

COUNCIL CHAMBER

Regular Meeting

January 9, 2018

The forty-sixth meeting of the City Council of Charleston was held this date convening at 5:00 p.m. at City Hall.

A notice of this meeting and an agenda were electronically mailed to the news media January 5, 2018 and appeared in The Post and Courier January 8, 2018 and are made available on the City's website.

PRESENT (13)

The Honorable John J. Tecklenburg, Mayor

Councilmember White	District 1	Councilmember Waring	District 7
Councilmember Williams	District 2	Councilmember Seekings	District 8
Councilmember Lewis	District 3	Councilmember Shahid	District 9
Councilmember Mitchell	District 4	Councilmember Riegel - (<i>arrived 5:07 p.m.</i>)	District 10
Councilmember Wagner	District 5	Councilmember Moody	District 11
Councilmember Gregorie	District 6	Councilmember Wilson	District 12

Mayor Tecklenburg called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m.

The Clerk called the roll.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "If anyone would like to join us, Councilmember Wagner will lead us in an invocation and the Pledge of Allegiance."

Councilmember Wagner opened the meeting with an invocation.

Councilmember Wagner then led City Council in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, I want to welcome all of our guests here tonight. Thank you for coming out for this first of the year meeting and swearing in of new members. I would share with everyone, this may sound obvious, but in the unlikely event that we needed to leave the building, these are our two exits. There is an exit up there for you folks in the balcony, and there is one door over here to the right, but we've all got to go down the stairs from this floor. Do not use the elevator. Then, there is the one stairway out the front door, and we would all meet in the park in the unlikely event we all needed to vacate the building, just to let you know. So, next, I'm going to call on our Clerk to read the Certification of Election Results from last November's election. Madam Clerk."

The Clerk said, "State of South Carolina, County of Charleston, City of Charleston, City of Charleston Election Commission's Certificate as to the result of the Municipal General Election held November 7, 2017. We, the undersigned Commissioners of the City of Charleston Municipal Election Commission, State of South Carolina make and declare the following return of votes cast in the Municipal Election to elect the offices of City Council in Districts #2, #4, #8, and #12, and the Commissioners of Public Works. City Council District #2, Kevin Shealy - 629 and was elected, Rodney Williams - 204, Write-ins - 1. City Council District #4, Robert M. Mitchell uncontested and was elected. City Council District #6, Amy Brennan - 411, William Dudley Gregorie - 410, Write-in - 7. City Council District #8, Michael S. Seekings uncontested and was elected. City Council District #10, Harry Joseph Griffin - 403, Summer Massey - 440, Dean C. Riegel - 174. City Council District #12, Carol Jackson - 777 and was elected, Kathleen G. Wilson - 566, Write-in - 3. Commissioners of Public Works - Thomas B. Pritchard uncontested and was elected. General Bond Referendum, Charleston, in favor of the question - 6,050, opposed the question - 2,561.

Certification of the November 19, 2017 Municipal Run-off Election. We, the undersigned Commissioners of the City of Charleston Municipal Election Commission, being duly appointed, hereby certify the following as results of the November 21, 2017 Municipal General Election Run-off to elect the offices of City Council Districts #6 and #10, as set forth below from the attached official results tally sheet. City Council District #6, Amy Brennan - 452, William Dudley Gregorie - 483 and was elected. City Council District #10, Harry Joseph Griffin-446 and was elected, Summer Massey - 347.

These are the results signed by the Municipal Election Commission, Eli A. Poliakoff, Chairman, Truett Nettles, Commissioner, and Cecelia Rogers, Commissioner.

Councilmember Riegel arrived to the Chamber at 5:07 p.m.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, Madam Clerk. Now, I think just prior to swearing in our re-elected and new City Councilmembers, I want to, one at a time, recognize our departing Councilmembers and recognize their service in Council District order, I guess. If I could ask Councilmember Rodney Williams to come forward first. Rodney has served as a Councilmember for four years and chaired the Public Works Committee and has been the Vice-Chair of the Recreation Committee and a member of the License Committee. It has been a pleasure over the last two years that I've been Mayor to work with Councilmember Williams in our efforts to improve our citizens' quality of life. He has remained dedicated to this end and never shied away from confronting our areas challenges, including drainage and transportation. I want to thank Councilmember Williams for his dedication in serving on Council, including his work on the History Commission, which we're going to take up some of their work tonight with the comments about the Calhoun monument, and for his willingness to collaborate with his Councilmembers to make Charleston the best place it can be. So, Rodney, we have a plaque for you commemorating your distinguished service rendered to the City of Charleston from 2014 - 2018."

Councilmember Williams said, "Thank you very much."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you very much."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Councilmember Williams said, "Mr. Mayor and Council, thank you. I have been humbled to serve for the past four years and I'm proud of my efforts to give the best constituent service in District #2. We have made progress, the West Ashley Revitalization Commission, the Waring Senior Citizens Center, \$76 million spent on projects in West Ashley, the Church Creek Basin, the Resiliency Department, and a new Harris Teeter soon to be coming into West Ashley Circle. Our number one issue, in my opinion, is the flooding in the entire City. I challenge all new members of City Council to work as a united city to solve this problem and other issues. To the greatest staff in America, thank you. Mr. Mayor, members of Council, it has been a pleasure to work with you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "God Bless."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Councilmember Riegel, you made it just in time, sir. So, Councilmember Dean Riegel has served on Council for eight years representing District #10. He served as Mayor Pro Tem in 2012, has chaired the Human Resources Committee, was Vice-Chair of the Public Works Committee, a member of Real Estate and Special Facilities, he has served on the CHATS Committee, and the Municipal Golf Course Commission. It's been an honor to serve with Councilmember Riegel for these past two years in our work to shape the future of West Ashley, particularly Councilmember Riegel's work on the challenges that we face in the Church Creek Drainage Basin. So, Dean, thank you for your service, your commitment to public service, and your efforts over these last eight years to serve the quality of life of the citizens of Charleston."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Councilmember Riegel said, "Well, thank you, Mr. Mayor. It's been a tremendous honor and privilege to serve the great citizens of District #10 all of these years. It's been a journey. Again, it's been a great honor and privilege to serve the constituents of District #10 and the great City of Charleston. Mr. Mayor, it's been a journey. I've had the privilege of serving under one terrific, great Mayor, Mayor Joe Riley and a second Mayor, who is going to be terrific and great, Mayor John Tecklenburg. I've also had the honor of serving with many, many great citizens of Charleston, the many Departments, Public Safety, Fire, and Police. All of the challenges we've had over the years with the floods, and some of the social events that we've had, and it's been marvelous. Of course, as many of you know, I did not run for re-election because my wife and the grandkids were living in Summerville, in Berkeley County. Even though I was in the election, I did not knock on any doors or make any phone calls, but I was thrilled to see the outcome, the outcome of Harry Griffin winning, who will be sworn in later tonight. I know Harry's family. Is your Grandpop here? Did they let him in through security? There he is, Captain Jack, Captain Harry, a lot of years of public service, you're a Citadel graduate, marvelous, marvelous personality. I'm so proud of you for winning, even in the teeth of the charade of being supported by former Councilmembers Larry Shirley and Aubry Alexander. They campaigned for the lady opponent against you and also, per Councilmember soon-to-be former Councilmember Marvin Wagner, and you prevailed through them all, and you ended up in a wonderful landslide victory. I'm so proud of you. In conclusion, I want to reach out to my personal friends, Bill Moody and Keith Waring, if I could, gentlemen. Unfortunately, for whatever reason, this was a very contentious campaign, not my campaign, but some of the other campaigns, and that's fine. That's politics. My neighbor, my good friend, Bobby Harrell, always told me, he said, 'Dean, you've got to remember, politics in the great State of South Carolina is a contact sport', and we demonstrated that. But, the reason I reach out to Bill and

Keith is I have tremendous respect for you gentlemen, and I really pray and ask that you provide the leadership, direction, and guidance to this great City in the future. We have so many challenges ahead of us, and it's too many to even reiterate tonight, but you know what they are, and with your great skill set, I just pray that you grab the rudder of this great ship, work with Mayor John Tecklenburg, and take us in a right vision down the road. Again, I would like to thank all of the voters and constituents in District #10 in the great City of Charleston. It's been a journey, as I said. It's been an opportunity to serve, and I wish you all a great, great year in 2018. Thank you. Thank you, Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Councilmember Kathleen Wilson, please come forward. Kathleen, Councilmember Wilson, has been a Councilmember for 12 years and has served the longest of those retiring. She served as Mayor Pro Tem in 2008 and chaired the Public Safety Committee, was a member of Traffic and Transportation, License, Recreation, and Special Facilities, and served on the Charleston Museum Board of Trustees. I want to thank you for your service, over a decade, on Charleston City Council. I think our fellow Councilmembers all know the commitment of time and energy that goes into serving our City as a member of City Council, and to do this for 12 years, has really been a great effort and a great service to our community. Her contributions over the last 12 years range from her work on the Traffic and Transportation Committee, which the Chairman at the Committee meeting this afternoon remarked as to her great service on that Committee. Also, as the Chair of our Public Safety Committee, public safety really being, at the end of the day, the number one function of our City Government, to keep us safe, and she's been the leader of that Committee. So, thank you, Councilmember Wilson, for your work. You've made our City a safer place and a tremendous amount of commitment and service to the citizens of Charleston. Thank you very much."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Councilmember Wilson said, "To my colleagues, thank you. I have never ever served with such a group of gentlemen whom I absolutely adore, to a person, and with all of the acrimony these days, I can say with all truth and honesty, I have never been treated better than I have by this collection of gentlemen right here, and I thank you for that. To our City staff, thank you, for the guidance and the kindness shown to me for many years. I put a few of you through the ringer from time to time. Sorry, Laurie, but I won't stop. If Robbie Somerville is here, I've put him through the ringer a few times, but we have a special bond because Robbie understands shoulders because he pitched. So, he could see things from the shoulder perspective. Laura Cabiness, thank you very, very much. Frances Cantwell, thank you very much, and to all of you, and I probably shouldn't have started naming names because I'm going to leave people out and that sort of thing. To my colleagues, please keep up the fight, and please never settle for mediocrity. A City is more than a litany of campaign promises. It's a living, vibrant City that deserves everything that we can give to it, and I ask you to please keep that up. Don't ever let the standards drop. I think sometimes the good Lord removed me from this because there are bigger, better things."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Councilmember Wilson continued, "He said, 'Kathleen, it's time for you to move up in the world.'"

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Wilson continued, "So, that's how I look at this. I'm a resilient person. I swim with sharks."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Wilson continued, "Literally, and you all remember the story, when I was in New Zealand swimming the Cook Strait, I said this coming in, and I was not being glib. I said, 'I will swim until I finish, or I'm unconscious', and I had no idea that I would not be that far from unconscious. I was dying when they pulled me out of the water and apparently, I have no memory, apparently, I was still fighting them saying that I could swim, and they had to plot as to how to catch me and reel me in. So, I'm a fighter, it's my nature, and I'm a straight shooter. It's my nature. Again, I want to thank all of you for the kindness and the companionship, the great decisions, the great debates, and everything that you have done for me. Thank you."

There was a standing ovation in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, Councilmember Wilson may swim with sharks, but she was the only member of the fairer sex on our Council, and I would like to present you also with some flowers."

Councilmember Wilson said, "Thank you."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Now, if I could ask our newly-elected members of Council and those who are returning, there should be six of you. Please come forward. If you have family member that you would like to join you to hold the Bible for you, for example, while we give the Oath of Office, please come forward. Then, that would be Kevin Shealy for District #2, Robert Mitchell returning for District #4, Dudley Gregorie returning for District #6, Mike Seekings District #8, Harry Griffin District #10, and Carol Jackson District #12. Will you all please, if you can, and move that way, you all, because we've got more coming up this way. Raise your right hand, place your other hand on the Bible, and repeat after me. 'I do solemnly swear that I am duly qualified, according to the Constitution of this State, to exercise the duty of the office to which I have been appointed, and that I will to the best of my ability, discharge the duties thereof, and preserve, protect, and defend the Constitution of this State and of the United States. As Councilmember of the Municipality of Charleston, I will equally, fairly, and impartially, to the best of my ability and skill, exercise the trust reposed in me, and I will use my best endeavors, to preserve the peace, and carry into effect according to law, the purposes for which I have been elected, so help me God.' Congratulations!"

There was a standing ovation in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Councilmember Shealy, would you like to address the Council, please?"

Councilmember Shealy said, "Yes, I just want to say thank you to my family, and sorry, family gets me, and Happy Birthday to Ashlyn. Ashlyn grew up with Councilmember Griffin, and she just turned 22, so she's caught back up with him, but they grew up together. I want to thank

you for what you're going to do, as far as helping me as a City Councilperson. I want to thank the City of Charleston, everybody who has been so welcoming to me, the Mayor, all of these Council people, and all of the City employees that have been so welcoming to me and helping us get up to speed, and I look forward to continuing to get up to speed on what's going on. Several people have helped me along the way so far, and I really appreciate that, and I appreciate the work of our Councilmembers who are exiting now. I am grateful for the dedication and the work that they've put in, and I can promise you integrity and transparency and that I'll work very hard. I'm ready to get to work. Thank you."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, I fell down a little bit on the job, I'll be right there, I wanted to let folks know a little bit about Kevin, and I should have done that before he spoke. He is a lifelong West Ashley resident, businessman, and community volunteer. He served as a Youth Sports Coach at St. Andrews Playgrounds in the City of Charleston for many years. He gives back to the community through his Elks Lodge and the Rotary Club. Through these organizations, he mentors and is an advocate for youth literacy, water safety, and drug awareness. He serves as an outside adviser to the West Ashley High School Interact Club, neighborhood cleanups, and Special Olympics volunteerism. He graduated from Middleton High School and Newberry College and began his professional career in public service as a manager for Charleston County Parks and Recreation. He served as the Assistant Athletic Director at Charleston Southern University, where he managed all business operations and 20 years ago entered the insurance business. Kevin, we welcome you to this Council and look forward to working with you. I don't have any bios on our returning members. I know you so well, I'm not supposed to. Councilmember Mitchell represents District #4. How many years now have you served, Councilmember Mitchell?"

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Fourteen."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Fourteen. So, Councilmember Mitchell, would you like to address Council?"

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Just quickly, I would say to my colleagues who are leaving that I'm going to miss you all, but things have to go on. To my new colleagues, we're going to work together to make the City of Charleston the best place to live. We have to make sure that we are working for everyone in the City of Charleston, that's everyone, and you will find on Council that is what I preach, and that is what I do. I'm looking at not just individuals, but the whole City of Charleston. It's only one City. So, we have to make sure that we look after the underserved, the people who need us the most, too, and others. That's one thing that I'm very, very strongly looking towards you all to help me to do. We have a lot of challenges before us and, I think, if we work together, we can overcome any challenges that come before this Council. So, just make sure that in your heart when you pray, now, I'm a believer of God, and that's who I believe in. I'm not saying what you believe in, but that's my belief. God placed me here to be a servant, and that's all I'm here as, a servant for my brothers and sisters, and that's everyone. That's the way I live, and that's the way you will see me on Council. Thank you very much."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Councilmember Dudley Gregorie is a native of Charleston and had an exemplary career with the United States Government working with the Housing and

Urban Development Department and has moved back to Charleston and is now beginning his third term on City Council. Councilmember Gregorie.”

There was applause in the Chamber.

Councilmember Gregorie said, “Thank you, Mayor. There’s an old African proverb that says, ‘you buried me, but you forgot that I was a seed, still I rise’. Good evening, and first I would like to give thanks to God for this opportunity to serve this wonderful City and District one more time. I would like to thank District #6, who voted for the color of competency and not the color of skin and making gender subordinate to experience. I would like to thank my campaign. Trust me, there weren’t many of us. There were about three or four of us, one of whom is here, our Field Director, Peter.”

There was applause in the Chamber.

Councilmember Gregorie continued, “The others, one is vacationing in Ecuador, and the others are not here with us, but I would like to say also, thanks to the staff of this City because without the staff of this City, none of us could prosper. I don’t think they get the due and respect that they are worth, but I am here to say, without you, I’m nothing.

We’ve had many issues, and my mantra still is, ‘It’s the water, stupid’. Thanks to Laura (Cabiness) and Public Service, in particular, we’ve been able to address many of those problems. You have an outstanding crew. The run-off, of course, required an expansion of our limited staff. That’s when so many people came to our rescue. Four was not enough. I think it was Malcolm Gladwell’s book that talked about the outliers and that it takes about 10,000 hours before anyone can become proficient in anything in their quest. I think after eight campaigns, hopefully, I have earned that status. Perhaps, I’m not ready to consider another one Charleston run, but our mantra still remains, ‘It’s the water, stupid.’

District #6 is the prize. The largest development in this City, called WestEdge, is going up, and I’ve been a part of that since 2011. That will create thousands of jobs for our City. Of course, with the help of Councilmember Moody and Councilmember Wilson, we’ve been able to do some pretty significant things on James Island, case in point, the moratorium, the Folly Road Overlay, and Re-Think Folly Road. The Folly Road Overlay will decrease considerable density on the Island. We’ve done work in Wagener Terrace. There’s a round-a-bout going in at Camp Road and Riverland. The Longborough Park is still under negotiations. We finally, after all of my life, will have a drainage solution at President and Fishburne, a drainage solution at Sumter and Ashley. Thanks again, Laura. We’ve increased the mills to try to make sure that we have additional dollars for drainage. We’ve created the Emanuel Way Memorial District, we’ve created the Memorial Park, and I can go on and on.

In closing, I commit to the residents of District #6 that I will not allow outsiders to influence my decisions, outsiders like ‘Better Charleston,’ outsiders like the ‘Livability PAC,’ or outsiders like ‘Save James Island’. I will always do what is best for the citizens of my district and the citizens of the City. Again, I thank District #6 for voting for the color of competency and not the color of skin and making gender subordinate to experience. Life is truly incredible, and I look forward to working with the administration and working with my colleagues to continue to make us one Charleston and one of the best cities in the world. Thank you.”

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next is our new Councilmember for District #10, Harry Griffin. He is a rising leader in Charleston's Maritime industry and a graduate of The Citadel. He handles logistics and distribution for Neal Brothers. Through his experience, Harry understands the importance of a strong Charleston economy and its chain effect on jobs. He gets that we want to be an encouraging, vibrant Charleston economy. As someone who grew up in City Council District #10, Shadowmoss, Harry recognizes the need for the City to prioritize drainage and road improvements. Those should be the City's priorities. Harry is driven by a work ethic instilled by his family and by The Citadel, his alma mater. The lessons and values he learned there will be brought to City Council, Harry Griffin."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Councilmember Griffin said, "I want to say first that I'm absolutely humbled to be here tonight and to serve for the next four years. I want to say thank you to everybody here tonight because I know why you're here. It's not because of who is coming into office or who is leaving, it's because we all love the City of Charleston, and we want to make it the best City in the world. I want to first thank Councilmember Riegel for eight years of service. You will be a tough act to follow, but I will do it to the best of my ability. I want to thank my family for supporting me since I was a little boy. To my parents, thank you for allowing me to dream. You always told me I could, and that fire still burns in me today. I want to thank my grandparents for making Charleston home, and I especially want to thank my grandfather for serving in our Charleston Fire Department for over 30 years. People like you, our emergency personnel, and the brave men and women who fight for our Country, have given me the opportunity and the blessing to serve my community. I want to thank my friends, most of them are sitting up top here tonight. Like me, they're rarely on time, but we're just out in the world trying to work, and I appreciate them for taking time out of their tough days to come here to support me. They held up signs, came to every function, and encouraged me to keep working when the days were tough. They're the best friends a guy could ever ask for. Finally, and most importantly, I want to thank the constituents of District #10. The people I serve are truly the most amazing on the planet. Today, I take an oath to protect and serve them with integrity and honor. I will protect them from harm, and that includes preventing future flooding in the Church Creek Basin for generations to come. I will serve them by improving infrastructure and standing with them as we make sure the residents of West Ashley are never neglected again. We must be a priority as West Ashley continues to revitalize and as we work to fix the problems caused by overdevelopment. I am here to serve you, work for you, and protect you. Never again will we be forgotten or left behind. Thank you and may God Bless Charleston."

There was a standing ovation in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Harry, as you can see, we welcome you with open arms, and your colleagues and myself, I certainly feel like we're all young in heart and spirit."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg continued, "It is refreshing to have a young, new voice and face on Council, and I don't think Laura will mind me telling this story. We were at a Department Head meeting this morning, and we were making mention of the City Council meeting tonight and new Councilmembers coming in. She said, 'Well, Councilmember-to-be Griffin called me the other day and asked me if I knew a fellow named Sam Cabiness, and of course, I responded, 'Yes, that's my son', and Councilmember Griffin said, 'We were in high school together!'"

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg continued, "So, remember, we're young at heart. Next is Carol Jackson, who is newly elected to District #12. She is a former non-profit executive who served with the National Trust for Historic Preservation for over 15 years. She currently serves on the Board of Directors of the Palmetto Community Land Trust and on Revolving Loan Fund Committee for Historic Charleston Foundation. She is already very involved with affordable housing issues and matters. She is committed to using the full range of her skills and expertise, to protect the quality of life for James Islanders and for citizens of our City, from her years with the National Trust for Historic Preservation to her work with the Anglican Church. Carol has spent her life preserving and protecting the things that make communities like Charleston special. I give you our new Councilmember for District #12, Carol Jackson."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Thank you, Mayor. I'll be brief, but I do want to say a few things that I've been thinking about over the last few days. I first of all want to thank God, who created me, and his Son, who redeems me, and my husband, who encourages me, and my kids, who like me."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilwoman Jackson continued, "My friends, who support me, and a lot of my friends, who campaigned for me on James Island. They all wanted to be here tonight, and I released them to things that were more important for the long-term. There is an advocacy training that the League of Women Voters is hosting tonight. There is a political meeting that is going to talk about raising up local leaders and partners on James Island. So, I want to thank all of those people who supported me so dedicatedly through the long campaign, and the privilege that it was to run for this office. I understand that I have a big responsibility and a steep learning curve, and I'm respectful of all that I don't know and grateful for the City staff, many of whom have been named here tonight. I'm finding out, in the nooks and crannies of the staff offices, there are people who just bend over backwards at every opportunity to give us an answer or tell us something before you even think to answer it. So, I intend to mine that territory as often and as eagerly as I have the opportunity. I'm also grateful for all of the residents who have amazingly good ideas and an investment in our community across the City, as Mr. Mitchell says. I think it's sort of the benefit and the curse of having a district to represent, that we are dedicated to the people who put us here, but we also have to see across the lines, that are literally just on paper and not really dividing anything in Charleston. We are a region that has a lot more to unite us than to divide us, and I'm looking forward to making that true on James Island, which even has the jurisdictional challenges of not being 100 percent City territory, as you all know. The Town of James Island and the County are very much active in serving citizens on James Island. So, we have a lot to do that can put the proof in the pudding to be united and to be growing Charleston in ways that are quality, not necessarily quantity, but quality for the future.

I know that I am truly the newbie on Council. I learned yesterday that Harry and Kevin have roots and have lived all over the City in similar places, and their grandmothers go back to the Beaufain Street neighborhood that they shared. I don't have that, so I was trying to think on how I could distinguish myself and really say what's in my heart about why I decided to run for this office. I think what I would like to distinguish myself for is, in representing James Island and

truly all of the City residents as I start out, that I am one of many intentional citizens who have chosen to invest our time, talents, and treasures in Charleston for all of the attributes of this region that are drawing so many of us here. So, we get to choose Charleston. Charleston chose a lot of you to be born here and to put your roots down here, but the people like me and my family and a lot of our friends are coming to Charleston because you are an amazing City that we want to contribute to with our own time and talents. I am just the point of that spear. I'm one voice, but I do intend to represent people who are intentional citizens of Charleston. I don't have a long history, but I do have the excitement, hope, and dedication to contribute to our new home. That's why I'm here, to do my very best, to represent our community every day that I'm in office.

I want to give a special thank you to Kathleen Wilson for all of her longstanding and dedicated work. I met many of her supporters as I was going around James Island, getting acquainted with everything that was going on, and then in the more intense campaigning through the neighborhoods. I want to thank her and salute her for building a strong and solid female foundation for this City, and I intend to be very respectful of the big shoes that she is leaving for me to fill. So, thank you very much."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, last but not least, we have returning Councilmember, Mike Seekings, who has served now for eight years. In addition to getting re-elected, Mike served as our Mayor Pro Tem last year. I want to thank him for always being willing to stand in for me and for the City, as appropriate, and always doing it so honorably and admirably. He is a man of great intellect. He is an attorney, but here is a fact that you probably didn't know about Mike. His first degree was in geology and so, later tonight, when we're talking about offshore drilling, we actually have an expert in the house on that, as well. So, Mike, I have a presentation to you, separately, 'In appreciation for your service as Mayor Pro Tem in 2017'. Thank you so much."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Councilmember Seekings said, "Thank you, Mayor, fellow Councilmembers, newly-elected Councilmembers, and ladies and gentlemen. I'm going to be brief. I ran unopposed this time, so I don't need a whole lot time. My good friend, Councilmember Gregorie, gets plenty of time, because he had to go through a run-off. Mayor, I will tell you when I was growing up, I didn't get to watch a lot of T.V., but every now and then I watched it, and there was a commercial on T.V., you may remember it, for Maytag. Maytag Appliances, and who was the loneliest man in the world? It was the Maytag repairman. Well, let me tell you, being the Mayor Pro Tem, in some ways, is the loneliest job in America because Mayor Tecklenburg goes to everything. He goes to everything."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Seekings continued, "Now, he did let me out of the cage a few times, and I got to do some really fun stuff, and being Mayor Pro Tem, let me tell you, is a really fun job. It's like when your grandchildren come to visit you, you get to send them home. I don't have to go back to the Mayor's Office, I get to go home. I got to go on a battleship, and I got to meet people from all over the world, and one of the fun things about this job, Mayor, and you see it every day, is we know how we see ourselves. To see how people who come here see us, and that is really a fascinating position to be in. So, Mayor, thank you for giving me the

opportunity for the last year to be a representative of the City, notwithstanding the fact you didn't let me do it very much."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Seekings continued, "And to see how the world views us. Very briefly, I want to thank Councilmembers Wilson, Williams, and Riegel for their hard work and public service. For the families of the newly-elected officials that are in here, let me just tell you, this is not an easy job. It seems easy, the pay is certainly high."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Seekings continued, "The hours are short, and the rewards are great. We get a lot of e-mails that say thank you, so, thank you. It's a hard job, and while we don't always agree, we come together for many hours in these Chambers. So, thank you all so much. For the newly-elected members, and particularly for their families, and particularly for the Griffin and Shealy families who, apparently you could elect people to anything, they've got plenty of you here. It's a tough job, so be there behind them, and I've gotten each one of you newly-elected officials a gift. I know you've been waiting for a gift through this hard campaign season, so I got each one of you the Bible of what you're going to need to read and understand to show you how exciting a job this is. This is a book called 'Tax Increment Financing' by the American Bar Association. So, for Councilmembers Griffin, Jackson, and Shealy, I've gotten you a copy. Please read it, because we're going to talk much more about that, than the fun stuff that we've talked about tonight. Thank you, to the people in my district, District #8, for a couple of things. I see a few of you here tonight. First off, thank you for none of you for running against me."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Seekings continued, "You might have noticed that this year, not just in the City of Charleston, but around the Lowcountry, was a tough year to be an incumbent running for re-election. There are very few of us still standing. I want to congratulate Councilmember Gregorie, and here we are. So, thank you, and also for allowing me to serve. This is an incredible City. No matter how you got here and where you're going, it's an incredible City for those who are here for 72 hours, 72 years, or a lifetime, and to be a part of the fabric of it, to address the issues that we're going to address as one City, and we are one City, flooding, transportation, cohesiveness, and public safety. It's so important that we all do it together, and it's an honor to be a part of it. Mayor, when I thought about running for re-election, all of those issues were on my mind. Flooding, for sure, transportation, public safety, but there was one that was on my mind and continues to be on my mind. Perhaps, not as important, but very weighty, and that is in 2018, and I wanted to get re-elected for this, in 2018, Laurie and Janie, it's to bring home the Dragon Boat Trophy for the City of Charleston in 2018. Thank you all so much. Mayor, thank you, I appreciate it."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, Councilmember Seekings, and our new Councilmembers Griffin, Jackson, and Shealy. If you have any trouble going to sleep at night, just pull out that 'Tax Increment Financing'. It will do the trick, I assure you. Next, I just want to make a couple of announcements about our City Council Committees, and our Mayor Pro Tem appointment for next year is our longest serving Councilmember, a voice of wisdom often on

this Council, and that is Councilmember James Lewis, who has now been with the City over 20 years on City Council. James Lewis, would you be stand and be recognized?"

There was a standing ovation in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, Councilmember Lewis, Mayor Pro Tem Lewis, I look forward to working with you, and I'll take to heart the comments of Councilmember Seekings and try to not show up at as many events, so that you will have more opportunities. I did want to mention to Council that the last Committee is not a formal Committee at this point. We haven't had an ordinance authorizing it. It's an Ad Hoc or Advisory Committee, but we've been talking about the need for a Budget Committee to begin early in the process to help review the City's budget as soon as that process starts. What I thought might be appropriate is to have the Chairs of various Committees, including Ways and Means, and the former Ways and Means Chairman, along with Human Resources, Public Safety, and the Audit Committee to participate in a Budget Committee that would help advise myself and the City through the budget process. Once again, I do want to thank Council for your participation in the budget process this past year. I know it was tight and tough, but it really helped me a lot that Council stepped up to the plate and participated as you did."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings.

Councilmember Seekings said, "Just one item of business, Mr. Mayor. I think, for the Mayor Pro Tem, that we actually need a motion and second to vote on it. So, I would move for Councilmember Lewis as the Mayor Pro Tem."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion and a second to approve Councilmember Lewis becoming our Mayor Pro Tem. Is there any discussion?"

On a motion of Councilmember Seekings, seconded by Councilmember Gregorie, City Council voted unanimously to approve Councilmember Lewis as Mayor Pro Tem.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Lastly, I have a proclamation recognizing Immaculée Ilibagiza, the Hope and Healing Day in the City of Charleston, which will be in February. I see Father West arriving. Would you all please come forward and join me on the podium? I would like to also ask if Councilmember Gary White would join us, and Councilmember Gregorie, who is a member of Mother Emanuel Church. Welcome."

Father West said, "Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, you may have seen a picture of this wonderful woman in the lobby downstairs, and I think it was in there as folks were coming in. Her name is Immaculée, and we are really blessed, the Charleston Community, that Immaculée is going to be joining us on Daniel Island on February 2nd. So, this proclamation will give you a little story about her and her visit here."

Mayor Tecklenburg read the proclamation.

---INSERT PROCLAMATION---

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Father West is the Pastor of St. Clare of Assisi, and many of those with us here tonight, including Councilmember White, are members of that congregation. I would ask Father West if he would like to come forward and address us with a few words. Father."

Father Gregory West said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor, and thank you, ladies and gentlemen of City Council, for this wonderful proclamation. We are indeed humbled and honored. Just very quickly to tell you about who it is we are, we are a Catholic Parish that was established not quite four years ago on Daniel Island. We're about 2,200 members at this moment. We have a church, not a church building. We use the facilities at Bishop England High School until we begin construction and, hopefully, that will be something we see in about 2021.

St. Clare of Assisi was a woman who lived from 1194 to 1253. She was the first woman to follow the more famous St. Francis of Assisi. St. Clare was a young woman of great privilege. In her teens, she was all set to be married off by her wealthy parents, and she heard this young man, Francis, preach the gospel in a profound way she had never heard before. It so changed her life that she literally walked away from everything she had, much to the dismay of her parents, and created a women's movement within the Franciscan movement. In fact, as the folks in my parish know, she was a bit of radical feminist, if you will. She was the first woman in the history of the Catholic Church to write the rule for her own religious order. Up to that time, it had always been written by men, and so she wrote the rule, and she sent it to the Pope for approval. He made some changes, because he thought it was entirely too strict. He sent it back to her and she wrote back to him, basically telling him to mind his own business, that this is the way she wanted it to be done.

So, her followers now number about 33,000 throughout the world. The Poor Clares are an Order that live in cloistered quiet. They're barefoot, and very poor, but they live the gospel very profoundly, as is the life of Immaculée. Most of you, I would imagine, have not heard of this woman. You will. Many who know of her and have heard her are in the millions. Many people would agree that she is likely a Saint in the making, that this is somebody who, after she goes to her eternal reward, could be declared by the Church a Saint. Her message is so very powerful. We all remember so vividly and sadly that event of not quite two years ago when we all turned on and heard the news that morning of what had happened at Mother Emanuel, the very shock we heard, and how did we react as a City? We did not riot, we embraced one another arm in arm. We were solid in our pursuit of peace and forgiveness and reconciliation, and those same three unbelievably courageous words spoken by the members of the family in that courtroom, 'I forgive you', resonated across this entire planet, and the people of the world saw another way that it could be done. So, that is the same message that Immaculée brings to us in this event next month, that there is another way, a far better way, a far higher way, to forgive, to reconcile, and to understand. You can get information about this event. You can go to our website www.clare.church. It's all there, we would love to have you. Thank you, again. God Bless you all. God Bless you, Mayor, and thank you. God Bless you, Council. We're grateful."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "That's not bad in four years to go to 2,200 members of your congregation. That's pretty strong. Next up, just to make a comment, if I will, on our minutes. The December 11th minutes were just finished, and we've presented them to you, but we haven't finished December 19th, so they're almost done. We got a little pushed back by the

weather last week and being off a few days. So, we'll have that to you next week, and if it's okay, we'll just defer the minutes for the next meeting."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, "Thank you, Mayor. I was going to suggest we do that, and I would also ask the Clerk if you would, to electronically send the Real Estate, the Ways and Means, and these, when you send them, to do them all electronically, if you would, so I don't have to copy all of that stuff."

The Clerk said, "Yes, okay."

Councilmember Moody said, "Okay, thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next is our Citizens Participation Period. We have 12. I'm going to say that we have two minutes a piece for your presentations. We had some discussion at our last Council meeting about remaining decorum in these Council Chambers. We follow Robert's Rules of Order, and we also have our own Council rules about being respectful, no profanity, and please do not have any inflammatory remarks when you address the Council. Thank you very much."

The Clerk asked, "How many minutes?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Two."

The Clerk said, "Okay. First we have Mohammed Idris, Arthur Lawrence, followed by Anthony Bryant."

1. Mohammed Idris said they were about to celebrate the birthday of the late Dr. Martin Luther King. His question was how they would like for them to have this celebration beneath a statue of Adolf Hitler and have it publicized as a great and wonderful event. They would not like that, yet they had a celebration under the statue of J.C. Calhoun, one of the most corrupt human beings. Mayor Tecklenburg had put his stamp of approval on the event saying he had a good time. He stated he was going to take them to court for the violation of his civil rights and the lie that was said that he committed at City Council.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you very much. Mr. Lawrence."

2. Arthur Lawrence said he hoped everyone had a wonderful, prosperous, and blessed year. The senior citizens sent him there from the West Side, and they said wherever there was smoke, there was fire. Someone was trying to propose a bicycle lane from Kennedy Street to Congress and from Nunan Street to Congress and take away the parking on the left side of the street. The senior citizens who lived there and the businesses said they did not want this to happen. They had also heard from a couple of homeless individuals that Tyrale (Bailey), who worked for the City, had helped a veteran get off the street and found a place for him. Mr. Bailey should be commended. They also wanted to say thank you to Ms. Cabiness, Mr. Somerville, the Chief, and individuals who had worked with the West Side. Councilmember Gregorie had left out that someone did not get elected if the West Side did not support you.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "What street was that, Mr. Lawrence?"

Mr. Lawrence said, "Ashley Avenue, from Kennedy Street to Congress on Ashley and from Nunan Street to Congress Street on the left side. They want to take away the parking spaces on those streets. We have parking problems now, and that can't happen."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, sir. Okay, I just wanted the street. Thank you so much."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, sir. Mr. Bryant."

3. Anthony Bryant said there was a current record he would be filing because Motley Rice and many of the African-American establishments were probably laughing at him, stating that he was hateful. Hate was the premise of where the hate lied. John C. Calhoun was honorable, in his time because he was a race baiter. The 14th Amendment, section 3, dealt with the exemption of any type of speech after the Civil War. Combining a plaque with the statue was in violation of Federal law, in his opinion. He had been a political activist for 20 years, and he would be fully engaged in the political process in 2019.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you."

The Clerk said, "Mayor, apparently four persons came over and talked to Jennifer and said they didn't realize they needed to sign up. So, we'll add them. Next, we will have Marc Knapp, Sharon Wright, Barry Newton, followed by Carmen Nash."

4. Marc Knapp said he was glad to see some new faces on Council. His sources told him that the Command Center was set up during the snow storm, and the only municipality that whined was the City of Charleston with 483 police officers. Other jurisdictions had people that needed dialysis and other essential needs, but the City seemed to call in and whine about needing things, which concerned him. He didn't know what had happened with the traffic lights because of the snow, but the timing seemed to be off on everything. He had seen people working on them, but it would be nice to start getting those back in place. He was glad to see that CAJM was fading out, because it was long overdue. They were horrible for Council and were from the worst people that were ever created.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Mr. Knapp, I'm going to ask you to just address issues and not speak about other individuals."

Mr. Knapp continued, "I'm not, it's just the CAJM people."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Be respectful."

Mr. Knapp continued, saying he knew they were after the Police Department, and he knew that the Police Department had no problems with racism. They were probably the number one Police Department in the country, and probably the world, when it came to that. The Chief did a very good job.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you sir. Yes, ma'am."

5. Sharon Wright said she was a resident in Charleston. She was having an explosive sewer problem in her unit and had been trying to get help. They had been coming

back and forth, but nothing had been working. She was wondering if there was some way she could get someone to direct her to where she needed to go. She had health issues, and she couldn't sleep or eat. She was having a hard time getting the help she needed from the housing unit.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "You're with the Charleston Housing Authority?"

Ms. Wright said, "Yes, sir."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Would you please state your name and address?"

She said, "My name is Sharon Wright. I live at 8B America Street. I've been there now for approximately seven years, and I had this problem now for about a little over five months. It's not the drainage, because I'm at the main line, and the sewer runs right in. When I cut my heater on because of the temperature, heat and odor don't mix, and it really kills me. I suffer with depression and all, and this is just really driving me up the wall. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, ma'am. Thank you. We'll have someone come take a look."

6. Carmen Nash said she sent so much gratitude to the outgoing members and so many blessings to the incoming ones. She was there to talk about the Calhoun monument wording and would like to offer her thoughts on some working for their consideration.

A copy of suggested wording is on file in the City Council folder for January 9, 2018.

She stated that it then went on to say basically the same thing as the History Commission had already worded. She had added a few things. She added in Charleston and South Carolina's past because it would be great if they do a template for other statues as well.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you very much. Barry Newton."

The Clerk said, "Following Barry, we'll have Edna Taylor, Jonzetta Taylor, and Timothy Squire."

7. Barry Newton said he was the manager of the Charleston City Market and had been for ten years. He had been a market vendor for over 20 years and during that time, vendors were allowed to bring in propane tanks for comfort during the winter months. Five years ago, the Fire Marshal had contacted them and explained that the propane heaters were illegal and against the code, and they would have to remove all propane heaters. After the Fire Marshal contacted them, they had met with the Fire Marshal and other City officials to try to find a solution. They were unable to find a solution where all vendors could feel heat in a four city block area. The City was now wants to study the issue and they supported that. He had been working with the vendors to get ideas, study costs, and study procedures that would be needed by the Fire Marshal. They hoped to have a full report to the Real Estate Committee in a month that would detail a couple of solutions that hopefully would be approved and funded.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you Sir."

The Clerk said "Is Ms. Taylor here?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Ms. Taylor, Edna Taylor. Oh, there she is. Hi, Ms. Taylor."

8. Edna Taylor said they thanked God for the way the Market looked. It looked very nice, but it was something to sit in the cold. Any little thing would help such as a little heater or small tank. She asked them to please think about it. It was very cold and arthritis and bursitis was not playing with them. Five years was a long time to work in the cold, and she wasn't saying that people weren't trying, but they needed help.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I was going to say, Ms. Taylor, we won't just think about it. We will have our Fire Marshall and our Capital Projects or Maintenance folks take a look at what we can do to help."

The Clerk said, "Jonzetta Taylor and there's a Benia Taylor, is that correct?"

Benia Taylor said, "Yes, Benia."

The Clerk said, "Benia Taylor, and then there's a Timothy, is that you?"

Timothy Squire said, "Yes, ma'am."

9. Jonzetta Taylor said she was addressing the same situation as her mother. She couldn't work as much anymore, but she was still there and had been since 1971. They had always had some type of heat until the past few years, and it was really hard working with no heat at all. She knew that Mr. Barry was working on it, but in the meantime, they needed some help. She knew it was getting rewired, and that would take a long time, but they needed help right now.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Yes, sir."

10. Timothy Squire said he wanted to encourage them to carefully consider the practices of overdevelopment that had created the flooding they had been dealing with. He wanted to point them towards practices such as, filling in with cheap soil, like clay, that contributed to run off and added to the drainage problems. He appreciated the efforts that had been done, like moratoriums, but that only pushed the problem a little bit further down the calendar and it would still happen again. He encouraged them to deal with things in a more permanent way and to also consider things such as, connection activity in development. People seemed thrilled when their neighborhoods connected to each other.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you very much, Mr. Squire."

The Clerk said, "Benia."

11. Benia Taylor said she was 15 years old and had been working at the Market since she was four or five. They were able to have heaters when she first started, but now that they weren't able to, and it was making it harder for her to go out and help her

mom. They couldn't just stop going out there, because that was how they lived and it was what they did. They were just asking for help to get some heat in there.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, Benia."

12. David Frederick said he just wanted to reiterate that he had been a merchant in the City Market for a number of years and would appreciate anything they could do to help them solve the heating issue.

The Clerk said, "We have the four names Brett Berry, Dr. Bobby Baker, Dr. Michael Cogan, Dr. Donald Livingston."

13. Brett Barry said he was there to speak on the Calhoun monument and the plaque language. He applauded the Mayor for wishing to tell the whole story. The Calhoun plaque should not be a pro-Calhoun statement or an anti-Calhoun statement. It should be an historical statement. This plaque could not be about the varying view points on Calhoun and it could not present a singular view point, as that would constitute a historical malpractice. It should present the main historical facts proportional to his entire body of work. He was a leading defender of the institution of slavery which had been included in the proposed language. He opposed American imperialism, established the second bank of the United States and was considered, by the Senate Committee, to be one of the five greatest senators of all time. Yet, the proposed plaque language indirectly stated that Calhoun did not deserve to be memorialized. Some felt this way and some did not. The historians that did find him worthy of memorialization acknowledged the role he played in history and his greater body of work as a leading political thinker. The statement that many South Carolinians once viewed him as worthy of memorialization was false, as many South Carolinians still do. He asked for that to be removed and for Council to restrict the language to historical facts and leave opinion making up to the reader. He asked for the gentlemen that were there with him to rise.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you all for being with us this evening."

14. Bobby Baker said he was a resident in Charleston and it had become a destination for people to visit and move. The latest records indicated that over 50 people were moving to the City per day. Tourists, locals, and new residents were enjoying several things about Charleston, being considered one of the friendliest cities in America was one of them. The City was steeped in history and many felt as though they were walking back in time as they strolled through the streets. He believed that the single most valuable aspect of Charleston was that it was an undivided community because they respected each other and their differences. He wanted to express his concern that attempting to change their history or the interpretation of their history would divide. There was a silent, but growing number of citizens who were constantly expressing concerns over the attempt to try and alter or erase part of history. They believed it should be left up to the individual interpretation and not merely to a handful of people. He stated that in the document he had passed out, there was an achievable obituary address delivered in the Senate on April 1, 1950 on the occasion of the death of John C. Calhoun. There were numerous facts that should be preserved and for all to form their own opinions.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you Dr. Baker. Council, I would like to share with you, and state publicly, that Dr. Baker is a relatively recent citizen of Charleston, and he's both a good shopper and a very compassionate gentleman. He noted prior to the holidays this great deal on computers. He felt like he had to buy something, and he bought five new computers. Then, we selected five deserving young students in our public schools, and he donated them over the holidays. So, I just wanted to thank him publicly for his efforts. He's going to continue that effort as well. Thank you Dr. Baker."

15. Michael Cogan said he was a retired professor of Philosophy and he lived on King Street. He wanted to speak to the proposed signage for the Calhoun monument. The second sentence of the text referred to white supremacy and laws mandating racial segregation, strongly suggesting that the Calhoun statue was erected in furtherance of these ideas, which was not true. The current monument was unveiled in 1896, as a replacement for an earlier statue of Calhoun which Charlestonians had found unattractive. No one ever stated that their work or the monument itself had anything to do with segregation, racism or white supremacy. It was simply the expression of the people's desire to honor South Carolina's favorite son, its greatest statesman and political thinker. However, the text of the proposed plaque attributed to Charlestonians long dead, unspoken, racist, and malignant motives for the creation of the statue, attempting to discredit them and the monument itself. This was illegitimate and unfair.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you, Sir."

The Clerk said, "Dr. Donald Livingston."

16. Donald Livingston said he wanted to provide historical clarity about Calhoun's famous statement that slavery was a positive good. If they looked at the Congressional record, they would see that the Senate stenographer recorded that Calhoun insisted he was misunderstood. He had not said that slavery was an intrinsic good, but only that it had achieved positive things for the African population, not otherwise available given circumstances because of the unbending racism that existed throughout the United States of the 19th Century. As late as the 1850's, Lincoln argued against the Emancipation if it meant social equality with blacks. The Constitution of Lincoln's own state of Illinois, with his approval, prohibited free blacks from entering the state. Calhoun did not say that slavery was an intrinsic good.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Thank you sir. That ends our public participation period. Thank you all who came and participated. I do what to share with Council just a little antidote about Ms. Taylor, and I assure we will take a look at what we can do to allow small space heaters at the market. In addition to our two young members, Barry Newton saying he was in the market 35 years ago makes me feel old. I've also known Ms. Taylor and known of her, over 30 years ago, when I was in the oil business. I had these representatives that would call on my business from all over the place and the head Shell Oil Company representative for the whole east coast was out in New Jersey, and of course they all like to call on my company and visit Charleston because Charleston is such a great place to come. So, he goes wandering down in the City Market one day, and then the next time he came back to Charleston a few months later, he said, 'I have to go down to the Market and get some of Ms. Taylor's rice and beans.' Ms. Taylor does this amazing Lowcountry combination that she packages together with the spices, not only rice beans, but she has all these other variety of things going on, and they're delicious

soups and everything like that. It made this huge impression on this man from New Jersey where every time he came to Charleston, he would come visit Ms. Taylor and buy some of your product. Ms. Taylor, I just would add that it's folks like you that are ambassadors for our City to the world who may come here, and I just want to thank you and the other market vendors for your courtesy and hospitality when people come to this City. Thank you for that."

There was applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next, we move to Petitions and Communications and, in fact, the first item up is discussion about the approval of language for the John C. Calhoun monument. Just for a little bit of recognition and explanation, I want to recognize Harlan Greene, who is the Chairman of our History Commission. I also see that Robert Rosen, who is a member of the Commission, is with him. Are there any other members of Commission here this evening? We also had two Councilmembers represented on the Commission, former Councilmember Williams and Councilmember Moody. I'd also like to recognize and appreciate the cooperation that the City has enjoyed over the years with the Washington Light Infantry, who owns Marion Square. General Siegling is here with us this evening and probably other representatives of the Washington Light Infantry and, in fact, even though they weren't officially on the Commission, we asked that the WLI send a representative to the proceedings to benefit from their input.

So, why are we doing all of this, I think most folks know, but I just wanted to repeat that I think that the issue of adding some explanation and context to Mr. Calhoun's statue really generated from conversations that started after the tragedy at Mother Emanuel Church. Even though these kind of conversations had been going on for years, they surfaced again. This is one of those issues, my fellow Councilmembers, that is certainly one where it's true you can't please everyone, and folks have different readings and interpretation of history. So that leads to some different opinions. There were folks in our community that felt it was a fair thing to ask that the statue be taken down and removed, that it was offensive to them. In fact in other cities in our country, such removals have occurred. In New Orleans, Mayor Landrieu removed four Confederate monuments, and then in Charlottesville, a few months ago, there was a removal of a statue of General Lee. That led to violence in that city, so it can be a very contentious kind of debate. So, we go from folks that feel it should be taken down, which by the way, in the State of South Carolina, according to our reading and interpretation of State Law, the Heritage Act, the removal of the statue would not be allowed without the permission of our State Legislature. It was reported in the paper by our Speaker of the House that, such an approval, the likelihood would be next to zero. So, you have that side of the equation and then, folks that would like to do nothing and just leave things the way they are. So, I thought it was fair and appropriate to try to add some context of history and try to tell the full story, to the extent that we can agree on it, of what Mr. Calhoun believed in and not just stop there, but to also add history and context to this incredible historical city full of heritage.

For example, we are adding signage at Hampton Park, wayfinding signage so that people can find the Denmark Vesey statue and memorial that is there. It's kind of lost in the woods. We are elevating the Memorial Day sign at Hampton Park that is now lost to sight in the dirt of a flower bed, well-intended, but it needs to be up and reimported from the South Carolina History Commission, one of the poles that you mount the plaque on. We're going to elevate that Memorial Day, coming up. There's a remarkable effort called the Charleston Justice Journey Project that wasn't City-funded but, if I may say, I helped raise \$10,000 to help them put into place a project that's going to recognize various sites around the City. Barbara Dilligard is leading this effort. Amazing, identifying sites around our City that are important to African

American History and Heritage, and we're going to create an interactive map and digital presentation where people and visitors can find these sites all through the City.

So, this is just part, in my view, of adding to the context, the story, the history, and trying to tell the full story of our City's history. That's where this came from and, I think, Robert Rosen wrote the first draft of this particular proposal for this plaque of John C. Calhoun, and then the commission met numerous times. Harlan Greene, who is at the College of Charleston, Nick Butler, who's a historian with the Charleston County Library, and Damon Fordham, who's an African American Tour Guide and knows history of Charleston well, and Dr. Fraser, so, it was a group well-selected of folks who are most knowledgeable about the history of Charleston. With that presentation or little preparation there, I'd like to call on the one Councilmember who is on the Commission to share any remarks or suggestions that you have. I hate to put the spotlight on you."

Councilmember Moody said, "Thanks a lot."

Mayor Tecklenburg continued, "Chairman Greene and Mr. Rosen are available if Council has any questions that Councilmember Moody would not be able to address."

The Clerk said, "Mayor, you might tell them there were others. There were about six or seven others that participated."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "About six or seven other members of the Commission, and I've already asked if there were any other Commission members here."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, "Thank you, Mr. Mayor, I didn't know you were going to call on me. I wasn't really going to say anything about this. I would congratulate Chairman Greene for his leadership of this effort. I know at one of the meetings, I sat beside Mr. Rosen, and he actually came forward with some words and then voted against his own proposal, which was kind of impressive."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Moody continued, "I've never known him to be, well he's mostly a contentious person, so I figured he made the motion and voted against it. Anyway, it was a good group of folks that had a lot of information, and I know there was a big leap, from the first statement, to where we are now. There was a pretty good consensus, and my feeling was always that it ought to be factual, that we ought to leave out any kind of opinion, good, bad, but put the facts there, and let them do it. I didn't say it in the meeting, but I said it to one of our friends, who asked me about it. I said, 'Well, if I was going to do it, I would just put, on the statue, beside Calhoun's name, I would say, 'See 74 Calhoun, Charleston County Library.' That's where you're going to find the information about Mr. Calhoun, both good and bad. So, unfortunately, I feel like this is one of those situations, I'm not going to get in a fight with any member of this body over the language. To me, we've got too many, and not that this is not important, but we've got too many issues that we have to deal with on an ongoing basis. I've heard, you said, Mr. Mayor, that we go from not doing anything to going over here to blasting. I may put 'not doing anything' in the middle. We go from praising him, to blasting him, and if we just don't do anything, it might be in the middle. So, I don't know exactly where we go from here, but I applaud the efforts of Mr. Greene, Mr. Rosen, and several others that were on the

Committee. I'll just leave it right there. I am not, if I had to say something, I would just say leave it alone, but I know that probably will upset two groups rather than go on one side. It's a matter of how many people are going to be mad tonight is, I think, the question. So, I'd be glad to answer any questions, and I'm sure Mr. Greene and Mr. Rosen would, about some of the deliberation."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "What is the pleasure of Council?"

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Yes, please."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Mr. Greene, would you mind coming forward to share your perspective of the process that the Commission went through and your arrival at this text?"

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Mayor, does anyone have a copy of the current plaque for us to hear?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "There is no current plaque on it."

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Oh, there is no plaque at all?"

Councilmember Moody said, "Yes, there is. There are three words, I believe."

The Clerk said, "That's not what she's talking about."

Harlan Greene said, "There is no language on the statue. There is no plaque around the statue. There is language on the statue, the Constitution Truth Justice. It has Calhoun, and it has bas reliefs of him in the Senate and stuff like that, but truly there is no information about it."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I believe on the back side . . ."

Mr. Greene said, "On the back, it talks about the memorial and the creation of it. That it was the Women's Memorial Association that came together to do it, but it's odd that a statue like that has no interpretation to it at all. Obviously, when it was put up, everyone knew who Calhoun was and then these days, unfortunately, people don't remember our history, but I'll try to be brief. So, this Commission normally just puts plaques up. We do the wording on anything done on public property. So, if these memorials that the Mayor was talking about, things put in Hampton Park, the Denmark Vesey statue, anything put on public property has to go before this Commission. So, this Commission, this was the first time that we were specifically asked to add something to an extant memorial. As I remember, Mr. Mayor, I think part of the charge of that was to specifically address his issues on race. So, that was part of the charge for this Commission. We did not make it up out of whole cloth, we were given that to interpret Calhoun, and to specifically address his issue on race.

What we tried to do, and the Commission that is composed of African Americans and Caucasians, and we met three times. It usually takes about 45 minutes to get something done historically and grammatically. We met for three months, so I would guess we met for eight hours. So, I will say that there was a spirited debate going back and forth, and I will say, and you might have seen in the paper, that even some members of the Commission are not happy with it. But when we voted on it, again, you all know better than I do, the spirit of compromise, and it was a majority that ruled, and it was a majority that ruled that thought this was the best that we could do to do this. I will say that I think the City of Charleston, this is where my

personal opinion comes in, we have to try. We live in times, and I think if we don't try to interpret this, we will be faulted by all of the strangers who come to the City, and wonder why are we not doing it. I agree that the language isn't perfect. I don't think that there is any way that we could do justice in less than 300 words in what we're trying to do, but I do think there is an attempt to start something and to get it done, and I would humbly say that this is a trial on our part. It may not last forever. I don't think this is going to heal any wounds, but it will begin the discussion, and as long as there is discussion, I think that is a good point, but we are not going to solve the City's issues with this, and we understand. But, it is a good faith effort to try to bring, as we say people are talking about, are we praising Calhoun or are we condemning Calhoun? I could read the language to you real quickly, if you want, and I think you will see that we are praising Calhoun, and we are condemning him at the same time. Would you like me to read that?"

Multiple Councilmembers said, "Sure."

Mr. Greene said, "It was very close to what was read earlier this evening. 'This monument to John C. Calhoun, 1782 – 1850, erected in 1896, was the culmination of efforts begun in 1858 to commemorate his career. It was erected at a time after reconstruction when most white South Carolinians believed in white supremacy and the State enacted legislation establishing racial segregation. These ideas are now universally condemned. Calhoun served as Vice-President of the United States under two Presidents, as U.S. Secretary of War, as U.S. Secretary of State, as a U.S. Senator from South Carolina, and as a member of the U.S. House of Representatives, and a political theorist. He was the author of two important works on the U.S. Constitution and the Federal Government, a member of the Senate's Great Triumvirate, which included Daniel Webster of Massachusetts and Henry Clay of Kentucky. Calhoun championed States' rights and nullification, the right of an individual State to invalidate a Federal law which it viewed as unconstitutional. Unlike many of the Founding Fathers who viewed the enslavement of Africans as 'a necessary evil' possibly to be overcome, Calhoun defended the institution of race-based slavery as a 'positive good'. The statue remains standing today as a reminder that many South Carolinians once viewed Calhoun as worthy of memorialization even though his political positions included his support of race-based slavery, an institution repugnant to the core ideas and values of the United States of America. Historic preservation to which Charleston is dedicated includes this monument as a lesson to future generations of the importance of historical context when examining individuals and events in our State's past.'"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Are there any questions?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregorie.

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Yes, I just wanted to know the count, the vote of the Commission, and could you break that down by race for me as well?"

Mr. Greene said, "I can try my best. We have not had the minutes yet, the meeting is tomorrow. We have a Commission, which I have the list here as well. It was, I think, we had a very low attendance that night. I think maybe eight people were there. I think Councilmember Lewis was on the telephone. Is that right?"

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Williams."

Mr. Greene said, "Councilmember Williams, sorry, was on the telephone. So, Councilmember Williams was present, I was present, David McCormick was present, Mickey

Rosenblum was present, Nick Butler was present, Peg Eastman was present, Wilmot Fraser was present, Robert Rosen was present, and I believe Angela Mack was present. So, that actually was only two or three who were not present.”

The Clerk said, “Did you say Nick?”

Mr. Greene said, “Yes, I did say Nick. So, those were present, and I think there were two people, we went sentence by sentence voting for it, every sentence carried by a majority, and I believe and, again, my memory may be imperfect, I think if there were eight people present, I think it was about six ‘yeas’ and two ‘nays’.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Are there any other questions or comments?”

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shahid.

Councilmember Shahid said, “As I understand this to make sure we’ve got this in proper context, this monument sits on the Washington Light Infantry’s property? Am I correct on that?”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Well, I was shared some information a month or two ago by the Washington Light Infantry. Then we pulled the minutes from the City Council meeting that sometime in the late 1800s, that this particular statue or monument belongs to the City of Charleston and that the property upon which it sits, this is not true of the rest of the square, I was told, and it reads this way in the City minutes that I did read, that the property underneath this particular statue, unlike anywhere else in Marion Square, belongs to the City of Charleston.”

Councilmember Shahid said, “I know Mr. Siegling was here earlier. Is he still with us? Did he have a voice in the drafting of this?”

Mr. Greene said, “Lieutenant Commander Theiling was delegated by the WLI to come, and so, then he and also Dr. Bernie Powers, a history professor at the College of Charleston, they were asked to also sit in and give their impetus and Lieutenant Commander Theiling was part of this process.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “They were not voting members.”

Mr. Greene said, “They were not voting members. They discussed, and neither Dr. Bernie Powers, nor Commander Theiling, were present on the night that we did the final vote.”

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregorie followed by Councilmember Wagner.

Councilmember Gregorie said, “I did get a call prior to coming in from Dr. Fraser, who wanted me to say and to convey, that one, we already know the vote was not unanimous, but he also implied that that really wasn’t the final draft that he reviewed, and there have been some changes since then.”

Mr. Greene said, “I would respectfully disagree because we sat here at this table. We read it aloud several times. We got everyone who was present to agree on it. Then we immediately sent it to the people the next day, and I will say that many people like Michael Allen, who had not been at that meeting, did e-mail and congratulate us on getting a good product. So, I’m sorry there is a difference of opinion, but I’m sure if we could record the actual

minutes, which were recorded, that you would see that these words were very labored over and voted sentence by sentence.”

Councilmember Gregorie said, “Thank you.”

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Wagner.

Councilmember Wagner said, “I’ve been listening to this core group over here tonight which is a rather significant group and apparently some pretty distinguished doctors, and I don’t think this is done yet. I think these two groups of folks need to have a little time to chat. The big issue I see, and the big issue I’ve heard both from Ms. Nash and these guys to my left here, was I’m kind of curious, since this institution was an institution of slavery that was repugnant, but it was the time, says, ‘it’s repugnant to the core ideas and values of the United States of America as of now’, not 200 years ago almost, and that’s what’s bothering me. I think these two groups need to talk a little bit. I need some of these guys to be involved with this before we, as a Council, do anything.”

Mr. Greene said, “I will say, sir, if I can. We met in this room, and many of the people speaking here tonight were there giving us their opinions at the same time, as well, too. So, there was discussion among many of the people. They presented at our public meeting, too. We had open comments before and while we were drafting this in this very room, as well. If I may also just say, there were people from the very beginning of this Country saying the contradiction between all men created equal and the creation of slavery, which was legal, was to some extent contradictory.”

Councilmember Wagner said, “Yes, I would think that would be true, but I’m just not sure that the draft I have in front of me is a complete document yet, and that’s what’s bothering me.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “Well, it’s proposed to you as such from the History Commission.”

Councilmember Wagner said, “Okay. I think we need to talk about it a little bit more, Mayor.”

Mayor Tecklenburg said, “That’s what we’re here for.”

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, “I’ve heard and know what went on at the History Commission. I’ve heard what Ms. Nash just brought forward. I actually had gotten an e-mail from her right before Council started. I was able to read her comments. I have here, I think it’s Mr. Barry, one of the gentleman that spoke, I’ve got some comments from him. When you look at the thing that came from the History Commission, you consider Ms. Nash, and you consider Mr. Barry’s stuff, there’s only about two sentences that are different. So, I think if we’re going to go anywhere, I don’t know if sending it back is going to do a whole lot of good. I think this body has got to make a decision on whether or not we want to spend some time wordsmithing, or if we want a couple of our members to wordsmith it a little bit more. That’s, I think, kind of what Councilmember Wagner is proposing. I would not be opposed to that because I really don’t think we’re that far apart as to whether or not we just take it and go, or whether we try to wordsmith it a little bit more and maybe get something that we can all live with. That would be

my suggestion. Whatever good that is, I'll throw that out there. Like I said, this is a no-win situation."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Mayor, I've been looking at this, and I would have to really look at deferring it, because if it comes to me tonight to make a decision, I don't think I would be able to do it. From my reading and my history, I would not be able to approve it. So, I think we need to probably sit down and go over this more, look at it more, get together and go over it. I just can't make a decision right now on this. I've been open about my struggles in this community in this Chamber. I've been locked-up 25 times in the City of Charleston, so it's a little different for me, looking at this project, than the way you all are looking at it. I would actually defer this, then they get together, and come back with something else more conclusive, to me, than this. Looking at this the way it is, I just don't see it as my history and I've been reading all these years. Do you see what I'm saying? So, I have mixed emotions on this. That's the way it is with me. That's a motion from me. That's a motion."

Councilmember Seekings said, "I'll second that."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "There's a second."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Seekings.

Councilmember Seekings said, "Just very briefly, thank you, Mr. Mayor. In just listening, this Council comes to this recently, as opposed to others who have been working on it for a long time and thinking about it. Just listening from the beginning of this presentation until now, Mayor, you said one of the things that this was to do was to bring explanation and context. A word you didn't use was 'annotation.' There's clearly annotation in here, and Mr. Greene, I want to thank you for serving on the Commission, and thank you, Councilmembers Moody and Williams, for going through this process. The Chairman said that what he's produced, or what has been produced to us by a vote of 6 to 2, was imperfect. The synonym of imperfect is flawed, and it is. One of the things I look at, as someone who likes to think about history, I mean, there are some quotes in here. It says 'unnecessary evil' and 'positive good.' Where does that come from? No one has told us that. That's not here. That's not part of our conversation. So, I applaud Councilmember Mitchell for making this motion. I agree, I think we need to work on this. When this goes up, whatever goes up, it's going to be the work of this body. This body, I think, in a matter of just a few moments, probably needs to take a deep breath and think about it. So, I'm going to support Councilmember Mitchell, and I think Councilmember Moody, who was trying to tell us that we need to do the same thing, and make sure that we come up with explanation and context, absent annotation that is, if not perfect, not flawed. So, thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilwoman Jackson followed by Councilmembers Wagner and Moody.

Councilwoman Jackson said "I would just say that I agree with voting to defer, but I would do it on the basis that this body does need to take responsibility. I feel the pain and the dedication that the History Commission has put into this. I think it's a plan that generated from Council and the leadership of the City. I think these servants have done their job, so I would gladly participate in some sort of side group that works through this. Maybe we could call some of the experts, if we need to get the basis for the quotes and the other details about the statement, but I do think we need to have the responsibility on our shoulders after this."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Wagner followed by Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Wagner said, "I think that's what I was trying to say to begin with. These guys have worked very hard. I know they have, but as Mr. Moody once said in this Chamber, 'we need to put it back in the oven just a little, tiny bit more, and let it finish cooking.' I've always remembered that, Bill, so I will always use it. I would definitely say, probably a deferral is in order, at this moment, to do whatever we have to. Councilmember Mitchell might have to go out and arm wrestle, if he wants to."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Moody.

Councilmember Moody said, "What Councilmember Jackson just said is important, that we take responsibility. I'm not interested in kicking this down the road. I think we need to, under your leadership, direct us as to whether we have a group or something. What's our next step is what I'm trying to figure out in my mind. What do we want, not just to defer it, but what are we going to do next, because we need to take ownership of this thing. So, that's kind of what my question is."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Well, I would suggest that we have an ad hoc Committee of Council to gather and put some thoughts on this and their recommendation and bring it back. As Carol said, you would have full disposal of Mr. Greene and the Commission."

Councilmember Moody said, "My admonition to this ad hoc, though, is you've got some doctors back here. You've got some history professors. You've got Robert (Baker) back here, who is a very knowledgeable history person, and as I look around this table here, I don't see a lot of that same knowledge."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Moody continued, "So, and I can't see myself, but I will tell you right now, I'm not one of them. My concern is that we do it right, we do it in context, we do it factually, and we take responsibility for it. Under Mr. Greene's leadership, we probably spent, I'm going to say three hours, minimum, if not four or five, in our discussion. So, it's not just something you're going to snap your finger and do. I'm warning you, but we need a step forward."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I think what you just mentioned, about being factual and all was, in fact, the intent of the Commission. You said it yourself, but if you all want to take ownership of it, rather than kicking it back to them, I think we need to come up with some group of you that would like to explore this a little further."

Councilmember Moody said, "I will serve on that group since I have a little bit of history, but not any knowledge."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Well, you were on the Commission, so you make sense, but at this point, if anyone would like to join here, if you have interest in it, I think that's the way to start. I'll need to judicially add or adjust, as appropriate."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Gregorie.

Councilmember Gregorie said, "I just have a question because we're talking like this is the only thing that we can do, to try to explain it, but it's really not. What I mean is, I understand

the Heritage Act. I've passed that statue from a child going to Mother Emanuel, and it has had an effect, an unbelievable effect. So, to me, if we're saying the only alternative we have now is to develop language or consider other options, perhaps, move it to a museum. I know what I'm saying now is going to sort of brew things up, but I think it needs to be said instead of us thinking that the only alternative that we have right now is to develop some language. Yes, if we went forward, the Legislature may not, but I think I read recently where they're trying to amend the Heritage Act. Whether or not that amendment will go through, we don't know. I'm just saying that I don't think the only alternative here is for us to try to develop language. There are other options that this body can take. This body can move to go forward to the Legislature to have the statue put in a museum."

Councilwoman Jackson said, "I agree."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Trust me, and I know what I'm saying and what that could cause, but it has to be said, instead of us just sitting here thinking that all we can do is write some language to explain it. I think there's more that we can do."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Lewis.

Councilmember Lewis said, "In sitting here and listening to this, the History Commission is a great Commission. They have done what the Mayor has asked them to do. They were charged with something totally different from this, so to me, if this City Council wishes to keep it where it's at, then this City Council should vote to keep it where it's at. If this City Council wishes to ask the State Legislature to move it, then move it. To waste a bunch of time to try and put some more wording around a statue, that's already been worded for I don't know how many years, before my time, to change anything, or put any plaque in front of it, I think it's ludicrous. I think if it's the wish of this City Council for it to stay there, then seven people need to say 'stay.' Leave it, or if they want it moved, seven people ought to say 'move it.' Leave it at that. Right now, to me, this is a waste of time. If I had to vote tonight to leave it or move it, I would vote to move it. I'll tell you that, point blank. I don't play games. I'll tell you just like that. We're beating around the bush about changing the wording here and changing the wording there and just wasting a lot of time of this Commission. That's not what they are charged to do. So, if we want it to stay, leave it, or if we want it to go, then we let it go, and let the State legislature make the final decision. I'm ready to vote tonight up or down."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Call for the question, Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "There's a motion on the floor to defer."

Councilmember Lewis said, "The motion on the floor to defer supersedes any other motion, so I won't make any other motion. I'm not making a motion."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Which was seconded."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Waring.

Councilmember Waring said, "I won't be long, but I'd like to ask the gentleman to the microphone. You said the vote was 6 to 2. Can you tell the breakdown racially on that vote?"

Mr. Greene said, "I will try, by looking at this. Again, I don't have the minutes here. I think the Councilman on the phone was against it. I think Dr. Fraser was against it, but I think everyone else present was for it."

The Clerk said, "I believe Councilmember Williams voted for it."

Mr. Greene said, "He voted for it? Again, I'm sorry. We meet again tomorrow."

The Clerk said, "We need the minutes before we speak specifically, but I believe Councilmember Williams voted for it."

Mr. Greene said, "Again, it was on the phone, so I could not hear. We meet on the first Wednesday of the month. If I could just quickly interject something about what Mr. Seekings is saying. When we do anything that we put on a plaque, we now make sure that it is footnoted. Although this appears without footnotes, we now make sure that we can substantiate everything that we say. We do our best to try to take opinions and facts. We even worried about the word, 'important.' 'Important' is a qualitative word, so we did try to back this up with facts, and I applaud you for doing that."

Mayor Tecklenburg asked, "Did you have a follow-up?"

Councilmember Waring asked, "How many people, number-wise, are on the Commission versus how many voted?"

Mr. Greene said, "So, on the Commission, there are one, two, three, four, five, six, seven, eight, nine, ten, eleven. I see Judge Sanders' name is not here. He's on the Commission, but he's never attended a meeting."

The Clerk said, "He has a conflict with a class."

Mr. Greene said, "So, we did have a quorum. As I said, every sentence was voted for, and every sentence, for every paragraph, was carried by a majority. Then, by the end, there was a majority."

Councilmember Waring said, "So, in this vote to defer, if it prevails, I just want some clarification. What are we going to be doing again? We're going to defer it to do what?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I was going to suggest that we have an ad hoc committee of Council, if you want to proceed with one for the plaque, to get together and consternate over the language a little further. That's my suggestion."

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilwoman Jackson.

Councilwoman Jackson said, "Why don't we have the ad hoc committee address the options? We could consider this plaque as an option, and then we could go with Mr. Gregorie's point that there are other ways to treat this statue, and then take responsibility for that, as a Council."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Shahid.

Councilmember Shahid said, "Mr. Mayor, in answering Councilmember Waring's right-on-point question, I would recommend that we do a couple of things with this, send it to either of two existing committees, either Community Development or Recreation."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Arts and History falls under Recreation."

Councilmember Shahid said, "That's why I was suggesting one or the other, the two committees. I think some of these questions that we need to clarify are: an answer to my question about the WLI's role on this, I just want to make sure that we're clear on two points; the Heritage Act and the WLI's interest in this property; and that we're making sure we're doing all of this properly. I think that the Commission has done that, and I appreciate what Mr. Rosen, the Chairman, and the entire Commission has done, but I send that to you. If it's more appropriate for Recreation, it goes to Recreation, and then we are tasked with those specific questions to confirm. I think we can do that, with these gentlemen's help, in anticipation with some other folks from the community as well, but I'd like to have that done. I think, just to echo what has been said already, this falls in our lap, and we've got to take ownership of this. So, when we come back to this, I just want to make sure everybody is comfortable to vote for it, however we vote for it and whatever our final decision is, that we're all fully informed and advised where we're headed with this thing. Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg asked, "Would it be the pleasure of Council to send it to the Recreation Committee?"

Councilmember Waring said, "Well, I have a question about that. Where is the historical background and expertise on a subject like this with the Recreation Committee? Where are the professionals on the Recreation Committee that are going to have the background from a historical perspective, as this Committee did, by the way? I really respect the people you pulled together on that. Frankly, I think you'll get a lot of opinions and maybe political opinions, but expertise? My good friend chairs that Committee, but I just don't see the expertise there. If I need surgery, I want a surgeon. I don't want a paramedic."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I was a chemistry major, so I know a lot about this."

There was laughter in the Chamber.

Councilmember Waring said, "You could blow it up, then, with your background."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "With all due respect, we had this come to us from the History Commission. That's where the expertise lies. So, if what they've presented to you is something that you're not comfortable with, maybe there are other considerations, but I think they've given it their best shot. They've heard these other opinions that have been presented. This is what they came up with. This is their recommendation. If we don't want to accept it, or if we want to amend it, we can do that."

The Clerk said, "I don't think your microphone is on."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "It is on, but maybe it's low. Is that better? Sometimes it helps for me to use both."

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Lewis.

Councilmember Lewis said, "Mr. Mayor, I think that's what I just said. If we want to accept what the Commission recommends, we vote on it. If we don't want to accept it, we either vote it up or down. They've done what you've asked them to do. This is not a charge of the regular History Commission. This is something different that you've asked them to do. They've done it. They've sent it to us. If we want to accept it, we accept it. If we don't want to accept it, we don't accept it. That's what this Council is charged with, accepting it or rejecting it, I think. That's just it."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I understand. So, you know, the point was made that maybe you all want to have a little more time to think about it. I'm fine with deferring it to the next meeting, if you'd like. That's the motion on the floor, to defer. Are there any further comments or questions before I call for the question to defer?"

No one else asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Mitchell, seconded by Councilmember Seekings, City Council voted to defer taking action on language for the John C. Calhoun monument.

The vote was not unanimous. Councilmembers Gregorie and Waring voted nay.

The Clerk said, "Two nays? Thank you."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "The ayes have it. Why doesn't Council, if you have any thoughts, if you sleep on it, let me know. The matter will come back to our next meeting, one way or the other. If you want to consider some changes or additional review, just let me know. So, the next matter before us is a proposed Resolution regarding our participation --"

Councilmember Lewis said, "Move that we approve the Resolution, Mr. Mayor."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion to approve and a second. Would there be any discussion on this matter? Councilmember Seekings has been a leader on this matter, and as I mentioned, has a background in geology and testified before our State Legislature and other places about this issue."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Very briefly, Mr. Mayor, I sense there is going to be support around this Council for this. I was just actually looking at the newswires, and since we've sat down and we had a new Councilmembers sworn, the Interior Secretary has decided there will be no offshore drilling in the State of Florida. That happened in the last two hours."

Mayor Tecklenburg asked, "What happened in Florida?"

Councilmember Seekings said, "There will be no offshore drilling off the State of Florida. That was decided in the last two hours."

Mayor Tecklenburg asked, "Who decided that?"

Councilmember Moody left the Chamber at 7:22 p.m.

Councilmember Seekings said, "The Interior Secretary of the United States, so it's a very topical subject. We've been at the forefront of this. As you know, Mayor Keyserling from Beaufort has been, and Beaufort City Council is taking it up tonight. Giving you the tools available to protect our coastline and our tourism industry, this is part and parcel of that, and I'm going to support this motion."

Councilmember Seekings left the Chamber at 7:23 p.m.

The Clerk said, "So, Mayor, our attorneys are telling us we need to get a two-thirds vote because we're adding this to the agenda. This was not a part of the original agenda. It's the amended agenda, so we need to vote to add the amendment."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion on the floor."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "I'll make a motion to add this to the agenda."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion to add this item to the agenda, and a second."

On a motion of Councilmember Mitchell, seconded by Councilmember Gregorie, City Council voted to add the Resolution to the agenda.

Councilmembers Seekings and Moody were not present for the vote.

Mayor Tecklenburg asked, "What happened to Councilmember Seekings? He disappeared. While we're waiting on him to come back, here he comes, are there any other questions or comments?"

Councilmembers Seekings and Moody returned to the Chamber at 7:24 p.m.

Councilmember Waring said, "We added it to the agenda."

The Clerk said, "Did they vote on it?"

The Assistant Clerk said, "No."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We added it to the agenda while you were gone."

The Clerk said, "You were not present for the vote to add it to the agenda."

Councilmember Seekings said, "I would like to vote to add it to the agenda."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "We did that already."

Mayor Tecklenburg asked, "Would you like to add this item to the agenda? You were out of the room."

The Clerk said, "You were out of the room when the vote was taken."

Councilmember Moody asked, "The Resolution you were talking about?"

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We realized we needed a motion to add it to the agenda."

Councilmember Moody said, "Yes."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a 'yes' and a 'yes.' Is there any further discussion about the motion itself?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Lewis, seconded by Councilmember Mitchell, City Council voted unanimously to adopt a Resolution authorizing the Participation by the City of Charleston in Federal Court Litigation by the South Carolina Environmental Law Project to Challenge the Permitting by the Federal Government of Seismic Testing and Drilling in Atlantic Coastal Waters, including Waters Off Charleston County and the South Carolina Coast.

-- INSERT RESOLUTION --

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next will be our Council Committee reports. The first is the Committee on Traffic and Transportation, Chairman Seekings."

Councilmember Gregorie said, "Move for approval."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion to approve. Are there any comments?"

The Clerk said, "Mayor, Janie (Borden) was trying to give us the legal term."

Janie Borden said, "I believe that the record needs to show that we have exigent circumstances to take action on this tonight, in adding it, because it will not be before this Committee again for a determination. I just think the record needs to reflect that we have to take action on this item tonight because the Federal administration could release, or has released, the permits, and it's going to be decided here in South Carolina. So, we need to take action before that determination is made at the State level."

Mayor Tecklenburg asked, "Didn't we just do that?"

Ms. Borden said, "The record needs to reflect --"

Councilmember Seekings said, "The record needs to show --"

The Clerk said, "To be officially on the record, it has to be discussed out loud."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Under exigent circumstances, which we certainly have, which is that, that has just been opened up, and this is a whole new world that we're about to move into, and we need to participate and have a loud voice. So, I think the record has reflected that."

Ms. Borden said, "Correct. Yes, we have that now. Thank you."

Councilmember Seekings said, "As for the Traffic and Transportation Committee Report, I'd just like to put on the record, Mr. Mayor, that our longest-standing member of the Traffic and Transportation Committee was Councilmember Wilson. She was a very active participant on that Committee, and I've been on it ever since I was on Council. So, her service on that Committee, as well as on this Council, was second to none. We've come a long way in eight, twelve years on the Traffic and Transportation Committee, and we couldn't have done it without her. I just want to make sure the record reflects that."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We've got a long way to go, too."

Councilmember Seekings said, "We've got a long way to go. Believe me, we're not stopping. We've not running out of gas, and we're not going to fill up our tanks with offshore oil that was drilled in South Carolina, but we're going to keep moving forward."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "So, the motion on the floor is to accept the report of the Traffic and Transportation Committee."

On a motion of Councilmember Gregorie, seconded by Councilmember Mitchell, City Council voted unanimously to adopt the report of the Committee on Traffic and Transportation as presented.

-- INSERT TRAFFIC AND TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE REPORT --

(Application for Original Certificate of Public Convenience and Necessity:
- Atlantic Coastal Cab, LLC (Taxi)
- In Transit, LLC (Taxi)

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next, the Committee on Ways and Means."

On a motion of Councilmember Mitchell, seconded by Councilmember Seekings, City Council voted unanimously to adopt the report of the Committee on Ways and Means as presented.

-- INSERT WAYS AND MEANS REPORT --

(Bids and Purchases

(Mayor's Office for Children, Youth and Families: Approval to accept a grant award in the amount of \$1,000 from Youth Service America to engage 500 youth throughout the Charleston Community in service-learning, community service and volunteerism in honor of Global Youth Service Day. No City match is required.

(Parks: Approval and acceptance of the Keep South Carolina Beautiful 2018 Palmetto Pride Grant award in the amount of \$8,000 for use in litter cleanup efforts, education programming, and litter awareness campaigns in the City of Charleston. No City match is required.

(Consider the following annexation:

-Property located on South Gevert Drive (TMS# 343-03-00-270) 0.24 acre, James Island (District 11). The property is owned by Union Investments LLC.

First reading was given to the following bill:

An ordinance to provide for the annexation of property known as Property located on South Gevert Drive (0.24 acre) (TMS# 343-03-00-270), James Island, Charleston County, to the City of Charleston, shown within the area annexed upon a map attached hereto and make it part of District 11. The property is owned by Union Investments LLC.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Next are bills that are up for second reading."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "K-1 through K-6."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We want to take K-1 and K-2 together by themselves, so to speak, because we only want to give them second reading tonight."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Okay, I'll make a motion that we approve K-1 and K-2."

Councilmember Lewis said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion to approve Items K-1 and K-2 for second reading. This is a rezoning of what I call the Veggie Bin properties. Is there any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Mitchell, seconded by Councilmember Lewis, City Council voted unanimously to give second reading to the following bills:

An ordinance to amend the Zoning Ordinance of the City of Charleston by changing the Zone Map, which is a part thereof, so that 10 Society Street and two vacant parcels on Society Street (Peninsula) (0.62 acre) (TMS #458-01-04-002, 458-01-04-004 and 458-01-04-021) (Council District 1), be rezoned from General Business (GB) classification to Mixed-Use/Workforce Housing (MU-2/WH) classification. The property is owned by Leonard Storage Co, Inc and John T. Leonard, Inc.

An ordinance to amend the Zoning Ordinance of the City of Charleston by changing the Zone Map, which is a part thereof, so that 32 Laurens Street and a vacant parcel on Laurens Street (Peninsula) (1.32 acres) (TMS #458-01-04-003 and 458-01-02-017) (Council District 1), be rezoned from General Business (GB) and Light Industrial (LI) classifications to Mixed-Use/Workforce Housing (MU-2/WH) classification. The property is owned by Roy F. Cole, Jr. et al.

Councilmember Mitchell said, "Move for approval, K-3 through K-6."

Councilmember Seekings said, "We need to defer third reading."

The Clerk said, "Third reading is deferred, correct."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Third reading is deferred until something else happens."

Councilmember Seekings said, "Closing."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Until closing? Okay, we agreed upon that."

The Clerk said, "Councilmember Moody, just K-1 and K-2 are deferred."

Councilmember Moody asked, "For third reading?"

The Clerk said, "For third reading only."

Councilmember Mitchell said, "I'm going to make a motion we take K-3 through K-6."

Councilmember Shahid said, "Second."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We have a motion and a second to approve Items K-3 through K-6. Is there any discussion?"

No one asked to speak.

On a motion of Councilmember Mitchell, four (4) bills (Items K-3 through K-6) received second reading. They passed second reading on motion by Councilmember Shahid and third reading on motion of Councilmember Mitchell. On further motion of Councilmember Lewis, the rules were suspended, and the bills were immediately ratified as:

2018-001 AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND THE ZONING ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON BY CHANGING THE ZONE MAP, WHICH IS A PART THEREOF, SO THAT 1849 WESTFIELD ROAD (WEST ASHLEY) (0.49 ACRE) (TMS #350-10-00-124) (COUNCIL DISTRICT 5), ANNEXED INTO THE CITY OF CHARLESTON NOVEMBER 28, 2017 (#2017-143), BE

ZONED SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL (SR-1) CLASSIFICATION. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY ANN AND SETH BOMGREN.

2018-002 AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO EXECUTE ON BEHALF OF THE CITY A QUITCLAIM DEED TO THE COMMISSIONERS OF PUBLIC WORKS OF THE CITY OF CHARLESTON PERTAINING TO THAT CERTAIN PROPERTY DESIGNATED AS "REVERTER PARCEL AS DEFINED BY C,H,I,J,D,C 0.164 ACRES" AND SHOWN AS CONTAINED BETWEEN THE LINES RUNNING BETWEEN THE POINTS DESIGNATED C, H, I, J, D AND C ON A PLAT ENTITLED "PLAT SHOWING THE PROPERTY LINE ADJUSTMENT TMS PARCEL 459-06-01-072 & 459-06-01-071 AND NEW REVERTER PARCEL GRACE BRIDGE STREET & MORRISON DRIVE CITY OF CHARLESTON COUNTY, S.C." BY LEWIS SMITH MOORE, P.L.S. NO. 21621, DATED FEBRUARY 9, 2017, REVISED OCTOBER 23, 2017 OF RECORD IN THE RMC OFFICE FOR CHARLESTON COUNTY, SOUTH CAROLINA AND ALSO THAT CERTAIN PROPERTY CONTAINED BETWEEN THE LINES RUNNING BETWEEN THE POINTS DESIGNATED S, C, D, E AND S ON THE AFOREMENTIONED PLAT.

2018-003 AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO EXECUTE ON BEHALF OF THE CITY A FIRST AMENDMENT TO LEASE AGREEMENT PERTAINING TO THE LEASE AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE CITY AND THE CHARLESTON DIGITAL CORRIDOR FOUNDATION OF PROPERTY LOCATED AT 999 MORRISON DRIVE.

2018-004 AN ORDINANCE TO PROVIDE FOR THE ANNEXATION OF PROPERTY KNOWN AS 1 RIVERDALE DRIVE (0.26 ACRE) (TMS# 418-14-00-080), WEST ASHLEY, CHARLESTON COUNTY, TO THE CITY OF CHARLESTON, SHOWN WITHIN THE AREA ANNEXED UPON A MAP ATTACHED HERETO AND MAKE IT PART OF DISTRICT 11. THE PROPERTY IS OWNED BY MAHO HOLDINGS LLC.

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Believe it or not."

The Clerk said, "They're second readings. They have to be ratified."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "We do not have any items up for first reading, but to share with our new Councilmembers, for these ordinances to officially become effective and law, I have to sign them while we're still in session. So, sometimes you have to give me just a minute to do my signing."

The Clerk said, "For our newly-elected Councilmembers, will you please sign your oaths? You have two copies. You can have the folder and keep one copy for yourself, but we need one copy for the record."

Councilmember Lewis said, "Mr. Mayor."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "Okay, our next meeting is going to be Tuesday, January 23rd right here at City Hall, and we will also have the State of the City Address as part of that City Council meeting at 7:00 p.m. Is there any further business to come before this Council?"

Mayor Tecklenburg recognized Councilmember Lewis.

Councilmember Lewis said, "Yes, sir. I'd just like to say a few things. During the snow storm, we were talking about trash pick-up in the business district. I called Jack O'Toole in the City, and Jack O'Toole got with Laura Cabiness and staff. On Saturday morning, they did pick

up all of the garbage out of the business district. I certainly want to thank you all for your hard work because, you know, we were just thinking about residents, but you've got to think about the business district and tourists coming through the streets. I did check again Saturday afternoon, and King Street was clean."

Mayor Tecklenburg said, "I would like to echo how appreciative we all are to City staff during the winter and ice storm that some people knew as 'Grayson.' I don't know if The Weather Channel really had legal authority to give it a name, but they gave it a name anyway. So, in the last two years we've had Matthew, Irma, now Grayson, and folks, our Municipal Emergency Operations Center really works, and the collaboration between our Public Safety, our Fire Department, our Police Department. In this case, as in many cases of emergency, our first responders for the City include our Parks Department, Public Service Department, and so many other dedicated employees in any given department in our City. We're so thankful to them for their dedication and their hard work. They really did a great job, and if I may ask you to give them a round of applause. We'd appreciate it."

There was a round of applause in the Chamber.

Mayor Tecklenburg continued, "Sorry I didn't say that earlier. So, with no further business coming before Council, we are hereby adjourned."

There being no further business, City Council adjourned at 7:31 p.m.

Vanessa Turner Maybank
Clerk of Council