



**CITY OF CHARLESTON
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW - SMALL**

**MEETING RESULTS
DRAFT**

OCTOBER 13, 2022

4:30 P.M.

2 GEORGE STREET

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT: Van Slambrook, Martin, Huey, Wilson, Gardner

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT: Pinto, Bennett, Gordineer

A. MINUTES

1. Review of Minutes from September 22, 2022 Meeting

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENY~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Approval

MADE BY: Gardner SECOND: Wilson VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

B. APPLICATIONS

1. 17 Elliott Street

TMS # 458-09-03-100 | BAR2022-000913

NS | Charlestowne | New | Old and Historic District

Appeal of staff decision: BAR placard not displayed, planter wall height does not allow for designated parking, placement of brick columns.

Owner: James Treyz

Applicant: Cindy Wofford

~~APPROVED~~

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENY~~

DEFERRED

NOTES: **Deferred by Applicant**

2. 1013 Ashley Avenue

TMS # 463-08-01-125 | BAR2022-000914

Category 4 | Wagener Terrace | c. 1920 | Historic Materials Demolition Purview

Request after the fact approval for demolition of historic materials. Site visit 10/13/22 at 8:30 a.m.

Owner: Derrick Boston

Applicant: Alex Overeem

APPROVED

WITHDRAWN

DENY

DEFERRED

MOTION: Denial of after-the-fact demolition of siding. Approval of after-the-fact non-original column removal, detail of wood column to be approved by staff; Size of south window to remain; clarify state of front door, staff to determine replacement; If the policy changes, applicant can appeal directly to the Board.

MADE BY: Gardner SECOND: Martin VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- HCF: Recommend denial of material
- PSC: Not in support
- Brad – (Neighbor)
 - Many homes changing to hardi – more problematic
- One window being replaced, needs to be replaced
- Board
 - Prefer cementitious rather than term Hardi – don't limit to specific brand
 - Concern about upcoming policy meeting and unfairly burdening applicant

Staff Observations:

1. 3/11/2022: Stop Work Order Issued
2. Porch was previously enclosed as seen in the 2004 architectural inventory.

Staff comments:

1. Siding should match original, size, profile, exposure.
2. Provide a window schedule detailing which window are being replaced (per building application).
3. Appears that the size of one window on a side elevation is being changed. The size and proportion should remain the same.

Staff Recommendation: Approval with Staff Comments

3. 18 Bennett Street

TMS # 457-03-01-032 | BAR2022-000915

NS | Harleston Village | c. 1940 | Old and Historic District

Request demolition of rear sunroom addition. Site visit 10/13/22 at 8:50 a.m.

Owner: Moira Shanahan & Kurt Busby

Applicant: Shelley Clark-Gladwell

APPROVED

WITHDRAWN

DENY

DEFERRED

MOTION: Approval

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Gardner VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- Date of porch unknown; sunroom 2006

Staff Observations:

1. Site visit determined visibility of sunroom addition

Staff comments:

1. The sunroom was constructed in the early 2000s and is not historic fabric.

Staff Recommendation: Approval

4. 18 Bennett Street

TMS # 457-03-01-032 | BAR2022-000916

NS | Harleston Village | c. 1940 | Old and Historic District

Request conceptual approval for new front stair and rear addition.

Owner: Moira Shanahan & Kurt Busby

Applicant: Shelley Clark-Gladwell

APPROVED

WITHDRAWN

~~DENY~~

DEFERRED

MOTION: Deferral with Staff Comments and Board Comments to distinguish and lower roof of addition, to develop front stairs, and relocate or reduce rear stair/porch element.

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Wilson VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- PSC: should be subordinate; window shouldn't change; no projection
- HCF: subordinate – pinched in, lower; no projection; recommend deferral for restudy
- Applicant: is slightly inset, willing to lower roof
- Board
 - Should be differentiated and subordinate, think inset is sufficient
 - Not opposed to cover over steps, extends too far, but proposed is too much
 - Roofline should come down
 - Stairs (front) should be carefully detailed (staff can review)
 - Handrail will be required by code
 - Bay should be lightened, but is at odds with porch addition
 - Losing subtlety of inset to framework of side porch

Staff Observations:

1. Visible from Gadsden St, perhaps Halsey Street

Staff comments:

1. Per Secretary of interior Standards and BAR principles, revise the addition to be more subordinate to the existing house in massing and height. The width, extended roof line, and aligned eaves do not depict the addition to be a new part of a historic house.
2. Also, the addition should be differentiated from existing house.
3. Bay projection on the west elevation should be lighter. As proposed, it appears heavy.
4. Revise windows to be more vertical, not horizontal.

Staff Recommendation: Deferral with Staff Comments

5. 4 Trapman Street

TMS # 457-12-01-027 | BAR2022-000917

NS | Harleston Village | c. 1949 | Old and Historic District

Request demolition of historic structure. Site visit 10/13/22 at 9:10 a.m.

Owner: Evelyn Pooser Sullivan Rev Trust

Applicant: Theresa R Evans

~~APPROVED~~

WITHDRAWN

~~DENY~~

DEFERRED

MOTION: Deferral to allow applicant to provide elevation certificate.

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Wilson VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- Finished floor at 11' 3"
- No opposition/ public comment
- Owner has elevation certificate but not in meeting, not provided
- Board
 - Elevation certificate would help, if FFE is within inches of FEMA is different matter. Duct work beneath can be moved
 - If required raising would be different situation
 - Flooding is common in that area

Staff Observations:

1. Property is in a flood zone, AE(11).

Staff comments:

1. The National Park Service standard for buildings that are considered historic is 50 years or older. Constructed in 1949, 4 Trapman is within the guidelines for a structure that is considered historic and should be considered a part of our historic fabric.
2. The mid-century residential structures within Charleston represent post-WWII development and the expansive period of growth during this time. Ranch houses characterize the changing needs for American families, including the integrated garage.
3. The structure is largely intact and has few alterations from its original form.
4. During the site visit, the applicant presented photographs of recent flooding at the house.
5. There are a variety of flood-proofing options. However, elevating the house could ruin the architectural character and form.

Staff Recommendation: Deferral for investigation and documentation of flooding.

6. 100 King Street

TMS # 457-12-04-050 | BAR2022-000918

NS | Charlestowne | c. 1915 | Old and Historic District

Request conceptual approval to alter historic structure, and to construct guest house at rear of property.

Owner: Chris & Anna Minnetian

Applicant: Barbara Looney

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENY~~

DEFERRED

MOTION: Approval of all changes to Main House with Final Review by Staff; Deferral of guest house to allow applicant to consider ruin & incorporating into design.

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Gardner VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- No public comment
- Board
 - Wish rear structure could be reused, believe it is clearly visible

Staff Observations:

1. Garage being demolished is minimally visible from public ROW. BAR Policy Statement allows staff to review the demolition of accessory structures on properties rated less than a category 1 or 2 which are minimally visible from the public ROW.

Staff comments:

1. The front door is nicely detailed but misaligned with the first-floor fenestration. However, it should be noted that the front door is recessed and should be minimally visible
2. The proposed garage is subordinate to and architecturally compatible with the existing structure.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with Final Review by Staff

7. 63 Simons Street

TMS # 463-15-02-031 | BAR2022-000919

NS | North Central | c. 1922 | Historic Material Demolition Purview

Request after the fact approval for demolition of historic structure.

Owner: John Denke

Applicant: John Denke

~~APPROVED~~

~~WITHDRAWN~~

DENY

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Denial of after-the-fact; Required to reconstruct to match with Staff comments; To be submitted within 30 days.

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Huey VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- HCF: disappointed; No sufficient effort to hold up façade; Recommend denial.

- PSC: unclear what lead to this point; No proper documentation; Loss of cultural identity; rebuild with salvaged material
- Board
 - No substantial evidence that attempt was made to restore
 - No contact with staff regarding issues
 - Will be difficult to construct without house to document and measure
 - Can use sister houses for reference
 - Self-inflicted wound, hard to draw

Staff Observations:

- September 14th, 2017 – BAR-S
- February 28th, 2022 – BAR-S Review for Demolition of Historic Structure
 - Motion: Denial of Demolition
 - Staff Comment: “One of the last building types of this kind remaining on the streetscape and should be retained”
 - Staff Comment: BAR staff recommends a full renovation and a proper preservation plan to be submitted to the BAR or Staff for approval.
 - Board Notes: Agree with Staff; Can come back with selective demolition
- May 23rd, 2022 – Permit for “Full renovation with stair bump-out”
 - Approved by BAR-S per Meeting Motion of 3.24.2022 with “windows to be repaired/replaced”
- By June 2022 – Rear portion of structure has been demolished
- September 14th, 2022 – Code Case and Stop Work Order by Preservation Enforcement Officer for “Demolition of structure against BAR-S decision”
- Active Hold on Property for BAR Violation and Constructing a new structure without permits.

Staff Comments:

1. The application indicates the proposal to build a house identical to the house that was demolished. No elevations have been provided and floor plans do not match the proportions of the previous house. Applicant should submit revised floor plans and elevations to match previous structure.

Staff Recommendation: Denial of after the fact demolition, reconstruct to match with staff comments, must submit revised plans within 30 days.

8. 4 President Place

TMS # 460-11-04-141 | BAR2022-000920

NS | New | Old City District

Request conceptual approval for new single-family dwelling.

Owner: Spring and President, LLC

Applicant: John Tucker

APPROVED

WITHDRAWN

DENY

DEFERRED

MOTION: Conceptual approval with Staff Comment #6 and Board Comments: metal roof should be standing seam hand crimped and to consider shifting dormer away from roof edge with Final Review by Staff.

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Wilson VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- No public comments
- 5V roof – hipped will require large cap pieces
- H/S/M and architectural direction – appropriate
- Architectural shingles preferable to large cap 5V requires
 - if metal should be standing seam

Staff Comments:

1. Structure appears very top heavy, though this may be a rendering issue.
2. Dormers dominate roof.
3. At north elevation; restudy windows for balance.
4. Windows very tall compared to floor to ceiling height, ~6'
5. Roof should be hand-crimp, metal.
6. Stucco “blind niche” should be centered vertically.
7. Charleston’s Standard - urban fence is vertically oriented.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with staff comments

9. 6 Montagu Street

TMS # 457-04-01-099 | BAR2022-000892

Category 2 | Harleston Village | c. 1803 | Old and Historic District

Request preliminary approval for alterations to historic house including rear addition.

Owner: Claron Robertson

Applicant: Simons Young + Associates

APPROVED

WITHDRAWN

~~DENY~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Preliminary approval with Final Review by Staff.

MADE BY: Huey SECOND: Gardner VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- HCF: in support; Feel like comments have been addressed.

PREVIOUS MOTION 9.8.22: Conceptual approval with Staff Comment #1 and Board Comment to complete the fanlight and provide more thorough detailing of drainage and potential restudy of siding.

PREVIOUS Staff Observations 9.8.22:

1. *The proposed addition is visible from Montagu Street and minimally visible from Coming Street.*

PREVIOUS Staff Comments 9.8.22:

1. *The newly proposed extension and the new treatment to the original addition are differentiated through material usage and detailing. However, the addition should be subordinate to the existing. Lower the height of parapet at the rear wall as it is currently too tall.*
2. *Proportions of windows in infill are very awkward, while more vertical proportions are preferred this feel stretched.*
3. *This modern addition for such a historic house, staff questions if the architectural direction needs to be restudied.*

PREVIOUS Staff Recommendation 9.8.22: Defer for restudy with staff comments

Staff Observations:

1. Applicant has addressed the Board and Staff concerns from the conceptual review regarding height of the parapet wall.

Staff Recommendation: Preliminary approval with final review by staff

10.96 Ashley Avenue

TMS # 457-03-04-073 | BAR2022-000860

Category 2 | Harleston Village | c. 1800 | Old and Historic District

After the fact request. Request conceptual approval to rebuild piazza stair, replace piazza screening, add hood over entrance, pedestrian and driveway gates, and hardscaping.

Owner: William Cromer & Dang Minh Nguyen

Applicant: Neil Stevenson

APPROVED

WITHDRAWN

~~DENY~~

DEFERRED

MOTION: Deferral with Staff Comments #2,4,5 and Board Comments: 1) Eliminate any recessed lighting on piazza, 2) Differentiate detailing at new piazza stair, 3) Remove 1/2 Bay louvered panel, 4) Confirm reinstallation of shutters, 5) Relocated HVAC to inconspicuous location at grade, 6) Simplify canopy over door on Ashley Ave., 7) Restudy driveway gate design, if no precedent for replication, 8) Restudy paving material at ground floor piazza and maintain historic material and Final Review by Staff.

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Huey VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- PSC: typically, do not condone after-the-fact requests; HVAC visible; Rail is very busy, should minimize.
- Applicant: HVAC very disruptive/visible on ground
- Board
 - Shutters removed for maintenance – going back, update on drawings
 - Ground – if historic brick/brownstone should remain, not change to checkerboard
 - Rail should be distinct from original
 - No recessed lighting
 - Opposed to replicating historic ironwork
 - Questioning door hood detail, originally minor entrance

Staff Comments:

1. At east elevation, the second-floor louvers have been extended half a bay. This necessity should be confirmed or these should be held to the original bays.
2. Gold paint on iron fence should be removed.
3. As much as possible, reuse existing rail and balusters on the new stairs.
4. The number and location of pendant lights do not match between the elevation, model, and electrical drawings.
5. Reduce number of light fixtures on piazza. Additional adjustments include:
 - a. Pendants should be centered and equally spaced
 - b. Match between floors
 - c. Large pendants should be at focal points only

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual Approval with Board and Staff comments

11. 18 Greenhill Street

TMS # 457-11-04-067 | BAR2022-000921

NS | Charlestowne | c. 1920 | Old and Historic District

Request conceptual approval of two-story rear addition and one story covered porch.

Owner: Tiffany Philippe

Applicant: Neil Stevenson

~~APPROVED~~

WITHDRAWN

~~DENY~~

DEFERRED

MOTION: Deferral for restudy with Staff Comments and Board Comments: 1) front door location should remain in place, 2) refine detail of rear shed porch.

MADE BY: Huey SECOND: Wilson VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- Intention is to change siding on rear addition
- HCF: Not differentiated or subordinate; Pinch in and lower roof; Recommend deferral.
- PSC: Should be subordinate; Lower roof; Differentiated; Don't move door.
- Board
 - Make sure detailing of 1 story porch is carried through
 - There is small set back, but roofline needs to be lowered

Staff comments:

1. The proposed addition should be subordinate to the historic structure. Staff suggest altering the roofline and stepping in the sides.
2. New alterations should be differentiated from the existing structure.
3. Front door should not be relocated.

Staff Recommendation: Deferral for restudy with staff comments

12. 26 S Battery Street

TMS # 457-16-02-055 | BAR2022-000928

Category 1 | Charlestowne | c. 1853 | Old and Historic District

Request conceptual approval to remove portion of previous addition, alterations to fenestration, and extend existing garage.

Owner: Stephanie Finch & Kevin Story
Applicant: Joel Wenzel, Thomas & Denzinger Architects

APPROVED

WITHDRAWN

~~DENY~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Conceptual Approval with Final Review by Staff.

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Huey VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- HCF – have easement, very appropriate
 - Recommend approval

Staff Observations:

1. The extension of the garage is minimally visible and would not substantially alter the proportions of the structure.
2. Fenestration changes are not visible from public ROW and are much more balanced.
3. Rear infilled windows are not visible from public ROW.
4. Front window were previously existing and are being reopened.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval and final review by staff

13. 12 Ashley Avenue

TMS # 457-07-04-024 | BAR2022-000922

NS | Charlestowne | c. 1935 | Old and Historic District

Request final approval to apply German schmear masonry finish to existing brick structure.

Owner: Kylie Geddes
Applicant: Up South LLC

~~APPROVED~~

WITHDRAWN

~~DENY~~

DEFERRED

NOTES: **Deferred by Applicant**

14. 84 Murray Boulevard

TMS # 457-11-01-004 | BAR2022-000924

NS | Charlestowne | c. 1964 | Old and Historic District

Request demolition of front stairs and demolition of garage. Site visit 10/13/22 at 9:30 a.m.

Owner: Brooke & Kurt Kesler
Applicant: Erin Lanier, JFM Architects

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENY~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Final Approval

MADE BY: Huey SECOND: Wilson

VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Recused – Martin & Gardner

NOTES:

- 50 year standard good guideline but don't feel that every structure of that age cannot be altered

Staff comments:

1. The garage was constructed c. 1980.
2. Existing porch is atypical for the street, as most other houses have a full porch

Staff Recommendation: Final approval

15. 84 Murray Boulevard

TMS # 457-11-01-004 | BAR2022-000923

NS | Charlestowne | c. 1964 | Old and Historic District

Request conceptual approval for new front and rear porches, modifications to fenestration, new dormers, and limewash brick.

Owner: Brooke & Kurt Kesler

Applicant: Erin Lanier, JFM Architects

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENY~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Conceptual Approval with Staff Comments & Board Comment for fine detailing that needs to reflect Colonial Revival context of house.

MADE BY: Huey SECOND: Wilson

VOTE: FOR 3 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- 2/2 windows – ganged windows; originally 8/8 seemed too busy
- PSC – given age feels alterations are permitted, but concerned some features not appropriate for style
 - House – Colonial Revival
 - Alterations – more Craftsman
- HCF – same comments, also recommend Denial
- Staff – withdrew comment #2. Not intended to be accessible deck
- Board
 - Change to front porch will dramatically change entrance but porch is better suited and has been done to neighboring houses

- Dormers much more visible
- Careful about painting brick
- Not going to address possibility of raising because that may never happen
- Windows are undersized proportionally right now
- All elements proposed can improve house. Detailing will enforce or challenge style
- Seeing a bridge of styles, directing from what house originally was
- Detailing should reinforce Colonial Revival
- Don't think limewash will hurt (work on guideline for painted brick)
- Detailing: window platform, detailing of dormers and proportion.

Staff comments:

1. The additional windows provide a better balance of solid to fenestration. They are better in proportion to the scale of the house.
2. Staff recommend triple hung windows or doors on the center windows to provide access.
3. The proportions of the dormers seem off, staff suggest studying 2 windows in the front dormer.
4. Infill brick and mortar to match existing in texture.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with staff comments and final review by staff
