



CITY OF CHARLESTON
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW - SMALL
MEETING RESULTS

JULY 14, 2022

4:30 P.M.

2 GEORGE STREET

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT: VAN SLAMBROOK, MARTIN, HUEY, WILSON, GARDNER

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT: PINTO, GORDINEER, BENNETT

1. Approval of Minutes from June 23, 2022 Meeting

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENIED~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Approval of minutes

MADE BY: Gardner SECOND: Huey VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

2. 169 Wentworth Street | TMS # 457-03-04-012 | BAR2022-000839

Request demolition of non-compliant historic accessory structure. Site visit 8:30 am.

Category 4 | Harleston Village | c. pre-1944 | Old and Historic District

Owner: Cope and Sophie Willis

Applicant: E E Fava Architects

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENIED~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Approval of demolition with Board comment to salvage historic material

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Wilson VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0
Recused: Gardner

NOTES:

- PSC – no concerns about demolition, request to salvage historic material.
 - Recycled long leaf pine – recommend salvage
-

3. 119 – 121 Broad Street | TMS # 457-12-04-009 | BAR2021-000663

Request conceptual approval for new pool and one-story pool-house.

Category 2 | Charlestowne | c. 1803 | Old and Historic District

Owner: MCCURU Properties

Applicant: Neil Stevenson Architects

Deferred by staff

4. 95 Beaufain Street | TMS # 457-08-03-118 | BAR2022-000828

Request replacement of windows to match existing. Existing windows were installed without BAR approval.

NS | Harleston Village | 1970s | Old and Historic District

Owner: Joshua Reda

Applicant: Ralph Reda

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENIED~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Approved to match existing

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Gardner VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

5. **186 Saint Philip | TMS # 460-12-02-064 | BAR2021-000789**
Request preliminary approval for new, three-story, mixed-use building.
New | Cannonborough – Elliottborough | Old City District
Owner: Ottoman Investments
Applicant: Ashley Jennings, AJ Architect & New World Byzantine

~~APPROVED~~

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENIED~~

DEFERRED

MOTION: Deferred with staff comment #4 and Board comments

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Huey VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

BOARD COMMENTS:

- Refinement of cornice detailing
- Restudy parapet cap detailing at south volume
- Reconsider brick selection
- Consider single doors to match arched masonry openings
- Provide 3D studies of detailings
- Provide sample of materials

NOTES:

- Applicant couldn't find previous results posted
- Doors without arch, did they consider single doors
- Do windows push out?
- Marion Hawkins
 - Concern with progression of details
 - Cornice changes, fewer details
 - Request a denial, deferral
- HOA president, Tulley Alley
 - Concern about simplicity
- Jerry Moran
 - Supported variances because of previous design
 - Urge for deferral/denial
- Previous proposal was extraordinary, now is much less refined
- Vince Graham
 - Appreciate development of corner
 - Could be much better
 - Encourage deferral
- Applicants
 - Think that these details are good
 - Couldn't find example of saw tooth detail in City
 - Cornice material, could only find on Hotel Bennett
 - Not based on financial decisions
 - Hadn't formalized details previously
 - Concrete / stucco is less expensive than proposed handmade brick
- Rick Hardin
 - Preferred brackets that Board requested removed
 - Prefers this design
- Board
 - Regret loss of cornices, added a degree of sophistication
 - Encourage restudy of doors
 - Form still same, good form for corner
 - Proposed materials are good, missing some refinement
 - High quality brick, but is it correct for project. Looks like old historic brick, might be too raw for project
 - Different texture and appearance than this building would like to have
 - Cornice was majestic
 - More interaction with neighborhood association
 - Want to give applicant change to work with applicant without limiting too much
 - Has demonstrated willingness to use good materials
 - May need sample board, 3D model

- Deferral gives applicant and neighborhood to both get what they want
- Not concerned about form and massing, but with details
- Reconsider brick choice

6. 11.5 St. Philip Street | TMS # 457-04-03-112 | BAR2021-000678

Request new construction of mixed use building utilizing existing remnant walls of previous structure.

Not Rated | Harleston Village | c. 1915 | Old and Historic District

Owner: Colin Colbert/ CKC Properties LLC

Applicant: Ashley Jennings, AJ Architect

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENIED~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Final approval

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Gardner VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

7. 109 Rutledge Avenue | TMS # 457-03-01-103 | BAR2022-000840

Request conceptual approval for renovations to piazza.

Category 3 | Harleston Village | c. 1852 | Old and Historic District

Owner: 109 Rutledge Avenue LLC

Applicant: Ashley Jennings, AJ Architect

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENIED~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Conceptual approval with final review by staff

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Huey VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- HCF
 - Currently is in violation of their easement. Request approval
- Change to the porch infill, a column will be added

8. 192 Tradd Street | TMS # 457-07-04-038 | BAR2022-000848

Request conceptual approval for new garage to be located at rear of property

Not Surveyed | Charlestowne | c.1938 | Old & Historic District

Owner: Jesse and Eliza Kimball

Applicant: Sebastian von Marschall Architect, LLC

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENIED~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Conceptual approval with staff comments and Board comment and final review by staff

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Gardner VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

BOARD COMMENTS:

- Remove gable on west side

NOTES:

- Neighbor would rather see hip roof than gable

9. 47 Church Street | TMS # 458-13-01-025

Request conceptual approval for rear portico

Category 3 | Charlestowne | c. 1767 | Old and Historic District

Owner: Peter Finnerty Jr.

Applicant: Sebastian von Marschall Architect, LLC

Deferred by Applicant

10. 31 Rose Lane | TMS # 460-08-01-125 | BAR2022-000841

Request partial demolition of non-historic addition and conceptual approval for renovation of existing addition, renovation of historic house, new garage at rear.
Category 4 | Cannonborough/Elliottborough | c. 1767 | Old City District
Owner: Harrison Malpass
Applicant: Sebastian von Marschall Architect, LLC

APPROVED

WITHDRAWN

DENIED

DEFERRED

MOTION: Denial for height/scale/mass and general architectural direction

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Wilson VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- Access to rear yard/stairs
- Elevation heights not included
- Concern about lot coverage
- Encourage restudy of roof
- Overly complex geometry and roof lines. Hyphen is not technically a hyphen
- Concern about flat roof condition
- Refinement of hyphenated area, clean up roof lines
- Maybe pitched roof on hyphen, subordinate to other masses
- Current addition needs to go away, new doesn't need to mimic footprint
- View simply as addition to historic house
- Opportunity to make even better
- General detaining is positive
- Garage too large, footprint doesn't fit
- Precedents follow typical pattern, this seems too wide
- Should be evidence of hyphen on north side as well
- Maybe won't be same kind of footprint
- Height/scale/mass of addition is off, but it's not far off
- Maybe garage is ok if addition is smaller
- If existing wasn't build, we wouldn't approve proposed addition

11. 138 & 140 Wentworth Street | TMS # 457-03-04-052/457-03-04-051 | BAR2022-000710

Request material change for 1970s infill piazza, currently stucco, to be changes to wood sheathing. Site visit 8:50 am.
Category 1 & 3 | Harleston Village | c. 1840 | Old and Historic District
Owner: Danny & Caitlin Randazzo
Applicant: Lucas & Rachel Boyd, Boyd Architects
Charles Quinn, Remark Landscape Architecture

APPROVED

WITHDRAWN

DENIED

DEFERRED

MOTION: Approval of material change with Board condition

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Huey VOTE: FOR _____ AGAINST _____
Opposed: Gardner

BOARD CONDITIONS:

- Material to be with an exposure of 8" and a tight reveal.

NOTES:

- Siding approximately same thickness as stucco
- Issue with engaged columns, same problems exist with stucco or boral
- HCF
 - Not opposed to a different treatment options but would prefer it to encompass entire piazza area
- Larger exposure 12" would be preferable to 6", with tight reveal

12. 48-50 Alexander | TMS # 458-01-02-002 | BAR2022-000842

Request alterations to windows and paint brick.
Category NR | c. 1939 | Old and Historic District
Owner: Joanna Pease
Applicant: Archer Construction

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENIED~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Approval with Board condition

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Wilson VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

BOARD CONDITIONS:

- Applicant to contact former congregation and “rehome” stained glass

NOTES:

- HCF
 - Opposed to brick painting and stained glass removal
- Provide window inventory, subject to staff approval
- Appropriate update for the new use

13. 96 South Battery | TMS # 457-11-02-031 | BAR2022-000843

Request conceptual approval for addition to rear of house.
Not Rated | Charlestowne | c. 1918 | Old and Historic District
Owner: Jane and Everett Smith
Applicant: Becky Fenno

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENIED~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Conceptual approval with final review by staff

MADE BY: Wilson SECOND: Gardner VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:

- Questions about drainage on roof, will we see gutters / downspouts
- Possibly at reveal between new and existing
- Main roof has internal gutters and downspouts at corners
- Concern about material at base, center section, wood panels
- Details about drainage and flashing to historic house, include in staff review

14. 34 Savage Street | TMS # 457-12-03-134 | BAR2022-000845

Appeal of staff decision, after the fact approval for changes to threshold.
Category 3 | Charlestowne | c. 1870 | Old and Historic District
Owner: Gary and Carolyn Gildersleeve
Applicant: Gary and Carolyn Gildersleeve

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENIED~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Approved after the fact

MADE BY: Huey SECOND: Martin VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 1
Opposed: Wilson

NOTES:

- House is in flood zone
 - Need more information on what was removed
 - Wouldn't have chosen that brick or that detailing
-

15. **43 Hasell Street | TMS # 457-05-01-063 | BAR2022-000846**

Request conceptual approval for removal of non-historic stairs, restoration of dormer, and alterations to fenestration.

Category 3 | Ansonborough | c. 1840 | Old and Historic District

Owner: Ann Reardon and Josh Sherwin

Applicant: Erin Lanier, Julia F Martin Architects

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENIED~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Conceptual approval with final review by staff

MADE BY: Gardner SECOND: Huey VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0
Recused: Martin

NOTES:

- HCF – in support
- Mineral wash will make cohesive

16. **123 King Street | TMS # 457-12-02-048 | BAR2022-000847**

Requesting conceptual approval for storefront changes, restoration of piazza, alterations to fenestration, and roof terrace and rear stair.

Category NS | Harleston Village | c. 1880-1890 | Old and Historic District

Owner: Laura Doyle

Applicant: Erin Lanier, Julia F Martin Architects

APPROVED

~~WITHDRAWN~~

~~DENIED~~

~~DEFERRED~~

MOTION: Conceptual approval with final review by staff

MADE BY: Wilson SECOND: Huey VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0
Recused: Martin

NOTES:

- HCF – in support
- Piazza screen behind columns