk said, "Time. Judy Dixon."

15. Judy Dixon said she fully supported the Human Affairs and Racial Conciliation Commission and urged the Council to vote in favor without restrictive amendments. She said the establishment of a permanent Commission would allow the City to continue working towards advancing racial equity and justice. She said as a White woman, she recognized that her lived experience had been very different than that of her Black or Brown peers and fellow citizens of Charleston, from opportunities in housing and education to professional mentoring, and getting the benefit of the doubt. She didn't deserve those opportunities any more than her Black or Brown colleagues and said that the current system was not equitable. She said the data showed that, and their fellow citizens told them that through their experiences. She asked Council to please vote 'yes' to establishing the Commission without restrictive amendments.

The Clerk said, "Charles Stephens."

16. Charles Stephens said he was in Councilmember Gregorie's district, and he wanted to clarify the record. He said at the last meeting Councilmember Gregorie said that he had received no pushback from any of his constituents on the Commission. He said he had spoken at two prior meetings about it, and his neighbors outright opposed the Commission, as well, but since there would be a vote on it that night, they asked for the Council to strongly support Councilmember Parker's amendments because they thought Councilmember Shahid's amendments didn't go far enough. He said they didn't believe from what they heard last time that most of Council would agree with the content of Councilmember Parker's amendments, so they asked for Council's support for her amendments.

The Clerk said, "Heyward Hamilton."

17. Heyward Hamilton said he lived in downtown Charleston, and he strongly supported all of Councilmember Parker's amendments establishing the Racial Conciliation Commission that she put forward. He asked Council to not vote for amendment L-1(a), number 5, which did not place a ban on critical race theory for the Commission. He said the vague language would only ban the Commission from using the words 'critical race theory' in their recommendations. He said the amendment allowed the Commission to intertwine racist ideology into their recommendations as they did in the previous report. He said they could not ban critical race theory just as a term without defining it. He said the only amendments that truly banned CRT were Councilmember Parker's amendments 2 and 3. He asked Council to please pass Councilmember Parker's amendments in full.

The Clerk said, "Joshua Infinger."

No one asked to speak.

The Clerk said, "Frank Hardie."

18. Frank Hardie said he lived in District #1 downtown, and he thanked Council for ordering the audit of the Police Department for racial bias and for reading the report. He thanked Council for setting up the CEIRC Committee and reading their report. He thanked Council for proposing the HARCC, as he supported it. He did not support the proposed amendments in appendix 1(b), and he asked Council to please vote against them.

The Clerk said, "Sarah Fitzellen."

19. Sarah Fitzellen said she was a member of CAJM, and she supported establishing the Commission. She said it was noteworthy that those who had stood in favor of the Commission over the past several weeks were both young and old, both rich and poor, both Black and White, and both religious and not. She said those folks represented the City's diversity, the community, and its future. She said those who had voiced their opposition mostly seemed to be older White people which were the decreasing segment of the community. She asked Council to finally vote to establish the Commission without restrictive amendments to prove Charleston was really the

Holy City morally committed to doing the right thing, actively ensuring justice and equity for all of them, and righting the racial wrongs of the past and present. She said she felt uncomfortable speaking while there was a Councilmember without their mask on, and said she wondered why that was.

The Clerk said, "Ben Cash."

20. Ben Cash said he was a downtown resident and business owner. He used to think that his team of employees weren't overly diverse because the Council wasn't, and that was lazy and ignorant on his part. He said once he put in the time and effort to educate himself, expand his privileged circles, and changed his hiring practices, he realized he was wrong. He said he was a participant in systemic racism, and the fact that people were weighing feedback from a small vocal minority who had concerns about their kids learning history over the historical and documented disadvantages and discrimination of a large part of the community was also systemic racism. He said everyone believed they weren't racist, and it was not enough to be 'not racist.' He said they had to be anti-racist. He was a White privileged business owner and literally the last person who should be explaining racism, but what he did know about was leadership. He said leadership was about walking the talk. He asked how they could expect their citizens to make anti-racist choices if their City leaders didn't. He urged Council to pass the Commission without the amendments.

The Clerk said, "Christine Jennings."

No one asked to speak.

The Clerk said, "Matt Cressler."

21. Matt Cressler said he was a father of two daughters at Memminger Elementary and a member of the Unitarian Church in Charleston. He implored Council to vote 'yes' to establish the Human Affairs and Racial Conciliation Commission and not to defer and not to add the restrictive amendments proposed in L-1(b) which would prevent the Commission from doing necessary work. He said it was 2022, and the City was still defined by racial disparities. He said that was not a radical statement and not CRT, but it was fact. He said it was the God's honest truth, which Council knew, because it created a Special Commission to study the subject. He said it was time to do right by their community. He thanked in advance all of the Councilmembers who were voting 'yes' to establish the HARCC and to please not vote in favor of L-1(b).

The Clerk said, "Suzanne Hardie."

No one asked to speak.

The Clerk said, "Dr. Bobby Baker."

22. Dr. Bobby Baker said he spent the last few weeks discussing with certain Councilmembers the whole issue of the Commission, and it was clear that the report that came out in August was what stimulated a lot of the concern and discussion among everyone. He said it was clear that most people, including Councilmembers, believed that many of the recommendations were not ever going to make it to policy because they didn't meet the standards to become policy. He thought it was really

important for them to make sure that all of those were clarified and the confusion was eliminated, and for that reason, he supported Caroline Parker's amendments.

The Clerk said, "Time. Naomi Matthews."

Suzanne Hardie said, "This is Suzanne Hardie. Can you hear me now?"

The Clerk said, "Yes."

Suzanne Hardie said, "Can I speak or do you want to call on me again because the *6 didn't work?"

The Clerk said, "Yes."

23. Suzanne Hardie said the months' long effort to squash the Commission and to water it down to minimize its impact on reducing systemic racism was disappointing and disturbing. She asked what they were afraid of. She said they in Charleston saw every day how a rising tide floated all boats, and it was time to roll up their sleeves and start working together in a way that made all of them in the City rise up and raise the tide of opportunity for all of them. She asked Council to vote to establish the Commission and strike down the 1(b) amendments, which were clearly designed to thwart the Commission's impact.

The Clerk said, "Naomi Matthews."

24. Naomi Matthews said that as an immigrant and a great-granddaughter of a slave, she approved of Caroline Parker's amendments. Caroline was compassionate, sensible, wise, and rational. Caroline cared about all of the residents of Charleston, and she put the welfare and well-being of the people over any political agenda. She told Council to accept her amendments.

The Clerk said, "Allyson Sutton."

25. Allyson Sutton said she was a downtown resident and business owner calling in support of the Human Affairs Commission. She said that, as members of Council knew, over 70 businesses across nearly every sector of Charleston's economy co-signed a letter in support of the Commission without restrictive amendments. She said the letter had since been shared by over 600 diverse community members who also supported the Commission. She said that in the past, Council had delayed the process by saying they were taking time to listen to what their constituents wanted. She said the letter should have made it clear that the community wanted the Commission to happen without amendments that would hinder its effectiveness. She said they urged Council to heed their call and pass it.

The Clerk said, "Renee Brockington."

26. Renee Brockington said that as more people learned about the Commission, the more opposition grew. She said roughly 75% of comments on the City website were in favor of Caroline Parker's amendments and less than 1% supported Councilmember Shahid's amendments, which was likely due to the fact that they included a fake CRT ban. She said first Council tried to ram it through four days

before Christmas, and now there was a fake CRT ban. She told Council to do what they were elected to do.

The Clerk said, "Elizabeth Saad."

27. Elizabeth Saad said she lived downtown, and she strongly supported Councilmember Parker's amendments to the Human Affairs and Racial Conciliation Commission. She said Councilmember Parker's amendments were the only amendments that clearly included a definition of critical race theory, unlike Councilmember Shahid's amendments, which neither defined nor banned the racially explosive CRT ideology. She said Councilmember Parker's amendments were also the only amendments that halted future monument removals and re-direction of funding away from the police. She said Councilmember Parker's amendments de-politicized the Commission and encouraged positive dialogue towards the goal of equal opportunity for all Charleston residents.

The Clerk said, "Ann Birdseye."

28. Ann Birdseye said she supported the HARCC and asked Council to vote to establish the Commission without amendments L-1(b). She said if Council included those amendments, they were actually voting against the spirit of reconciliation and progress that was so important to the future of the City. She urged Council to vote for the Commission without Councilmember Parker's amendments.

The Clerk said, "Ashley Smith."

29. Ashley Smith said she fully supported the Human Affairs and Racial Conciliation Commission, and she urged Council to establish it without any restrictive amendments. She said that when they all heard the words equity, inclusion, and accountability, they got scared. She asked what they got scared for. She said they had residents who had continued to show up and voice their support, plus 60+ businesses that signed an open letter showing their support for the Commission. But, by ignoring their residents, deferring, or voting 'no', Council was adhering to and supporting White supremacy and systemic racism. She addressed Councilmember Parker and said she had been a kindergarten teacher for the last two years, and her five- and six-year olds had no problem wearing their masks, required or not, because they were more empathetic and understanding of the pandemic. She said if they could wear a mask without complaining for eight hours a day, so could Councilmember Parker. She thanked Council and said to vote 'yes' for the Commission without amendments.

The Clerk said, "Michael O'Neill."

30. Michael O'Neill said that on behalf of the Coalition for Racial Harmony, he again submitted their petition with over 1,560 signatures from diverse Black, Brown, and White citizens of the City. He now supported it with a second supplementary petition with 600 signatures in support of Councilmember Parker's amendments. He said citizens wanted to ensure guardrails were adequately placed to prevent CRT tenants and ideology being advanced through recommendations of a biased or rigged Special Commission. He said Councilmember Parker's amendments provided precise language to eliminate ambiguity and outlined selection

mechanisms that safeguarded the Commission from going off the rails. He asked Council to unite Charleston with good governance, common sense, and compromise to end the divisiveness in their great City.

The Clerk said, "Carlo Milan."

31. Carlo Milan said he fully supported the creation of the HARCC without any restrictive amendments. He believed it wasn't a matter of whether they agreed with the Commission's agenda or not, but it was a matter of accepting or denying the truth. He was only 24, but part of becoming an adult and a better person meant to honor the truth whether he liked it or not. He came to learn that the only way to correct something they weren't proud of was to not feel guilt or to take it personally. He said they weren't a product of their past, they were a product of how they reacted to it. He made that point regarding opposition to the creation of the Commission. He said in the end the truth would always prevail, inequality would still exist and be very real for many Black people in the Country, regardless of the outcome. He said if it wasn't created that night, the necessity for it wouldn't go away.

The Clerk said, "Time. William Hecht."

32. Bill Hecht complimented Council for what they had done in the last two weeks. He had firsthand experience in the negotiations to be able to get to a place where amendments would hopefully be acceptable by a bipartisan group of people that worked diligently for nearly a full day to get there. He asked if it was perfect and said it wasn't. He asked if it was a lot better than what it was originally and said it was. He encouraged and complimented Council for the work they did. He said it was a spirited debate and asked that if they approved the amendments, that they appoint Commission members who were non-biased, that had the best interest of Charleston at heart, and produced really good recommendations.

The Clerk said, "James Yanney."

No one asked to speak.

The Clerk said, "Megan Grasmick."

33. Megan Grasmick said that in an interview with Live 5 two weeks ago, Caroline Parker spoke about being asked to leave Chambers when she refused to comply with the mask requirement, and she stated, 'it was already an uncomfortable situation, so why am I going to do something that makes me more uncomfortable?' She said as a member of the City's disabled community, some things made her and other marginalized groups feel uncomfortable. She said ableist Councilmembers who viewed mask mandates as tyrannical measures, despite evidence showing how marginalized groups benefited from those protections like herself. She said there were Councilmembers who interrupted updates on the City's COVID response with QAnon rhetoric, three Councilmembers who chose to illegally operate a vehicle because reasonable accommodations offered weren't satisfactory, Councilmembers wasted their tax dollars on plexiglass thrones, Councilmembers who continued to exploit Black labor and refused to pass the HARCC without amendments, and Councilmembers who aligned themselves with Proud Boys insurrectionists and other White National groups.

The Clerk said, "Time. Roman Hammes."

34. Roman Hammes asked Council to vote against the Human Affairs Commission. He had read the entire report twice, as well as the proposed amendments. He said Council Chambers were adorned with irreplaceable works of art depicting figures that were important in history. He said if the Commission was adopted, it would gut the art surrounding them in the Council Chambers over time. He said that was just one example. He said if they opened the door to the radical left, they would never stop demanding, would never be satisfied, and would turn the City on its head. He said the best choice was to shut the door on them immediately. He asked Council to vote in favor of historical preservation and vote 'no' to the Commission. He said he owned five businesses, and he was young, not old. He said if they needed to vote in favor of something, he asked that Council at least adopt the reasonable Councilmember Parker amendments.

The Clerk said, "Hillary Hutchinson."

35. Hillary Hutchinson said she worshipped downtown at the Unitarian Church. She believed Council should have adopted the HARCC that night and could not believe how long it had dragged on. She said the efforts to block it were truly horrifying. She said it was one small step on the road to healing the racial divides of their history and moving to a brighter future for everyone in Charleston. She preferred the adoption without any amendments, but if they had to adopt it with amendments, she asked only for those with appendix L1(a) and asked Council to reject all of those in appendix L1(b), which sought to censor speech in this important area.

The Clerk said, "Joel Sadler."

36. Joel Sadler said he was a downtown resident and co-owner of Sightsee Shop. He said it involved real risk as a business owner to take a public stance on something as contentious as systemic racism. He said it must have been important to the Charleston business community to establish the Human Affairs and Racial Conciliation Commission without the highly restrictive amendments. He asked when had they ever seen a larger, more diverse cross-section of the Charleston economy speak out with one voice on any topic as what they had seen that week. He said they were not radical, Marxist infiltrators. They were the good folks responsible for just about every reason people loved the City, not to mention so much of the tax revenue they enjoyed. He said if Council wasn't going to listen to all of the support they had gotten so far, he asked them to listen to them and trust them. He said they were not scattershot, copy-and-paste public commenters, as they had skin in the game.

The Clerk said, "Alex Stein."

No one asked to speak.

The Clerk said, "Lantanya Mueller."

37. Lantanya Mueller said she was a representative of Charleston Playhouse, which was a brand new professional equity theatre in Charleston. She said they were

proud to support the DEIA in the theatre industry of the community developing jobs as part of their staff that focused on diversity and making sure the importance of the work was consciously being developed and implemented. She said they wanted to voice their support for the Human Affairs and Racial Conciliation Committee and hoped to hear of more positive steps in the near future.

The Clerk said, "Katie King."

38. Katie King said she supported the HARCC, and she urged Council to listen to the 60+ area businesses and many individuals asking Council to vote for the permanent establishment of the Commission without the restrictive amendments proposed by Councilmember Caroline Parker. She said the racism of Councilmember Parker and those who spoke to support her amendments showed.

The Clerk said, "We will move on to the summary of comments that we've received. We received a petition signed by 1,566 people titled 'Defeat or Postpone Racial Reconciliation Committee Vote,' pending robust debate is necessary in functioning democracy. We were not able to identify the addresses though. We received a petition signed by 592 people in support of Councilmember Parker's amendments for the Human Affairs and Racial Conciliation Commission. We were not able to identify home addresses. We received a letter from the League of Women Voters for the Charleston area that endorsed the formation of the Human Affairs and Racial Conciliation Commission. One Hundred Forty-Seven residents supported Councilmember Parker's amendments, 130 non-residents or residents who did not give an address that could be verified to be within the City limits supported Councilmember Parker's amendments. Three residents said they supported Councilmember Parker's amendments and opposed the vaccine and mask mandate. Two non-residents or residents who did not give an address that could be verified to be within the City limits supported Councilmember Parker's amendments and opposed the vaccine and mask mandate. Four residents supported Councilmember Shahid's amendments. Thirty-seven residents supported the Commission and opposed restrictive amendments. Sixteen residents supported the Commission. Seven residents did not support the Commission. Twenty-nine non-residents or people who did not give an address that could be verified to be within City limits supported the Commission and opposed restrictive amendments. Eight non-residents or residents who did not give an address that could be verified to be within the City limits supported the Commission. Six non-residents or residents who did not give an address that could be verified within the City limits did not support the Commission. One non-resident supported both amendments. One non-resident supported the Commission but was concerned that the Commission has been deferred multiple times and also cited the rules for masks inside City Hall. One resident asked for online information to be updated and said the COVID-19 measures were unbelievable and asked that the mandates be dropped. One resident said that most of the current elected Councilmembers were willing to allow the rhetoric of those who wanted the Commission to fail instead of the work of those who had invested in the Commission, and that the Commission was no longer worth the fight. One non-resident said they did not support defunding the police and that racial disparities and arrests were not due to racism and said they were scared to go downtown at night. One non-resident said CRT was necessary for an intelligent, well-informed, and successful future. One non-resident asked that Council not allow the race card to be played in Charleston and said that hate should not be sold for votes. We received one e-mail comment we were unable to identify the address for in favor of Councilmember Parker's amendments. One resident said they filed a FOIA request, and said income was not a protected class and that their right to free speech had been violated. Those were all of the comments we received."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you so much, and thank you all who attended and gave us your comments both in-person, especially in-person, but also online, as well. So, next on our agenda is the [appointments to the Housing Authority.](#)"

Councilmember Brady said, "Move for approval."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg continued, "Commission on Women, our own Councilmember Parker, and the Citizens Police Advisory Council."

Councilmember Brady said, "That was for Item I.1.a. through c."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Through c. We have a second. Any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Brady, seconded by Councilmember Gregorie, City Council voted unanimously to approve the following appointments:

1. Appointments:

- a. [Housing Authority for the City of Charleston:](#)
-- Garcia Williams (New appointment)
- b. [Commission on Women:](#)
-- Councilmember Caroline Parker (New appointment)
- c. [Citizen Police Advisory Council:](#)
-- Reverend Rusty Graves – Mayor's selection

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next is a [revised Resolution certifying 94 Sheppard Street.](#) It was an abandoned building so it qualifies for some State incentives, I believe."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Move for approval."

Councilmember Brady said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Mitchell, seconded by Councilmember Brady, City Council voted unanimously to approve a revised Resolution certifying property located at 94 Sheppard Street (Charleston County TMS No. 460-04-04-086) as an abandoned building site under section 12-67-160 of the South Carolina Code.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next will be a brief [update on the City's response to COVID-19.](#) Ms. Tracy McKee is with us."

Tracy McKee said, "Thank you, Mayor. Good evening, Councilmembers. Finally, I think I have some encouraging news to share tonight, which is exciting. There has been a 67% decrease in the 7-day average of new cases over the past two weeks. According to MUSC, the Charleston area peaked on January 15th, and since then, cases have decreased 81% in our area. Yes, I know, thankfully. MUSC does have a high number of COVID patients, but they're starting to see a decline in those, as well, so that's also a good sign. Despite the encouraging significant decline in cases and now a decrease in hospitalizations, transmission is still high, and our friends and medical experts at MUSC recommend that the public maintain mitigation efforts for just a little while longer, but all of the evidence is every encouraging. Even our City cases are down significantly. We have 14 positive right now and another 14 that are waiting for test results. Assuming that the current strong downward trend continues, on Monday masks will no longer be required for employees that are fully vaccinated, but will be strongly encouraged for everyone, and I'm happy to try to answer any questions."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Any questions from Council for Ms. McKee?"

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Hearing none, we'll move on. Next is our [Council Communications](#). We had a request from Councilmember Caroline Parker for a discussion regarding the vaccine and mask mandate for attendance in Council Chambers and City buildings, as well as for City employees. Councilmember Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. I asked for this discussion to be added to our agenda because I am very unclear as to the process of this particular mandate, as well as many citizens who have reached out to me. I hope that Council or Legal will request an opinion from our Attorney General. I hope that can be our next step. I know myself and citizens would like clarification as far as the mandates in Council Chambers, as well as for our employees. Myself and a certain number of our citizens have yet to be provided with documentation on what power the Mayor has to impose a measure like this. There was no vote by Council, it was just implemented. So, again, I just ask, what is the process? I know we have a lot of attorneys in the room. I think process is a big key there. What's the process? Mr. Mayor, I apologize for calling you out right now, but a lot of people texted me photos of you out and about in indoor building settings throughout the week and, again, I just kind of circle back to the hypocrisy of all of it. I just want to be clear. You know, it just seems like in Council Chambers there are different rules, and other buildings in the City there are not. I also want to make sure that we, you know, again, I've asked that this be discussed over the growing number of people who have contacted me that are both current staff and those who have been forced out due to these mandates. I learned things that I wasn't aware of. For 12 weeks, even those employees with exemptions have to get weekly tests, and the restrictions on the testing sites and things like that are very restrictive to our already understaffed, underpaid departments. This was news to me, so I found it very alarming. Again, I just hope that we can all see the hypocrisy here. I'm sitting behind plexiglass this evening. Someone mentioned a school, you know, a teacher. I guess now I know how the kids at CCSD felt last year, and it's disappointing, but we are two years in. We are discussing fairness, inclusion, etc. tonight. We are, again, dividing our citizens, our staff members, our elected officials, we are segregating them. People are being treated unfairly, singled out, and sometimes discriminated against within our own City staff. We cannot be in a perpetual mask mandate. We are all adults who are able to make choices at this point with all that is now available to combat this virus. So, again, I please just ask Council, ask Legal,

maybe we can reach out to the Attorney General and really just get some clarification here. I know a lot of people, including myself, want that.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Alright. Thank you. Any comments? Any further discussion from Council?”

No one asked to speak.

Councilmember Seekings said, “I have a question, Mr. Mayor.”

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings.

Councilmember Seekings said, “Is there a timeline on where we think we are with mask mandates and all of that per in these Chambers?”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Yes. As Ms. McKee just stated, we’ve updated our City policy and, again, this is just for City buildings that we’ve taken authority is to strongly recommend mask wearing in City meetings and buildings starting next Monday. So, I will just add, Councilmember Parker, I appreciate you bringing this up. From the very beginning of the pandemic where Dr. Cole and Dr. Cawley at the Medical University graciously agreed to meet with me three times a week at 7:00 in the morning by telephone to give me the most current healthcare advice on this pandemic as it unfolded, we listened to their advice and tried to set our public policy consistent with the advice of healthcare professionals. We’ve continued to do that through this day. You’ve requested verbally and in writing a Legal Opinion from our staff. They’ve provided that. I’ve seen a copy of it. I presume you got a copy of it. It seems very clear to me. If it’s not clear to you, and you want to proceed to request an additional Opinion from the Attorney General, that’s certainly your right. Please proceed. But, we feel like we’re acting in the best interests of our citizens and our employees. We’ve been open for business. Here we are, we’re two years past the pandemic, we saw this huge rise in cases again with the Omicron variant. Thankfully, God bless, it wasn’t as virulent or strong as the prior.

Most folks didn’t get as sick and die, but the numbers were so high that hospitalizations did about reach what they were during Delta in South Carolina, and the number of deaths, frankly, has continued. I think today’s report was probable and confirmed was nearly 40 or 50 deaths again. I mean, over 15,000 people have died in the State of South Carolina. So, I think it’s appropriate and reasonable to use the mitigation that healthcare professionals recommend. That includes getting a vaccine and getting a booster, and wearing a mask when appropriate when you’re going to be in a setting like this where people are, frankly, pretty closely gathered together. If you can’t social distance, we thought it was appropriate to recommend that. Thankfully, the numbers are coming down, and we’ve listened to our professionals. I talked to Dr. Richardson with DHEC last week, and she thought it was appropriate that we dial it back, so that’s who we listen to and use, and I’ll continue to do that. I won’t apologize for that. So, next on the agenda, unless there are other comments, is our [Committee on Public Safety](#). Councilmember Shahid.”

Councilmember Shahid said, “Thank you, Mr. Mayor. The Public Safety Committee met yesterday, I’m sorry, I’m thinking today is Tuesday.”

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Shahid said, "Every day is a little off like having another extended vacation during the Thanksgiving holidays, I guess. This is Wednesday. The Committee met on Monday afternoon, and we had a very well thought-out discussion regarding our noise ordinance. I appreciate Legal Counsel providing us with information. They did a comparison of other jurisdictions on how they address controlling the Noise Ordinance, and they broke it down into categories of noise such as music, public addresses, and car noise restrictions as well, but there was no action taken on that. One of the things I think that came out of that was there are going to be some adjustments to our noise ordinances so we use sort of a wide-arm net, as opposed to arbitrarily or using subjective standards to make any modifications to those ordinances, but no action was taken on that.

The approval for a contract renewal in the amount of \$18,069 with the City of Charleston and Low Country Services was discussed, and we moved for approval. Then, the approval of an MOU between the Charleston Police Department and U.S Department of Veterans Affairs, which is another extension of that MOU was approved, and we move for that to be approved, as well. Then, we had a report, finally, from Agent Crabb from the Homeland Security outlining the cooperation and coordination between U.S. Homeland Security and our Charleston Police Department on addressing human trafficking in the Lowcountry, and he went through a bunch of statistics and information on that. It's one of those things that I think that we are just not fully aware of the large impact that it has in the community, and the Charleston community is not immune from victimization of several folks dealing with human trafficking.

Finally, we had our annual update on our Municipal Court System. We had a report from all of our judges who appeared, except for one who was actually holding court. I can read you off all of these numbers, but I just wanted to tell you this, that our Municipal Court staff/family is doing a magnificent job of getting our numbers and addressing our court system. As you know, the Chief Justice of the South Carolina Supreme Court is the supreme supervisor over the court systems and over us lawyers who have been used to a number of policies and orders issued by him addressing how courts should operate for the past two years. In some instances, courts have just been literally shut down, or they have been operating virtually. I was in court today, and Judge Jefferson was in one courtroom, and I was in another, and the solicitor was in another courtroom, the probation officer was in another courtroom. It was done throughout this personal setting, but we don't have that luxury in our court system. But, I can tell you this, when we started looking into this, our Committee was engaged in this process of looking at our numbers. They were extremely high. This is pre-COVID stage, and we weren't making any dents in getting our case numbers down. With the addition of dedicated prosecutors, with the addition of the DUI dedicated judge and dedicated prosecutors for DUI court, our numbers have gone down steadily. I think our oldest case now is an October 2020 case, but our number of jury trials have gone down, and our number of cases in both Livability, DUI, and General Crimes have gone down, as well. So, it's a good report, and I was very pleased to have had all of our judges participate and provide us with an update, and I think our new judge, Susan Herdina, is happy to be where she is."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings.

Councilmember Seekings said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. Just very briefly on the report from the court system, just by way of historic context for those who are here recently, we asked for the court administrator and some of the judges to come and give the Committee a report now two or three years ago, two years ago. So, that was what, 2019?"

Councilmember Shahid said, “2019.”

Councilmember Seekings said, “2019, and before we got a report on the status of the court, how it was running, whether they needed money, whether it needed to be updated, what their backlog of cases were, all of that, the question was asked, ‘well, when was the last time you came and gave City Council an update on how things are going in the court?’ and the Deputy Clerk of the Court said, ‘well, I’ve worked here since the late ‘70s, and we’ve never, ever come and given a report to City Council.’ They then went on and proceeded to tell us about an amazing backlog of cases that, if you did the math out, if they worked as hard as they could, would have been a decade in the making to clear up. They went right back to work, gave us a great report, and now are coming back to us regularly, and so have some communication, and it’s not for purposes of getting in the way of the judicial system, it’s for purposes of giving them support and understanding what’s going on over there. So, for the first time in decades, we now know what’s going on in the court system, we can act as a support system for them and, I mean, I can’t tell you how much better, and just the difference between the report two years ago, and think what they have been doing for the last few years dealing with COVID having to clean up the cases, streamline the docket, everyone is on the same page. All of the judges were in, and they all showed up except the one who was working on the bench. It was just a whole different deal, and we got back to work, and I think that this Council receiving reports through the Public Safety Committee will increase the efficiency of the court system and make it a better place for it. Look, the citizens of the world who come in contact with judicial systems and courtrooms, for 99% of them, it’s through municipal city-level courts. It’s the place we should be our best, and letting them do that really is a huge service to our community. So, I just wanted to sort of give you that historic context and let you know I think that they’re doing a great job, and I do echo what Councilmember Shahid said. I do believe that Ms. Herdina is in a very happy, happy, happy place. So, thank you.”

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “And did you mention the software update? This communication with the court would completely upgrade the management software that we use in our court system this year.”

Councilmember Shahid said, “I didn’t. I’ll just add in one thing along those lines. I know Councilmember Seekings will chime in, but one of the things they talked about was they called for a jury trial, and you’ve got to have a pool of at least X number of people in order to do a jury trial. In Municipal Court, all you need is six jurors and maybe one alternate, as opposed to 12 in General Sessions Court or Civil Court or in Federal Court. They had, when they called for a jury trial, seven people showed up, seven, and of course, if you don’t have a jury show up, your court system is going to shut down. It’s gotten better in this automated system that I think we’re going to be tying in with the existing Statewide system, but it will have a big impact on that. One other thought, when Councilmember Seekings said something, I just needed to add this other part. There is an old saying that ‘justice delayed is justice denied.’ We think in terms of only the folks who are appearing as Defendants in Municipal Court, but people who appear in Municipal Court are not just the criminals who are, I mean, the Defendants who are charged with a crime, it’s the victims. It may be a shop owner with shoplifting charges, it may be a neighbor with a noise violation, it may be a trespasser, it may be a girlfriend or a spouse with a domestic violence charge, and so they have a right to that case being heard, as well. So, if you’ve got a two-year delay on that case being not heard, you are depriving the victim of justice, as well. So, it is critically important, critically important, that these cases move at a much better pace.”

Councilmember Seekings said, "If I might, just one thing that I thought about."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings.

Councilmember Seekings said, "So, one reason, and it's not the only reason why they don't get jurors there, one reason is because, guess how much we pay our jurors a day? Five dollars, five dollars. Five dollars. Who the heck is going to, I mean, don't live on the Peninsula and not riding your bike, you can't afford to get there on \$5, right? Well, I guess if you took CARTA, we'd let you on for \$2, but I mean, so, it has been suggested, those of you who are on the Budget Committee, please be warned that we up the fee daily for those on the jury. The suggestion was to double it to \$10. Councilmember Shahid, being the generous guy he is, goes, 'well, I think we should do \$25 or \$50.' Well, I will just tell you the Committee objected to that because that's more than we make on this Council. So, somewhere between \$10 and \$50 looks like what you're going to get asked to approve, and we really do need to give them a little bit of a stipend. Five bucks, \$5 is what you get for being on a jury. So, anyway."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you for that. Do we need to take action on this Committee Report, Mr. Chairman?"

Councilmember Shahid said, "So moved."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion to approve the report and a second. Any further discussion?"

No one else asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Shahid, seconded by Councilmember Gregorie, City Council voted unanimously to adopt the Committee on Public Safety Report as presented:

---INSERT COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY REPORT---

- a. Discussion regarding Noise Ordinance (No action taken)
- b. Approval of contract renewal in the amount of \$18,069 between the City of Charleston and Low Country Youth Services for a youth mentorship program to help CPD build relationships with youth and community to prevent crime and promote public safety
- c. Approval of an MOU between CPD and U.S. Department of Veterans Affairs, Ralph H. Johnson VA Health Care System Police Services for purposes of coordinating law enforcement response to incidents and situations occurring at the Ralph H. Johnson VA Health Care System
- d. Report by U.S. Homeland Security Investigations (HSI) on their efforts to combat human trafficking in the Lowcountry through a strategy that implements a victim-centered approach leveraging enhanced partnerships across state, local and non-government organizations.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "If you will allow me just two quick comments because they are just related items, we had our Mentoring Volunteer Fair at the Arthur Christopher Gym last Saturday. I bring that up because of this item between the City of Charleston and Low Country Youth Services. They were one of about 15 organizations there. It was very successful. Of course, we could have used a few more volunteers coming through, but we had a goodly number and promoting mentoring our youth in the City of Charleston this year, so that was a good step forward thanks to staff and Mindy Sturm who helped put that on. Secondly, I did want to note since we had an item here regarding the VA Healthcare System that Secretary McDonough, who is the Secretary of the Veterans Administration, was in town today, and he graciously agreed to be with me for a little while. He was here to acknowledge that sometimes government is a little slower to respond than the private sector on paying employees. We've experienced that ourselves. So, he was here to address that issue at the Veterans Hospital and is putting forth some policies to increase pay for the workers at the Veterans Administration, but I assured him of the City's commitment to the district over there, the Hospital District, including the Veterans Affairs Veterans Hospital. You may or may not know, Councilmembers, that the Veterans Hospital is planning for a major expansion on Bee Street, basically, a new hospital here in Charleston. It will take a few years for that to come down the line, but I felt it was important to communicate to the Secretary that we support their presence, their service to our veterans, and those who are in active duty service, and we're going to do everything that we can from an infrastructure point of view to help support their expansion on the Peninsula and in the Hospital District. Next up is our [Committee on Public Works](#). Councilmember Waring."

Councilmember Waring said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. We met on Monday and you see, in particular, I will take it separate, item a. the authorization which passed in Ways and Means of the almost a mile of sidewalks that's going to be a part of the Long Savannah project. That's going to be such a wonderful benefit in an underserved community, but one of the things I discussed briefly with the Mayor prior to the meeting was what a wonderful opportunity if we can collaborate, I didn't think about this in yesterday's meeting, to expand that, Councilmember, to at least eight feet to make it a bike/pedestrian path. Anybody that's familiar with Bees Ferry Road after the County and the State expansion is a wonderful eight- to ten-foot bike/pedestrian path, and I'm telling you, man, that community uses that left and right. Eventually the County will have wonderful Long Savannah Park when they get that done, but if we're going to put a five-foot sidewalk, why don't we just go ahead and put the bike/pedestrian path now. I mean let's have the conversations beyond this meeting, Mr. Mayor, and I won't hold the meeting anymore up with that, any longer with that, but I think let's do it now. So, thank you. So, I ask for the passage of item a(i)."

Councilmember Brady said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Waring, seconded by Councilmember Brady, City Council voted unanimously to approve Item 2a(i) of the Committee on Public Works and Utilities Report as presented:

a. Acceptances and Dedications of Rights-of-Way and Easements:

- (i) Authorization to notify SCDOT that the City will accept maintenance of 5,152 LF of a 5' concrete sidewalk and a 20' boardwalk to be constructed within the

r/w of Bear Swamp Road (S-10-384).

Councilmember Waring said, “As you see item c(i), (ii), and (iii) in particular, all deal with a project that we have lived with from administration to now your administration, Councilmember Seekings and his district that you all worked along with Governor to include the medical tunnel that’s going to tap into it, and I can’t tell you what kind of victory that is. I think I saw in a picture of the paper today was a gentleman who had two prostheses wading through the Medical District in water. I mean didn’t that tell it all? A picture told it all, but this \$12 million to expand that tap into what is it, a \$200 million project, state of the art. Nobody in the State of South Carolina is doing anything like that and drainage finally bringing an answer to a century-long problem. So, I ask approval for items 2b(i), and c(i), (ii), and (iii) and welcome the comments in particular for those who went down in the tunnel with the Governor and showed him our problems.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “We had some comments earlier today at Ways and Means Committee before you got here and, in fact, I mentioned this matter to the Secretary of Veterans Affairs today, that tonight we would be taking up this issue that would provide real relief to the Veterans Hospital area, so he appreciated that.”

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shahid.

Councilmember Shahid said, “And we did make some comments during our Ways and Means, but one of the things that I just want to harp back on, and I think it was either during the Ways and Means Committee meeting or Real Estate Committee meeting, Councilmember Moody commented and it was sort of one of these moments, ‘Houston, we have a problem,’ and this project almost got stopped dead in its tracks because we were not fully aware of the obstacles that were going on with this project and the overruns with this. I remember we had to do some shifting, and you all made comments about the Mayor’s efforts to go out and locate some more money, but this thing was sort of plodding along. We all thought things were hunky-dory and there were no problems with this thing, and I mentioned that just because it’s a testament to, not what we did here, but a large part to what our staff did in the Public Works/Stormwater Department in getting the project back on track, and it was just a little bit a part of history that it wasn’t all successful. There were some major issues going on with this, but perseverance and I think some good stewardship by our Chief Financial Officer, as well. We all came together and made sure that thing which was once off track got back on track, and we are where we are because of a collective effort by everybody pitching in and making sure we got it done right. So, I just wanted us to reflect a little bit on that past history with this project and thank God that we are where we are today.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Thank you for that comment. You mentioned the staff and I want to name names and that’s Matt Fountain, our Director, but also Steve Kirk and Frank Newham both worked on this project, and I thank City Council because we proceeded with real expenditures on this project for the design and engineering before we knew we would get the help from Governor McMaster that he promised us and he followed through on. So, Council really put it out there to continue that funding so that the timing of this would work out in sync with the bigger Spring/Fishburne project which as it turns out, it’s tight but we’re going to be right in there under the wire along with it, so it’s all good. Any other comments or questions?”

No one else asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Waring, seconded by Councilmember Mitchell, City

Council voted unanimously to approve Items 2b(i), c(i), (ii), and (iii) of the Committee on Public Works and Utilities Report as presented:

b. Public Service Department Update:

- (i) Update on the new Public Works Facility

c. Stormwater Management Department Update:

- (i) Medical District Tunnel Extension at Ehrhardt St – Recommend Approval to award a construction contract with Triad Engineering and Contracting Company in the amount of \$12,487,790.00 for the construction of a stormwater tunnel and drop shaft structure that will service a portion of the medical district and will provide a drainage connection between the Medical District and the Spring/Fishburne drainage tunnel network. With the approval of this project budget, Staff is authorized to award/amend contracts less than \$40,000.00 to the extent project contingency funds exist in the Council Approved Budget. Approval of this contract will institute a project budget of \$17,855,519.00 with \$9,964,190.00 coming from a HUD CDBG-MIT Grant and \$7,891,320.00 from the Drainage Fund.
- (ii) Medical District Tunnel Extension at Ehrhardt St – Recommend Approval of Fee Amendment #4 for \$2,482,200.00 with Davis & Floyd to provide construction contract management, construction-phase engineering, assurance and acceptance inspection, sampling, testing, and construction survey verifications.
- (iii) Spring/Fishburne Phase 4 – Recommend Approval of the Purchase of a Diesel Generator Set from Blanchard Machinery under State Contract as owner supplied equipment. The funding for this item is included in the Phase 4 Project Budget.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Thank you, Councilmember Waring. Next up our Committee on Ways and Means. Councilmember Gregorie.”

Councilmember Gregorie said, “So moved.”

Councilmember Seekings said, “Second.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “We have a motion for approval. Any discussion?”

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Gregorie, seconded by Councilmember Seekings, City Council voted unanimously to adopt the [Committee on Ways and Means Report](#) as presented:

---INSERT COMMITTEE ON WAYS AND MEANS REPORT---

(Bids and Purchases

(Parks – Capital Projects: Approval of Ashley Hall Fire Station #16 Renovation Change Order #2 with Satchel Construction, LLC in the amount of \$47,005.99

for the removal and replacement of 33 storefront glass units, new side doors at apparatus bay and lounge restroom area, provide and install LVT flooring throughout the living quarters, install kitchen exhaust fan and demo old units in apparatus bay, drywall patching and painting in workout area, and electrical and light outlet alterations. Approval of Change Order #2 will increase the construction contract by \$47,005.99 (from \$151,726.85 to \$198,732.84). The funding source for this project is Land Sales (\$430,000).

- (Stormwater Management: Approval of Ehrhardt St Tunnel Construction Contract with Triad Engineering and Contracting Company in the amount of \$12,487,790 for the construction of a stormwater tunnel and drop shaft structure that will service a portion of the medical district and will provide a drainage connection between the Medical District and the Spring/Fishburne drainage tunnel network. With approval of the project budget, Staff is authorized to award and/or amend contracts less than \$40,000 to the extent project contingency funds exist in the Council Approved Budget. Approval of this construction contract will institute a project budget of \$17,855,519 of which \$12,487,790 will be obligated for the contract. Funding for this project is HUD CDBG-MIT Grant (\$9,964,190) and Drainage Fund (\$7,891,329).
- (Stormwater Management: Approval of Ehrhardt St. Tunnel Extension Fee Amendment #4 with Davis and Floyd for \$2,482,200 for construction contract management, construction –phase engineering, assurance and acceptance inspection, sampling, testing, and construction survey verification for the Ehrhardt St. Tunnel Extension project. Approval of Fee Amendment #4 will increase the professional services contract by \$2,482,200 (from \$1,004,740 to \$3,486,940). Funding for this project is HUD CDBG-MIT Grant (\$9,964,190) and the Drainage Fund (\$7,891,329).
- (Police Department: Approval of a contract renewal in the amount of \$18,069 between the City of Charleston and Low Country Youth Services for a youth mentorship program to help CPD build relationships with youth and the community to prevent crime and promote public safety.
- (Police Department: Approval of an MOU between CPD and U.S. Department of Veterans Affairs, Ralph H. Johnson VA Health Care System Police Services for purposes of coordinating law enforcement response to incidents and situations occurring at the Ralph H. Johnson VA Health Care System.
- (Budget, Finance, and Revenue Collections: Approval of the attached budget to transfer \$800,000 budgeted in 2022 for ARPA grants to grantee specific line items as recommended by the Ad Hoc Budget Committee. There is no budget impact.
- (An ordinance authorizing the Mayor to execute on behalf of the City a utility easement, approved as to form by the office of Corporation Counsel, to Dominion Energy South Carolina, Inc., encumbering a portion of the City's real property designated as Charleston County TMS No. 459-05-04-116, within the right-of-way shown on drawing D-84107, to permit installation of duct bank to transfer electricity to multiple affordable housing projects, including James Lewis, Jr. Eastside Apartments. The property is owned by the City of Charleston. (Block of Lee Street, Nassau Street, Hanover Street and Cooper Street)
- (An ordinance authorizing the Mayor to execute on behalf of the City a utility easement, approved as to form by the office of Corporation Counsel, to Dominion Energy South Carolina, Inc., encumbering a portion of the City's real property designated as Charleston County TMS No. 459-05-03-005, within the

right-of-way shown on drawing D-84107, to permit installation of duct bank to transfer electricity to multiple affordable housing projects, including James Lewis, Jr. Eastside Apartments. The property is owned by the City of Charleston. (Nassau Street and Lee Street)

(Request the Mayor and City Council approve the sale of the Shires Apartment to Harmony Housing, Inc., a Georgia-based nonprofit organization to re-capitalize and maintain the units as affordable rental housing for persons or families earning sixty (60%) and below the Area Median Income for a period of not to exceed 30 years. The previous investment the City of Charleston made in the approximate amount of \$379k, known as Home Investment Partnerships Program Community Housing Development Organization (CHDO) proceeds awarded by the Department of Housing and Urban Development will be returned to Humanities Housing (CHDO for the Humanities Foundation) CHDO to be reinvested in CHDO eligible housing activities in the City of Charleston. Humanities Foundation will provide the City of Charleston an annual report illustrating where said funds are invested. Please see the attached correspondence from Tracy Doran and information on Harmony Housing.

(Request the Mayor and City Council enter into an Option to Lease with RHG Housing Development, LLC (RHG), the successful bidder for the Johns Island Affordable Housing RFP (Fenwick Properties). RHG proposes to build both rental and for-sale affordable housing on the site. [Ordinance]

(Request approval of the Lease Amendment renewing the lease agreement between Traverse Point, LLC and the City of Charleston, for the lease of the commercial space located at 2093 Executive Hall Road, Charleston, South Carolina. The monthly rent is approximately \$6770.10. The space is utilized by CPD. (The property is owned by Traverse Point, LLC; TMS No. 351-01-00-049.)

(Please consider the following annexations:

- 2131 Clayton Drive (0.25 acre) (TMS# 310-12-00-018), West Ashley, (District 11). The property is owned by David William Ogden and Erin Hope Leach-Ogden.
- 1517 and 1521 Wappoo Drive (0.54 acre), (TMS# 351-12-00-115 and 207), West Ashley, (District 9). The property is owned by Little Dudes LLC and The Dudes Invests LLC.

First reading was given to the following bills:

An ordinance authorizing the Mayor to execute on behalf of the City a utility easement, approved as to form by the office of Corporation Counsel, to Dominion Energy South Carolina, Inc., encumbering a portion of the City's real property designated as Charleston County TMS No. 459-05-04-116, within the right-of-way shown on drawing D-84107, to permit installation of duct bank to transfer electricity to multiple affordable housing projects, including James Lewis, Jr. Eastside Apartments.

An ordinance authorizing the Mayor to execute on behalf of the City a utility easement, approved as to form by the office of Corporation Counsel, to Dominion Energy South Carolina, Inc., encumbering a portion of the City's real property designated as Charleston County TMS No. 459-05-03-005, within the right-of-way shown on drawing D-84107, to permit installation of duct bank to transfer electricity to multiple affordable housing projects, including James Lewis, Jr. Eastside Apartments.

An ordinance authorizing the Mayor to execute, on behalf of the City of Charleston ("City") that certain Option to Lease and acquire real property to RHG Housing Development, LLC ("Developer") the City's real property, containing 12.647 acres, more or less, and designated as Charleston County TMS No. 346-00-00-004, under which the developer will develop a minimum of 90 affordable residential rental units and 28 affordable for sale units.

An ordinance to provide for the annexation of property known as 2131 Clayton Drive (0.25 acre) (TMS# 310-12-00-018), West Ashley, Charleston County, to the City of Charleston, shown within the area annexed upon a map attached hereto and make it part of District 11. The property is owned by David William Ogden and Erin Hope Leach-Ogden.

An ordinance to provide for the annexation of properties known as 1517 and 1521 Wappoo Drive (0.54 acre) (TMS# 351-12-00-115 and 207), West Ashley, Charleston County, to the City of Charleston, shown within the area annexed upon a map attached hereto and make it part of District 9. The properties are owned by Little Dudes LLC and the Dude Invests LLC.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next we have bills up for third reading. Can I entertain a motion to approve the ordinance to create the Human Affairs and Racial Conciliation Commission?"

Councilmember Shahid said, "Mayor, I make a motion that, and I'm looking at Julia to make sure we go through this and tackle part of this right, move for approval of the ordinance as previously amended and/or my amendments listed as L1(a)."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Second."

Councilmember Shahid said, "And I also move that those amendments were all listed as amendments 1 through 8 be taken up as a whole."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion to approve the Commission along with amendments 1 through 8 that are listed in L-1."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Eight."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Correct, Councilmember, and we have a second, so the motion is on the floor."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings.

Councilmember Seekings said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. I would ask that we separate the amendments from the approval of the Commission until we have heard all of the amendments. I'm not voting on a Commission until we know that the amendments are going to be."

Councilmember Parker said, "Thank you. I second that."

Councilmember Shahid said, "And I think that's the proper procedure, to go through the amendments, L1(a) first, and then we have to take up L1(b), and then the amendments."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I think that's appropriate protocol, and we'll come back after we decide which amendments we're going to add and then vote on the Commission, as amended. Is that appropriate?"

Councilmember Seekings said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, then, first up, as it is on the agenda, would be to consider those amendments, 1 through 8, that were proposed by Councilmember Shahid in L1(a), and the motion still stands to take them all as a group? Take them altogether? Is that correct?"

Councilmember Shahid said, "That's correct."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright, and we have a second on that?"

Councilmember Sakran said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Any discussion on the amendments of L1(a)?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shahid.

Councilmember Shahid said, "I just wanted to give a brief background on this, Mr. Mayor, and members of Council. The original ordinance was proposed back in December of 2021 and, as we were going through the second, before we got to the third reading, I received an e-mail from some folks calling themselves the Coalition for Racial Harmony. That came on a Friday."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Councilmember, please speak a little closer to the microphone, and I'll remind everyone when you speak to try to get a little closer to the microphone."

Councilmember Shahid said, "I'm sorry. Thank you. As a result of that e-mail, I met with the representatives of that coalition. They forwarded to me proposed amendments, which I reviewed, which was the Monday before our Council meeting. I forwarded them to you, Councilmember Sakran and Councilmember Gregorie. Councilmember Gregorie responded back to those with some additions to that. We then, at our Council meeting, gave second reading approval and waited to have a third reading at a later Council meeting. In between that, we met, several of us met in my office on Friday, taking these original amendments that came from that group, this Coalition for Racial Harmony, taking those requests that provided the framework for what has been now called the 'Shahid Amendments.' We took that, several of you Councilmembers approached me, made additions, made comments to those amendments, and we sat in my office, and we went through these one-by-one for several hours. Some of you weren't present but still made comments, and we took those comments and suggestions and incorporated them into what is now the L1(a) amendments. I circulated those back to the representatives of this coalition, they approved it, and they accepted it.

It wasn't perfect, as somebody has said. Those amendments were not everything that we wanted or everything that we intended, but in the spirit of compromise, in the spirit of bringing this together, those amendments were discussed, debated, modified, revised, edited, commented upon, everything that you would expect to create, hopefully, a unity among Council tonight. I can't tell you how proud I am of those folks who came to me, who were ordinary

citizens. I also held a virtual constituent meeting. Some of you all were present. I think some Councilmembers were there who listened in on that, and it helped us to engage the community in this process. I would ask that these amendments be accepted as a whole. I think it doesn't include everything that all of us want. I think it does give a very spirited idea of compromise. It clarifies a bunch of language that folks were objecting to, and we made that, there was some wordsmithing on that. We added some definition of equity, which seemed to be a strain to a lot of folks. One of the major substantive changes on this is that it expanded the number of Commission members to 13, with 3 members to be from Council, and that those who are not on the Commission can make a nomination to include diversity in the makeup of that Commission. So, I appreciate the work that went in with all of the folks engaged with this. It was hard, it was exhausting, but I would ask that we give unanimous approval to these amendments. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Parker.

Councilmember Parker said, "I would like to move, I think we should vote on them individually."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion on the floor to take them together."

Councilmember Parker said, "Okay. So, we're going to have a vote?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, we will unless there is a deferral."

Councilmember Parker said, "I apologize. I'm new to the Rules of Order, but I prefer to have them voted on up or down, each one, as I thought was going to be done on all of the amendments."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We had a motion—"

Councilmember Brady said, "As a point of order, there is a primary motion on the floor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "There is a motion on the floor to take them together."

Councilmember Parker said, "Okay."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Any other comments?"

No one else asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I'll call the question."

Councilmember Parker said, "Can we have a roll call?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We can have a roll call. Yes, ma'am."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregg."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shealy."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Sakran."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Mitchell."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Brady."

Councilmember Brady said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Waring."

Councilmember Waring said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Seekings."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Bowden."

Councilmember Bowden said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Appel."

Councilmember Appel said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "No."

The Clerk said, "Mayor Tecklenburg."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Aye."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "The motion passes."

On a motion of Councilmember Shahid, seconded by Councilmember Sakran, City Council voted to approve the following amendments to Agenda Item L-1:

Amendment #1:

Amend the first paragraph of 2-207 to read: The purpose of the HARCC is to promote equity, inclusion, and racial conciliation through meetings, presentations, and research regarding all forms of institutional and community discrimination and assist in implementing any recommendations from the Mayor and Council through its standing committees to the public, assist with education and implementation of any directive from Council. Equity, for the purposes of HARCC 's duties and responsibilities, shall be defined as the guarantee of fair treatment, access, opportunity, and advancement while at the same time striving to identify and eliminate barriers that have prevented the full participation of some groups.

Amendment #2:

Add to 2-207: HARCC is under no obligation to use the EIRC Commission Report as a blueprint, framework or path forward. Notwithstanding, within the first 5 months from the first duly called meeting of the HARCC, it shall review the EIRC report and submit those recommendations HARCC believes will best achieve equity, inclusion, and racial conciliation in accordance with the approved 10 year City Plan and all other relevant sources.

Amendment #3:

Add to 2-207: All recommendations to Council shall adhere to the principles of equity, inclusion and equal opportunity in accordance with City, State and Federal nondiscrimination laws and the protective classes therein. This provision is not intended to restrict HARCC's ability to make recommendations to Council for changes to existing laws where there may be unintended discrimination against a protected Class.

Amendment #4:

Add to 2-207: HARCC is to pursue initiatives that honor the contributions of those who were enslaved; ameliorating the remaining vestiges of slavery and Jim Crow era laws; changing our local government to reflect equity and inclusion for all people.

Amendment #5:

Add to 2-207: HARCC is not a blueprint to implement all the recommendations in the Special Commission report nor will it advocate to defund the police, provide cash reparations, teach critical race theory, or advocate to violate the South Carolina Heritage Act.

Amendment #6:

Amend Section 2-209 a to read as follows: The HARCC shall consist of 13 members, three (3) of which shall be members of city council and the remaining ten (10) appointees shall be members of the community. Each Council member who was not appointed to be a member of the Commission and the Mayor, shall each nominate one community member, subject to approval by Council. All nominees will be properly vetted and approved by Council consistent with the principles set forth for appointments to other standing City commissions and committees.

Amendment #7:

Last paragraph of the preamble, fifth sentence to be amended as follows: The recommendations of the Commission were intended to create a path forward for the City toward positive change with input from the Mayor, Council members and citizens.

Amendment #8:

Amend Section 4, 2-208: Duties and Responsibilities, 9 as follows-

. . . and any activities related to carrying out the duties and responsibilities of the HARCC.

The motion passed 12 to 1. The vote was not unanimous. Councilmember Parker voted nay.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next are the [amendments proposed by Councilmember Parker, L1\(b\)](#)."

Councilmember Parker said, "Motion to go through them, each amendment, and take a vote on each amendment."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "You can make a motion to take the first amendment, and then the second, and then the third, if you like."

Councilmember Parker said, "Okay, vote on each up or down?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We would vote on each motion as it's presented to us."

Councilmember Parker said, "Okay."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Would you like to make a motion, Councilmember?"

Councilmember Parker said, "Yes, motion to vote on [Amendment #1](#)."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay, we have a motion to vote on Councilmember Parker's Amendment #1."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "There is a second. Any discussion? Councilmember Parker, any discussion?"

Councilmember Parker said, "No."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregg."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shealy."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Sakran."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Mitchell."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Brady."

Councilmember Brady said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Waring."

Councilmember Waring said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Seekings."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Bowden."

Councilmember Bowden said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Appel."

Councilmember Appel said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Mayor Tecklenburg."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Nay."

On a motion of Councilmember Parker, seconded by Councilmember Gregg, City Council considered agenda Item L1(b) 1, as presented:

Amend the following portion of the 5th paragraph of the preamble to read: "Mayor Tecklenburg received the report on behalf of his office and forwarded it to the appropriate standing committees. ~~The recommendations of the Commission are intended to create a path forward for the city toward positive change with input from the Mayor, Council members and citizens.~~ By affirming the creation of this standing Commission, to be called the Human Affairs and Racial Conciliation Commission, this Council will ~~not only acknowledge the work put into this report, but also ensure that its stated purpose, to eliminate the vestiges of Jim Crow and slavery in our City, is heard and fulfilled with patience and fortitude.~~

The motion failed 10 to 3. The vote was not unanimous. Councilmembers Gregg, Shealy, and Parker voted in favor of the motion.

Councilmember Shahid said, "Mayor, I make a motion that the remaining amendments listed under L1(b) be taken as a whole."

Councilmember Bowden said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "A motion to take all of the rest of the amendments together, and we can have a roll call on that. Any discussion?"

Councilmember Parker said, "Absolutely."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Parker.

Councilmember Parker said, "I had really hoped to have, I mean, we heard all of the comments tonight, so to completely dismiss these amendments outright is a really disappointing move. You've heard the outpouring of support for my amendments. I think it would be fair, as Council, to do what we were elected to do, to listen to our citizens, and have a roll call on all of these amendments. It's disappointing. I thought I had your commitment to this. I understand that this was a possibility, but it's really unfortunate."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "You still have the floor. Are you [Inaudible]?"

Councilmember Parker said, "[Inaudible]."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. They're all being considered."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Bowden.

Councilmember Bowden said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. I think this is the appropriate way to handle it. You know, a lot of these really conflict with the amendments that we just agreed to take on as a whole, so we're creating a lot of problems by sort of doubling up on some of these things. That's, I think, a big issue. But, more importantly, Councilman Shahid's amendments are the product of a deliberative process. That is what we came here to do. This is weeks long, this is not being rammed through, this is well thought-out, it has taken a ton of input into consideration, it has gone through the hard work of refining language to make this something that, you know, plenty of people aren't happy with. I'm not happy with all of these amendments, but I'm going to vote for them because, ultimately, this is the way creating law works. So, I just cannot agree that anything is sort of being rammed through here, or that we're not considering anything. There are just better amendments on this."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings followed by Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Seekings said, "I do think we should take them up one at a time just because I don't think all of them are in conflict with what we just passed. There are some that I'm inclined to vote for and some I'm not, and if we don't do it that way, I'm going to explain my vote on the backside, so I think we should take them up one-by-one. We've heard from enough

people tonight who wanted to be heard. I would commend to this Council at the end of a long process, let's finish it off right."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring said, "I'm in agreement with Councilmember Parker and Seekings. I know it's been a long process, and I know my colleagues and a lot of us want to move forward, but one thing I'm going to be protective of is freedom of speech. I know Robert's Rules of Order would allow us to move forward as a group, but I would ask that we hear these amendments one-by-one and, respectfully, have a roll call on each one. Thank you, Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Would anyone else like to comment at this time? The motion on the floor is to take the rest of them together."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregorie.

The Clerk said, "Can you speak into your mic? Thank you."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Can you ask the person who made the motion to either retract it so that we can in fact--"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "If that's his wish, that would be Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "I'll do that."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Okay. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay, withdraw the motion to take them together. We'll take them one-by-one. So, next up is Amendment #2."

Councilmember Parker said, "Move for approval."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion to take [Amendment #2](#). Do we have a second?"

Councilmember Gregg said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Is there any discussion on Amendment #2?"

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "And we'll just take a roll call vote on each one, Madam Clerk."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregg."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shealy."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Sakran."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Mitchell."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Brady."

Councilmember Brady said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Waring."

Councilmember Waring said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Seekings."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Bowden."

Councilmember Bowden said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Appel."

Councilmember Appel said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Mayor Tecklenburg."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Nay. The motion fails."

On a motion of Councilmember Parker, seconded by Councilmember Gregg, City Council considered agenda Item L1(b) 2 as presented:

Amend Sec. 2-207 to Add: "Critical Race Theory", for the purposes of HARCC, is defined as the idea that many U.S. Institutions are built on and enforce systemic racism and

oppression and includes relegating U.S. history to a struggle between two groups: oppressors and the oppressed.

The motion failed 9 to 4. The vote was not unanimous. Councilmembers Gregg, Shealy, Seekings and Parker voted in favor of the motion.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Do we have a motion to accept [Amendment #3?](#)"

Councilmember Parker said, "Yes."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So moved. Do we have a second?"

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "A roll call vote, please."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregg."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shealy."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Sakran."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Mitchell."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Brady."

Councilmember Brady said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Waring."

Councilmember Waring said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Seekings."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Bowden."

Councilmember Bowden said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Appel."

Councilmember Appel said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Mayor Tecklenburg."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "The motion fails."

On a motion of Councilmember Parker, seconded by Councilmember Gregorie, City Council considered agenda Item L1(b) 3 as presented:

Add a New Subsection to Sec. 2-208 to Read: The Commission shall not advance nor facilitate in any manner policies or recommendations which embrace the tenets of Critical Race Theory.

The motion failed 7 to 6. The vote was not unanimous. Councilmembers Gregg, Shealy, Brady, Seeking, Appel, and Parker voted in favor of the motion.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Do we have a motion to approve [Amendment #4?](#)"

Councilmember Parker said, "Yes."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay. Do we have a second?"

Councilmember Gregg said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "A roll call vote, please, Madam."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregg."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shealy."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Sakran."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Mitchell."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Brady."

Councilmember Brady said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Waring."

Councilmember Waring said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Seekings."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Bowden."

Councilmember Bowden said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Appel."

Councilmember Appel said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Mayor Tecklenburg."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "The motion fails."

On a motion of Councilmember Parker, seconded by Councilmember Gregg, City Council considered agenda Item L1(b) 4 as presented:

Add a New Subsection to Sec. 2-208 to Read: The Commission shall not advance nor facilitate in any manner policies or recommendations which support reparations.

The motion failed 7 to 6. The vote was not unanimous. Councilmembers Gregg, Shealy, Brady, Seekings, Appel, and Parker voted in favor of the motion.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Do we have a motion to approve [Amendment #5?](#)"

Councilmember Parker said, "Motion to approve Amendment #5."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "And a second. Any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I would like to just comment on #5 that we already approved previously that states that the HAARC is not a group to implement all of the recommendations in the Special Commission Report nor will it advocate to defund the police or [inaudible]. I point that out just because we've already approved, in spirit, a number of these amendments, so they're duplicative, and I just thought I'd point that out. Any other discussion?"

Councilmember Parker said, "Yes, Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Parker.

Councilmember Parker said, "I understand the, you know, Heritage Act, but I think we removed monuments even beyond the Heritage Act. Is that correct?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I can't hear you. Speak a little more into the microphone."

Councilmember Parker said, "I was just pointing out what I think you said. I understood that, as well, but I thought that there had been some things done that sort of went against the Heritage Act with monument removal and things like that."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Not according to the Attorney General."

Councilmember Parker said, "Okay."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes. Alright. A roll call vote, please."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregg."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shealy."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Sakran."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Mitchell."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Brady."

Councilmember Brady said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Waring."

Councilmember Waring said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Seekings."

Councilmember Seekings said, "What number are we on?"

There was laughter in the Chamber.

The Clerk said, "Five."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Bowden."

Councilmember Bowden said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Appel."

Councilmember Appel said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Mayor Tecklenburg."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "The motion fails."

On a motion of Councilmember Parker, seconded by Councilmember Gregg, City Council considered agenda Item L1(b) 5 as presented:

Add a New Subsection to Sec. 2-208 to Read: The Commission shall not advance nor facilitate in any manner policies or recommendations which end cash bail.

The motion failed 10 to 3. The vote was not unanimous. Councilmembers Gregg, Shealy, and Parker voted in favor of the motion.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Do we have a motion to approve [Amendment #6?](#)"

Councilmember Parker said, "Motion to approve Amendment #6, please."

Councilmember Brady said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "And a second. Any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We'll have a roll call vote, please."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregg."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shealy."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Sakran."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Mitchell."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Brady."

Councilmember Brady said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Waring."

Councilmember Waring said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Seekings."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Bowden."

Councilmember Bowden said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Appel."

Councilmember Appel said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Mayor Tecklenburg."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "The motion fails."

On a motion of Councilmember Parker, seconded by Councilmember Brady, City Council considered agenda Item L1(b) 6 as presented:

Add a New Subsection to Sec. 2-208 to Read: The Commission shall not advance nor facilitate in any manner policies or recommendations which reallocate resources from our police.

The motion failed 7 to 6. The vote was not unanimous. Councilmembers Gregg, Shealy, Brady, Seekings, Appel, and Parker voted in favor of the motion.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Do we have a motion to approve [Amendment #7?](#) I don't hear a motion."

Councilmember Parker said, "A motion to approve Amendment #7."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "You all speak right up. Do we have a second?"

Councilmember Waring said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We'll have a roll call vote please."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregg."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shealy."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Sakran."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Mitchell."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Brady."

Councilmember Brady said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Waring."

Councilmember Waring said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Seekings."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Bowden."

Councilmember Bowden said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Appel."

Councilmember Appel said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Mayor Tecklenburg."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "The motion fails."

On a motion of Councilmember Parker, seconded by Councilmember Waring, City Council considered agenda Item L1(b) 7 as presented:

Add a New Subsection to Sec. 2-208 to Read: The Commission shall not advance nor facilitate in any manner policies or recommendations which support, facilitate, or consider historical monument removal.

The motion failed 8 to 5. The vote was not unanimous. Councilmembers Gregg, Shealy, Seekings, Appel, and Parker voted in favor of the motion.

Councilmember Brady said, "Mr. Mayor, I just wanted to explain my vote on that one. I believe that it was covered in a previous amendment asking City Council to do that."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Brady.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, sir. You want to have the floor for a minute?"

Councilmember Brady said, "I do. I was just going to explain my vote on that one, that I believe that it was covered in a previous amendment."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay. Great. Thank you. Do we have a motion to approve [Amendment #8?](#)"

Councilmember Parker said, "Motion to approve Amendment #8."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Do we have a second?"

Councilmember Gregg said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Madam Clerk, please give us a roll call vote."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregg."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shealy."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Sakran."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Mitchell."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Brady."

Councilmember Brady said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Waring."

Councilmember Waring said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Seekings."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Bowden."

Councilmember Bowden said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Appel."

Councilmember Appel said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Mayor Tecklenburg."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "The motion fails."

On a motion of Councilmember Parker, seconded by Councilmember Waring, City Council considered agenda Item L1(b) 8 as presented:

Add a New Subsection to Sec. 2-208 to Read: The Commission shall not advance nor facilitate in any manner policies or recommendations which discriminate based on race.

The motion failed 8 to 5. The vote was not unanimous. Councilmembers Gregg, Seekings, Shahid, Appel, and Parker voted in favor of the motion.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Do we have a motion to approve [Amendment #9?](#)"

Councilmember Parker said, "Motion to approve Amendment #9."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Do we have a second?"

Councilmember Shealy said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Discussion?"

Councilmember Parker said, "Yes."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Parker.

Councilmember Parker said, "Again, I notice on votes, yours in particular, Mr. Mayor--"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Speak right into the microphone."

Councilmember Parker said, "Your vote in particular with reparations, reallocating resources from the police, I know we stated in a previous meeting, yourself and other Councilmembers, you know, made mention that we cannot do those things on Council. So, I just ask if we've already discussed that, and folks have already expressed, you yourself, that we would not take away money from the police, you have increased their budget, do you have any comments on that because why would you not support that?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "This is your time."

Councilmember Parker said, "That's it. I'm done."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Any other discussion?"

Councilmember Gregg said, "I have a question."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregg.

Councilmember Gregg said, "Yes, sir. If Amendments #3 through #8 had passed, then #9 would, I assume, be somewhat redundant. That's a question to Ms. Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "Yes, it just puts them all into one, yes."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Any other discussion or questions? And we're voting on Amendment #9, correct?"

The Clerk said, "Yes."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes. Alright. We'll have a roll call vote."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregg."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shealy."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Sakran."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Mitchell."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Brady."

Councilmember Brady said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Waring."

Councilmember Waring said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Seekings."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Bowden."

Councilmember Bowden said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Appel."

Councilmember Appel said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Mayor Tecklenburg."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "The motion fails."

On a motion of Councilmember Parker, seconded by Councilmember Shealy, City Council considered agenda Item L1(b) 9 as presented:

Add a New Subsection to Sec. 2-208 to Read: All recommendations in the August 2021 report of the Special Commission on Equity, Inclusion, and Racial Conciliation which support ending cash bail, reallocating resources from the police, historical monument removal, Critical Race Theory, and reparations are hereby abrogated and removed from consideration by the standing committees.

The motion failed 10 to 3. The vote was not unanimous. Councilmembers Gregg, Shealy, and Parker voted in favor of the motion.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Do we have a motion to approve [Amendment #10?](#)"

Councilmember Parker said, "Motion to approve Amendment #10."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Do we have a second?"

Councilmember Gregg said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Any discussion or questions?"

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Hearing none, we'll have a roll call vote."

Councilmember Parker said, "I have discussion. I'm sorry."

Councilmember Seekings said, "I have a question. I'm interested to hear on sort of what the--"

The Clerk said, "Councilmember, can you speak into your mic, please? Thank you."

Councilmember Seekings said, "I'm sorry. This one is a little confusing to me. The purview of the Commission is to include only those within the jurisdiction of the City Council. I'm not sure I understand what that really means."

Councilmember Parker said, "Sure. Yes. Part of the Commission Report did include putting, you know, teaching CRT in our schools and, again, at a previous Council meeting both our Mayor and multiple Councilmembers said that we do not have that authority to teach, to do that, so I'm strictly putting the boundary there in the amendment."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, I would just point out to Council that we have Commissions that focus on various areas, other than the one we're considering tonight, for example, the Commission on Women, that you've just been appointed to. The purpose, I read from our ordinance from 2019, 'the purpose of the City of Charleston's Commission on Women is to work to eliminate barriers and reduce gender-based inequalities to assure the full opportunity of economic, educational, and social health, legal and political equality for the women of Charleston.' So, it is common, if we form a Commission, to give them the right, for it to have free speech anyway, to discuss a broad range of topics that applies to the goal, so I just thought I'd share that."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings.

Councilmember Seekings said, "Thank you. I'd like to point out two other Committees that do the same thing, the Bike/Ped Committee, which has been an incredible advocate for things all around the County and the State and the Sustainability Advisory Committee. So, I just think we need to be careful about limiting things and saying we're going to limit our Commissions, that's no secret, but if it's going to go through, it ought to be doing its --"

Councilmember Parker said, "Mayor, may I respond?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Parker.

Councilmember Parker said, "Again, we had a discussion in Council, you know. Specifically, we heard from a lot of people, a lot of constituents, that said they do not want CRT in schools, so that was a big topic, right? We heard that over, and over, and over again. So, again, I think that is the big reason it's there, is that it's just removing that option from even being discussed. We don't have the authority to do that anyways, so that's why it's there."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Understood."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Sakran.

Councilmember Sakran said, "Just for the record, for anyone who is listening at home, CRT is not taught in our public schools. I work for the public school system. That's a fact. I'm not sure if you want to deal with facts, but it's not taught in our public schools in Charleston County. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you for that information."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings.

Councilmember Parker said, "Yes, but the report mentions it, Councilmember Sakran."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Out of order. Would anyone else who hadn't spoken yet on this matter like to be recognized?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregg.

Councilmember Gregg said, "Representing District #1, which also falls in Berkeley County, I would also like to note that CRT is not taught in Berkeley County public schools either. I do want to clarify that."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, we've established a fact here tonight, that nowhere in the City of Charleston in public schools is critical race theory being taught. Alright."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Parker.

Councilmember Parker said, "Again, everybody laughs, but it was mentioned in the Commission Report. Am I misunderstanding the report?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We're not--"

Councilmember Parker said, "It was a point made in the Commission Report."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregorie.

Councilmember Gregorie said, "We continually talk about a report, number one, that was not accepted by this body. Number two, we continue to talk about recommendations which were a part of the report not accepted by Council. I just don't know why we continue to go back to something when it's really not on the table at all. Restricting thought is a bit shortsighted, and I really think that any Commission that we develop should have the freedom to discuss any issues. We've also got to remember, though, the bottom line rests with Council. A Commission can talk about anything they want to talk about, but when those recommendations come before this body, this body then makes the decision, not the Commission. I think that that needs to be clear because I think what we're doing here is we're giving a Commission more power than it has. We really are. I think we need to just sort of move on with voting up or down on the recommendation, but I think we need to be fact-based, and I don't think that we are all of the time."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings.

Councilmember Seekings said, "And finally, just a matter of procedure, we've gone through these amendments one-by-one, which is the right thing to do. I think Amendment #3 deals with that. I think this amendment is a little bit different and broader, and I just wanted to explain that in advance for when I vote on this. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Any other questions or discussion?"

No one else asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Madam Clerk, if you will give us a roll call."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregg."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shealy."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Sakran."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Mitchell."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Brady."

Councilmember Brady said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Waring."

Councilmember Waring said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Seekings."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Bowden."

Councilmember Bowden said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Appel."

Councilmember Appel said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Mayor Tecklenburg."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "The motion fails."

On a motion of Councilmember Parker, seconded by Councilmember Gregg, City Council considered agenda Item L1(b) 10 as presented:

Add New Subsection to Sec. 2-208 to Read: The purview of the Commission shall include only those areas within the jurisdiction of City Council.

The motion failed 12 to 1. The vote was not unanimous. Councilmember Parker voted in favor of the motion.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Do we have a motion to approve [Amendment #11?](#)"

Councilmember Parker said, "Motion to approve Amendment #11."

Councilmember Brady said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a second. Any questions or discussion?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregg.

Councilmember Gregg said, "Do we have an opinion from Legal as to whether, it doesn't seem like this would be legal. You're excluding people from serving on a Commission."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg called for order.

Councilmember Gregg said, "I'm asking as to the legality of that."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I could call on our Counsel to opine on that. Please come to the microphone."

Wilbur Johnson said, "Councilmember, I don't see anything illegal about or extrajudicial about that proposed amendment. As a practical matter, it may not work, but it doesn't strike me, from a legal standpoint, as illegal."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you. Any other questions or discussion?"

No one else asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Madam Clerk, would you please call the roll?"

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregg."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shealy."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Sakran."

Councilmember Sakran said, "I'm so confused with these numbers. So, this is Amendment #11?"

The Clerk said, "Yes."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Excluding former Commission members."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Mitchell."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Brady."

Councilmember Brady said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Waring."

Councilmember Waring said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Seekings."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Bowden."

Councilmember Bowden said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Appel."

Councilmember Appel said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Mayor Tecklenburg."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "The motion fails."

On a motion of Councilmember Parker, seconded by Councilmember Brady, City Council considered agenda Item L1(b) 11 as presented:

Amend Sec. 2-209(a) to add the following language: Appointees to the Commission or its subcommittees, shall not have previously been appointed to the Special Commission on Equity, Inclusion, and Racial Conciliation or any of its subcommittees. The foregoing requirement shall not apply to elected members of council.

The motion failed 12 to 1. The vote was not unanimous. Councilmember Parker voted in favor of the motion.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Motion to approve [Amendment #12.](#)"

Councilmember Parker said, "Motion to approve Amendment #12."

Councilmember Appel said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Second, and any questions or discussion?"

Councilmember Shahid said, "Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shahid.

Councilmember Shahid said, "I find that this has been one of the amendments that bothered me the most that was presented, and I'm going to call on Councilmember Waring to help me out on this one a little bit. Not too long ago we had a very spirited discussion about the Planning Commission and the ability to override a Planning Commission supported by a two-thirds majority of Council, 35%, and Councilmember Waring sort of carried the banter on that. I, initially, was not on board with that because I had a different feeling as to the purpose and the origin of that. This amendment, if it is proposed, is, in and of itself, discrimination. I want you to think about that for a few seconds. There is no other Commission, Committee, Board that has this kind of requirement, and we're talking about a Commission to look into racial inequality, racial discrimination. Now, we're called upon to have a Commission, as proposed by this amendment, that has the support of at least two-thirds of a majority of members on the Commission. I thought about that for a while, and it threw my mind a little bit. I said why would you want to set aside and create a different class of folks to vote on a Commission report which, in and of itself, is discrimination? I've seen all of the text messages that were circulated today calling on the so-called Parker amendments and opposing the so-called 'fake' Shahid amendments. That doesn't bother me at all, how they want to classify those, par for the course of the campaign to prevent or dismiss information. After this last amendment is discussed, we're going to then vote on the Commission itself, but when I saw this, it just reaffirmed for me the absolute need for this Commission because it just reaffirmed that we are still grappling with this issue of, not just equity, but equality. Why would we add an extra burden, a supermajority vote, for the Commission members to approve any recommendations? Why are we creating a separate class to do that? What is the purpose of that? I mean, I can read, and she says, 'these changes will provide clarity for the public and foster a greater or broader support for this Commission and its mission.' How does it do that? What it does do though, however, is send a very powerful message that when it comes to racial conciliation and racial equality, we're going to make it harder to come up with a recommendation, and that is pro se discriminatory."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Per se discriminatory."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Per se discriminatory. My lawyer had to correct me."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg called for order.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Order. Thank you. Any other questions or comments?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. I don't think I could have addressed that better than you did, but while I sat and I listened to the comments over the months on this, in particular tonight, I thought about the 1787 compromise where the Constitution came together, and they were trying to figure out votes. You had this big population

of slaves in the south and, obviously, white elected officials wanted to enhance their position in the House of Representatives in our Congress. Learned people figured out that in this compromise you would count 3/5th of every African American. Now, they couldn't vote, but for you to be able to get a seat in Congress, we're going to count them for that. Then, we came along with the Dred Scott Decision, which said a freed African American, and he's already bought himself out of slavery, was not a citizen. Learned people on the Supreme Court came up with that, and I'm sure they articulated their reasons why. They were wrong, but it was very articulate. Plessy v. Ferguson, learned people on the Supreme Court came forward and said separate was equal. Now, they didn't send any of their kids to the dilapidated education facilities, but learned people, these were not ignorant people, said that separate was equal in this United States. Now, today, we know that's not the case. Thank God for Brown v. Board of Education.

Then I thought about, when I was 12 years old, we integrated St. Andrews Junior High School right here in West Ashley. When integration took place, you had kids from first grade, my sister was the first African American child to integrate Orange Grove School. That's right. As a six year old, she got egged by older kids waiting for my mother to come and pick her up. That happened in 1967. So, see, some of this discrimination that we're talking about, we're not talking about 300 years ago, we're not talking about 400 years ago. There were learned people that came up with that. As a 12 year old, I went to St. Andrews Junior High, and they were just contingent on the corner of Boone Hall Road and William Kennerty Drive. They were shouting at the top of their lungs, and they used the N-word, to go home. This school had 1,100 kids in it. The majority of those kids in there in that school, I see some of them today. They're grandparents, just like I am, and we're friends as a result of that experience. The loud voices that shouted obscenities for us to go home were not the majority. So, I thought about a lot of the people that do not want this Commission to begin, and I heard about the petition of 1,400, 600, and 700. We have 150,000 citizens in the City of Charleston. It is a vocal minority.

When I went up to the University of South Carolina in the '70s, Wilbur Johnson was in law school, and I was an undergraduate at the time. He can attest to this. In the early '70s, Carolina wasn't the campus that it is today. They didn't have any orientation for us, there were flat-out professors that the only reason, they made it clear, that you were in that classroom is because the law said you could be, not because they wanted you. Now, I fast-forward a generation, and my children have since gone on to the University of South Carolina, and their experience was entirely different from me. They feel that Gamecock spirit. I felt relief getting out of there, not because I didn't have good grades, but from the stress of going to a class in college, and the professor doesn't want you to even be seated in the class. That's the experience that stays with you for the rest of your life, but what corrects that is when your children go, and their experience was positive. You don't teach that negative experience to your children. I've lived long enough now that my grandson has graduated from Carolina Engineering and I, along with my son and his son, three generations of Waring men, went to an African American orientation for African American families when that grandson entered as a freshman, and since now, graduating and working up at SPAWAR.

So, when I hear these people come up and want to restrict what we can talk about, I wondered how societies like Nazi Germany can do what they do to a wonderful people like the Jewish people. Did they have freedom of speech? Did they have limited speech? The society limited it. Did the slaves have freedom of speech?"

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Enslaved."

Councilmember Waring said, "Did the enslaved, thank you, have freedom of speech? No. Did we have freedom of speech during Jim Crow? We did not. We couldn't even drink from the same water fountain. So, when I hear people coming up saying all kind of strategies to limit what people can speak about in America, we have the Constitutional right for that, and if they spoke of the forbidden word 'critical race theory' what are the penalties? Is it death? Is it 20 years? Is it life in prison? How are we, on City Council, going to enforce when an American invokes a Constitutional right? The reason I spoke about taking these amendments one at a time, yes, our Robert's Rules of Order, we could have done this in blanket and saved a lot of time, but Ms. Parker has the right to be heard on those issues, and I will fight to support for Americans right to speak and be heard. I don't necessarily have to agree with them, but they have the right to be heard. So, thank you, Councilmember, for bringing that up. I appreciate the time that you all have allotted, but in one lifetime I have gone from, we couldn't even go to the bathroom, guys. We had to go to the bathroom after the change of class. Once everybody got seated, you raised your hand and asked the teacher to go to the restroom. You know why? If you did it during the change of class, you would get ganged in the bathroom, trying to get an education as a 12-year old. So, when we talk about limiting people's freedom of speech, I will never be for that. Thank you for the time that you have allotted."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, kindly. Any further questions or comments?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Parker.

Councilmember Parker said, "Yes, and Councilmember Waring, thank you. I appreciate that, and thank you for sharing that story. Mr. Shahid, just so you know, I don't want the, it was never meant to be discriminatory. Again, Rules of Order, the way I understand it, some Council votes are 2/3rd majority, right? So, it was just some votes need 2/3rd. It wasn't meant to be discriminatory. I'm sorry you take it that way, but I guess that's just the way I wrote it."

Councilmember Shahid said, "You have the right to withdraw the amendment, if you wish to do that."

Councilmember Parker said, "No, I'm okay with voting for it."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Any further comments?"

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregorie.

Councilmember Gregorie said, "This is the last comment. If [Inaudible] is impact regardless of intent, there are a lot of things that happened, and they weren't intentional, but the impact was discriminatory and deadly to certain populations, including women. So, intentions are fine, but I think when we think about things, we need to take it a little further and determine the impact that it might have on a protected class, including women. So, I think we need to be clear, it may not be the intention, but it's the impacts."

Councilmember Parker said, "Okay."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Any further comments or questions?"

No one else asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Madam Clerk, would you give us a roll call vote?"

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregg."

Councilmember Gregg said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shealy."

Councilmember Shealy said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Sakran."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Mitchell."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Brady."

Councilmember Brady said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Waring."

Councilmember Waring said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Seekings."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Bowden."

Councilmember Bowden said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Appel."

Councilmember Appel said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Mayor Tecklenburg."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "The motion fails."

On a motion of Councilmember Parker, seconded by Councilmember Appel, City Council voted to consider agenda Item L1(b) 12 as presented:

For the Commission to make a recommendation, a proposal must have the support of at least a two-thirds majority of all members of the Commission.

The motion failed 12 to 1. The vote was not unanimous. Councilmember Parker voted in favor of the motion.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Now, can I entertain a motion to create a standing [Human Affairs and Racial Conciliation Commission](#) in the City of Charleston, as amended, with the amendments of L1 through 8?"

Councilmember Shahid said, "So moved."

Councilmember Sakran said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Any further discussion?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregg.

Councilmember Gregg said, "Yes, sir. I'm going to vote 'no,' but I wanted to explain my vote quickly."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, sir."

Councilmember Gregg said, "I know that all of us in this room want the best for our City. We, unfortunately, just disagree on some of the means and methods by which we do that. I read through the initial report and felt like there were some very good recommendations in that report that we could take action on right now and believe that's what we should be spending our time on, is taking the recommendations from that report and taking action on them. I believe that this Commission is just delaying some of the actionable things that we need to be doing to improve these communities and these people that we're trying to help, so I'm going to vote 'no'. I would like to also speak to Amendments #3 through #8. I didn't read that as a restriction on free speech. I just read that as the Commission wouldn't be allowed to produce policy which discussed these things. So, that's where I stand on the issue, and I just wanted to put that out there before."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, sir. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Mitchell.

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Mr. Mayor and colleagues, I wasn't going to say anything because I'm still under the weather and not feeling well, but when we address things like when we are addressing people, please, for God's sake, please do not mention people as 'these

people' or 'those people.' I came a long way. I think I'm about the only person in here, besides Councilmember Waring, that goes back from the Civil Rights time. I was arrested 25 times, 14 years old, making a difference in this community, in the City of Charleston, right here in the City of Charleston. Got all of the rotten eggs thrown on me, got all of the urine out of people's bathrooms thrown on me, calling me all types of names, and marching up and down these streets, not only African American, but also my White counterparts were getting the same treatment I got because they were calling them N-persons for being with us. This was right back there in the '60s. It wasn't that long ago. In '69, even when Martin Luther King was there, I marched here with him, his wife, and Abernathy, and all in the Civil Rights Movement making a difference right here in Charleston.

On King Street, as I talk to Councilmember Shahid and Councilmember Appel, I worked at those stores that their grandparents owned and their families owned on King Street. In every store on King Street I worked as a tailor, and I went to Burke School, which was an industrialized school with a lot of trades, which they don't have anymore. These are the things that we had to help young people in the community to be productive. They took all of that away out of the schools, out of Burke. They call it at Burke School, but it's not at Burke School insofar as I'm concerned. So, people are sitting here and talking about these things. They're talking about a lot of things, but they don't even know what people went through in the City of Charleston, what young people went through in the City of Charleston, what even my kids are going through in the City of Charleston right now and why they moved out of the City of Charleston. I left here and went to New York University and came back. Oh, yes, I had a good education. One of the prestigious colleges in the United States, that's where I went, and then I became a Councilman and came back here to my hometown, worked with HUD with Councilmember Gregorie, who ran the HUD office for eight years. He was the best at the HUD office, was my supervisor and came out of Burke like I did, but I worked under him.

We, as a people, what are we afraid of? What have we, as people of color, gone through in this City of Charleston all of those years? People are coming up and saying, 'Oh, well this is that, you don't want this, you want that, we're not going to put that in place.' What are they afraid of? We did a whole lot. The City of Charleston played a big part in slavery. Go and read the history. If the slave master could not take care of their slave or give them the punishment they had, who did it? The City of Charleston. We worked them to death. We beat them. The Mayor stood up there, right there on the podium, and read all of that, some of that information I didn't even know, read about it. I was here in this City of Charleston always to bring people together.

I've got a very diverse district, anyone will tell you. I work in my district. I don't have really big problems in my district because I work with them, but people sit here and play the games or the mind games and they said, 'Oh, yes, we are for everyone,' lip service, but not deep down in their heart. I'm a person that believes strictly and everybody knows that about me. Strictly, I believe in God, and that's my thing. Some people say they believe in God, but I don't know what God they believe in. My thing is the most high. Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob, that's what I believe. That's my belief, and I carry myself that way. Anybody in the community will tell you. I'm in the streets at 2:00 in the mornings in my district. A lot of my colleagues don't have to do those things, and I talk and educate, that's what it's about to me. When I hear things on this Council, and I see all of those e-mails coming to me through my phone, and the e-mails telling me this and that and calling people by their name, it disgusts me because everybody who is doing this are not people that look like me, but they said we're going to work together, but they say there's no racism here in the City of Charleston. Where are they coming from? What are they looking at? These things, James Island, Johns Island, my family goes back 400 years to Johns Island even with people on Seabrook Island. James Island, my family goes back 200 years on James

Island, the whole area, so I know those areas. So, when I hear these things coming up in City Council with all of these people writing coming from Mt. Pleasant, coming from Charlotte, North Carolina, coming from Raleigh, North Carolina, Aiken, South Carolina telling me what to do in the City of Charleston, they do not know what's going on in the City of Charleston because they're not from here. So don't come and tell me what to do in my City. Go in your city and take care of what's going on there because you have a lot of problems in North Carolina, you've got a lot of problems in Aiken, South Carolina. I know that as a fact from traveling there. I travel a lot.

So, this is what I'm saying on this Council, we have to stop it. We make the hard decisions, and I made this statement at the last Council meeting. If you are afraid because of your constituents telling you to do thus and so, you need to get out of here. That goes for me, too. I wasn't sitting here for 16 years, almost 20 years for nothing. My constituents know what I'm all about. I'm not into that foolish game at all, and you'll see what you get. That's me, and I work with everyone. So, that's all I have to say, and I came here especially tonight because I was supposed to stay home. I wasn't going to even be here, but I wanted to come here tonight just to listen to the dialogue so I could be in it.

We have to be about our business. We have to make sure that when we get these agendas, that we're prepared when we come to this Council meeting and reading through these agendas. We've got to be prepared as City Councilmembers, go and learn what type of government that we are under right here in the City of Charleston. Home Rule sets what we can do and what we can't do. Know these things. Like I said, look, check the credentials on the City website and see the classes that I attend, and that's not all of them. I'm a graduate of the Municipal School of Elected Officials. New Councilmembers, I love you to death, but sometime just go and start reading and also attend, first timers, so you can learn what the Council is all about, what elected local officials are all about, and not using to talk about it here because it doesn't work. If you can't get your colleagues here to vote with you, you're going to hurt your constituents and yourself. That's what it takes, seven votes in here to approve, to pass, seven votes. So, this is what I'm saying to you all. We have to be about our business and work together. The foolishness, I always tell all of my colleagues, you will know, political, I don't care whether you're democrat, republican, independent, it doesn't matter to me. Leave that outside the door in the hall when you come here, Councilmembers, because we are dealing with everyone in the City of Charleston. Leave your political preference out of the way. It doesn't matter to me with those things because all of my friends are all. I have all. That's all I want to say, Mr. Mayor. I'm sorry to bore you all down, but I just had to get this off of my chest because it's really bothering me and all of my friends, I've got friends in all political parties. They'll tell you, I get along with everyone. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, Councilmember."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Thank you, Mayor. I'll be brief. I just thought of something. To be clear, they're enslaved people, they're not slaves. Councilmember Gregg, I understand. Believe it or not, when you use terms like 'those people,' I understand what you meant, trust me, but I'm just saying in the future, when you use those kinds of terms, it kind of lights a little fire in people."

Councilmember Gregg said, "I apologize."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "It's not a problem. And the last thing is, and I think you asked a legitimate question when you said if we are in fact implementing some of the recommendations because, as you read them, you thought that some of them were very, very good. I agree with you totally, but without us codifying HARCC, it could be removed with the stroke of a pen. The recommendations that are being worked on now, a stroke of a pen, but at least if it's codified, it will require action from this body, so that's why it's important for us to establish HARCC so that it can be codified and statutory."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shahid.

Councilmember Shahid said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor and members of Council. The preamble to this ordinance that we're ready to give third and final reading to makes reference to a report called 'The State of Racial Disparities Charleston County, South Carolina 2000 to 2015.' In the Executive Summary of this report, I want to read this one line to us 'The data gathered here illuminates the social and economic conditions disproportionately impacting the County's Black population, particularly in the wake of rapid gentrification that is pricing out long-time Black residents in the downtown Peninsula.' Some of the highlights to illuminate those disparities included the following. I'm just going to pick a few of them. 'There is a growing gap between high earners and low earners within Charleston County. The economic gulf between Black and White residents that was present 50 years ago has not disappeared. Black people in Charleston County earn 60% of what their White counterparts make. While unemployment rates in Charleston County have declined since 2008, the Black unemployment rate remains more than double the White unemployment rate. There are more Black and Hispanic Charleston residents living in poverty than White residents. Fifty percent of the Black population has low or no access to healthy foods. The Black population experiences greater poverty than other racial and ethnic groups in Charleston County. Forty-two percent of Black children under the age of 18 are living below the poverty line compared to 11% of White children. Access to healthcare services affect healthy outcomes. Black people experience the greatest obstacles to healthcare access. A large percentage of Black Charlestonians lack health insurance or a regular source of care and are unable to afford health services. The Black population in Charleston experiences poor health for a wide range of health indicators than any other racial ethnic groups in the region.'

If we do anything tonight, we have the opportunity, by coincidence, this is Black History Month, Mr. Harris brought that up earlier tonight, we have an opportunity tonight to be unanimous. We have an opportunity tonight for 13 voices to come together and support what I just said is a great disparity in our community. You can't deny these facts. You can't ignore these facts. If you want to be serious about addressing disparity in our community, if you want to take to heart the issues that have the greatest impact of destroying this community, every one of us, 13 of us, have the opportunity to stand up and be counted to say, 'I want to be part of the solution.' Whether you do that tonight is your own vote, I will respect it, but in the spirit of unanimity, in the spirit of coming together, in the spirit of turning back these voices, who, for no other reason, want to see this Commission fail. No matter what we do, no matter how many times we meet, no matter how many times we take into consideration their objections, they want this thing to fail. Why? I don't want to know the answer to that question, but it disgusts me, and I'm outraged by that, but tonight, being Black History Month, we have an opportunity to come with one voice."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, sir."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Appel.

Councilmember Appel said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. You know, I've said at various points during this process that I support a Commission, and I was regrettably voting 'no' because I wanted to see some additional improvements made. Guys, I just can't tell you how proud I am of everybody that I serve with on this Council. I mean, Lord knows how many conversations and meetings we've had to work through all of these issues. I think my colleague, Councilman Waring, remarked at one point that democracy is a little bit like childbirth. As someone who has experienced--"

Councilmember Shahid said, "Woah."

Councilmember Appel said, "Not yet. I was going to say I've experienced democracy."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Appel said, "Hang on, hang on. You're right. Sometimes it can be a little difficult to get to where you want to be, but when you get there, there is a beautiful thing at the end of the process, and I could not be more proud than to vote for this Commission tonight and I'm going to do it, as amended, with Councilmember Shahid's amendments. I hope that, you know, I think that asking for 13 is a very aspirational goal. I certainly want it to be more than the slimmest of the majority because I want this to be a statement, that this Commission is going to be in a spirit of as much unity as possible, because the Commission's going to need our back once it gets started so that their work can actually be effective, and I hope that we're in a position to do that.

So, the Commission's going to pass tonight, based upon how I'm reading the room, and I hope it's with as much support as we can get, but I just want to say one thing, and I want to piggy-back on something Councilman Gregg mentioned because I think it's very astute. If we were to pass the Commission tonight, even with a two-digit plurality, it would be wrong for us to just declare victory. The work is not over. It is just beginning, and Councilmember Gregg made a wonderful point. We've got to do our job as legislators. The Commission, the first iteration and this new iteration, they're going to be giving us stuff to chew on. Now, some of it we're not going to want to keep in our mouth too long, other stuff is going to be common sense and things that we ought to be working on, but it's our job to push those things forward. It's our job, for those of us around this table that serve as Committee chairs, to advocate for these measures to be put on the agendas. All of this great work we did to get this Commission Ordinance established, let's consider that training for how we're going to legislate amongst peers moving forward. Let's come up with an idea, let's put it on paper, let's meet with each other, let's talk to each other, let's not just throw an ordinance out on an e-mail without talking to anybody. That's not how legislation works, that's not how democracy works.

So, I want to challenge everybody that after this Commission passes this evening that we go through the report, we identify some things that we like, and let's pick up the ball and run with it. Because at the end of the day, no Commission in the world is going to address the undeniable realities that Councilman Shahid alluded to or that Councilman Waring spoke so beautifully about, and of course, Councilman Gregorie and Councilman Mitchell. It's going to take us acting and sometimes we're going to need to collaborate with our partners, but there is a lot of stuff that we can do in the City of Charleston, and I'm going to go without mentioning zoning. This is a humongous area of low hanging fruit that we have before us, and I would love

nothing more than to see the City of Charleston become a national leader and a national model on zoning reform, unwinding some of the discriminatory structures that are set into place in some of our land use policies, so we can truly become an affordable housing mecca, that we can become a diverse community, and that we can begin to right the wrongs of the past. So, with that being said, I look forward to voting for this tonight and getting started working hard tomorrow on moving some of these important initiatives forward to become law. Thank you.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Thank you.”

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Brady.

Councilmember Brady said, “I’m not going to belabor the point, but Winston Churchill once said, ‘that a camel is a horse made by a committee,’ and I’d like to thank all of the Councilmembers and members of the public who gave us their opinions for helping us make this the best camel that it could be. A lot of us would have rather had a thoroughbred racehorse, and I don’t blame people that wanted their own version of the thoroughbred, but camels can lead you through the desert wilderness, and can get you to water, and can get you out of the desert, and I think that’s what this camel is going to do. This Commission will help us do that, and I want to thank everybody for their opinions tonight, and for weighing in, and their consideration and help in getting this camel forward. Thank you.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Thank you. Would anyone else like to be heard?”

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Sakran.

Councilmember Sakran said, “Thank you. My mic never works. I just want to thank the Special Commission members. This process has created a situation where a lot of them have been vilified, the recommendations have been vilified, so I just want to be very clear and on the record tonight I thank you all for your service to the City, I thank you all for sticking with us and being here. I’m looking out tonight and many of you are here in the room. That’s perseverance, that’s dedication, and it’s true love for our City. I’m not going to talk about platitudes, it’s about you all tonight. So, thank you for being here and thank you for your service to our great City. Thank you.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “I repeat that thanks, and I just want to include in that list Amber Johnson, our staff person, who has worked so diligently on this effort all along. So, Madam Clerk, would you please call the roll for a vote?”

The Clerk said, “Councilmember Gregg.”

Councilmember Gregg said, “Nay.”

The Clerk said, “Councilmember Shealy.”

Councilmember Shealy said, “Nay.”

The Clerk said, “Councilmember Sakran.”

Councilmember Sakran said, “Yes.”

The Clerk said, “Councilmember Mitchell.”

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Brady."

Councilmember Brady said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Gregorie."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Waring."

Councilmember Waring said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Seekings."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Shahid."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Bowden."

Councilmember Bowden said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Appel."

Councilmember Appel said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Parker."

Councilmember Parker said, "Nay."

The Clerk said, "Mayor Tecklenburg."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Aye."

The Clerk said, "The motion carries."

On a motion of Councilmember Shahid, seconded by Councilmember Sakran, City Council voted to give third reading and ratify to the following bill, as amended:

2022-018 - AN ORDINANCE TO REPEAL AND REPLACE CHAPTER 2 (ADMINISTRATION), ARTICLE IV (BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS), DIVISION 11 (SPECIAL COMMISSION ON EQUITY, INCLUSION, AND RACIAL CONCILIATION) OF THE CODE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON AND ADOPT A NEW DIVISION 11, SECTIONS 2-206 THROUGH 2-210, CREATING A STANDING "HUMAN AFFAIRS AND RACIAL CONCILIATION COMMISSION" AND DESCRIBING ITS

PURPOSE, DUTIES, RESPONSIBILITIES, AND ORGANIZATION. (AS AMENDED)

The motion carried 9 to 4. The vote was not unanimous. Councilmembers Gregg, Shealy, Seekings, and Parker voted nay.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Alright. Thank you very much. Next up is our [bills up for second reading.](#)"

Councilmember Brady said, "Move to take 1 through 5 together."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have bills 1 through 5. We're going to take them together. Any questions or comments on 1 through 5?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Brady, one (5) bills (Items M-1 through M-5) received second reading. They passed second reading on motion by Councilmember Shahid and third reading on motion of Councilmember Shealy. On further motion of Councilmember Brady, the rules were suspended, and the bills were immediately ratified as:

- 2022-019 -** AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND THE ZONING ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON BY CHANGING THE ZONE MAP, WHICH IS A PART THEREOF, SO THAT A PORTION OF 2003 CHERRY HILL LANE (PENINSULA) (APPROXIMATELY 0.69 ACRE) (TMS #464-02-00-053) (COUNCIL DISTRICT 4), BE REZONED FROM GENERAL BUSINESS (GB) CLASSIFICATION TO HEAVY INDUSTRIAL (HI) CLASSIFICATION. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY GERALD F MCMAHON.
- 2022-020 -** AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND THE ZONING ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON BY CHANGING THE ZONE MAP, WHICH IS A PART THEREOF, SO THAT A PORTION OF PROPERTY ON ISLAND PARK DRIVE (DANIEL ISLAND) (APPROXIMATELY 0.08 ACRE) (TMS # 271-00-00-001) (COUNCIL DISTRICT 1), BE REZONED FROM DANIEL ISLAND RESIDENTIAL (DI-R) CLASSIFICATION TO DANIEL ISLAND CONSERVATION (DI-C) CLASSIFICATION. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY DANIEL ISLAND GOLF CLUB LLC.
- 2022-021 -** AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND THE ZONING ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON BY CHANGING THE ZONE MAP, WHICH IS A PART THEREOF, SO THAT 326 GEDDES AVENUE (WEST ASHLEY) (APPROXIMATELY 0.45 ACRE) (TMS #350-10-00-138) (COUNCIL DISTRICT 5), ANNEXED INTO THE CITY OF CHARLESTON DECEMBER 7, 2021 (#2021-177), BE ZONED SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL (SR-1) CLASSIFICATION. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY MEGAN ELIZABETH MOORE AND WILLIE TOSH MOORE.
- 2022-022 -** AN ORDINANCE TO AUTHORIZE THE MAYOR TO EXECUTE A PERMANENT RIGHT-OF-WAY AND UTILITY EASEMENT TO THE COMMISSIONERS OF

PUBLIC WORKS AS PART OF THE NEW FORCE MAIN FOR THE CREDIT ONE STADIUM. (TMS NO. 275-00-00-078)

2022-023 - AN ORDINANCE TO PROVIDE FOR THE ANNEXATION OF PROPERTY KNOWN AS 2309 LAZY RIVER DRIVE (0.46 ACRE) (TMS# 310-14-00-017), WEST ASHLEY, CHARLESTON COUNTY, TO THE CITY OF CHARLESTON, SHOWN WITHIN THE AREA ANNEXED UPON A MAP ATTACHED HERETO AND MAKE IT PART OF DISTRICT 11. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY SEEL LIVING TRUST.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next up is [bills for first reading.](#)"

Councilmember Brady said, "Move for approval."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a zoning request. Would someone please make a comment or two just so I can sign these few items here in front of me?"

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Shahid said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Did we get a second on that item?"

Councilmember Shahid said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay. Any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Brady, seconded by Councilmember Shahid, City Council voted unanimously to give first reading to the following bill:

An ordinance to amend the Zoning Ordinance of the City of Charleston by changing the Zone Map, which is a part thereof, so that 265, 275, 277, 279 Huger Street, and 581, 583, 585, 587, 589, 591 Meeting Street (Peninsula) (approximately 3.16 acre) (TMS #463-16-04-018, 054 and 055) (Council District 4), be rezoned from General Business (GB) and Diverse Residential (DR-2) classifications to Mixed-Use/Workforce Housing (MU-1/WH) classification. The properties are owned by City of Charleston Housing Authority.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Councilmembers Parker and Gregg, our protocol says that the Mayor signs these items that we have finally approved while we are still in session, and it always seems to happen right at the end of a meeting, and I need an extra minute or two when everybody is ready to go."

Councilmember Brady said, "As Mayor Pro Tem, would you like me to read the next two announcements? I can certainly do that."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We're done. So, our next meeting will be, item #2 was deferred, our next meeting will be next week, next Tuesday, at 3:00 p.m., a workshop meeting on all of the recent developments with the Coastal Flood Risk Management Study. Is there any further business to come before us tonight?"

No one asked to speak.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Hearing none, we stand adjourned. Thank you very much."

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:46 p.m.

Jennifer B. Cook
Clerk of Council