RESULTS
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW-SMALL

July 8, 2021 4:30 P.M. "virtually via Zoom Webinar"

1. **5 Sheppard Street - TMS # 459-05-04-069** BAR2021-000551

   Request final approval for complete demolition.
   Category 4 (East Side) c. 1873 Historic Materials Demolition Purview
   Owner: Abraham Dabit
   Applicant: Abraham Dabit

   MOTION: Denial with Staff comments; that the building be stabilized and secured in 30 days.

   MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: WILSON VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

   Staff Comments:
   1. The building does not meet the Minimum Standards for vacant structures (City Code Sec. 21-54, where a vacant building for more than one year is considered a public nuisance. A building shall not be vacant for more than 30 days by law unless the owner is maintaining the property.
   2. The building suffers severely deferred maintenance, open eaves, deteriorating sheathing, absent siding, and accessible spaces. The building should be cleared from all hazardous debris, trash, and properly mothballed, or sealed from the elements and further deterioration until it is rehabilitated.
   3. Pursuant to City Code Sec. 54-241, the Board, on its own initiative, may file a petition with the chief building official requesting that said officer proceed under the public safety and housing ordinance to require correction of defects or repairs to any structure, so that such structure shall not experience demolition by neglect and be preserved and protected. We recommend that be done.

   Staff Recommendation: Denial with staff comments; and 30 days to stabilize and secure.

---

2. **4 Hagee Avenue - TMS # 460-11-01-025** BAR2021-000550

   Request final approval for complete demolition.
   Category 4 (Westside) c. 1890 Old City District
   Owner: Burns M. Forsythe, II
   Applicant: Burns M. Forsythe, II

   DEFERRED BY APPLICANT

---

3. **80 Alexander Street - TMS # 459-13-04-045** BAR2021-000554

   Request final approval for the demolition of modern stucco over CMU wall, and non-historic low brick wall at sidewalk.
   Category 2 (Mazzyck-Wraggborough) c. 1800 Old and Historic District
   Owner: Cheryl Noble and Thomas Conklin
   Applicant: Glenn Keyes Architects

   MOTION: Final Approval with Staff comments.

   MADE BY: HUEY SECOND: MARTIN VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0
   GARDNER RECUSED
Staff Comments:

1. On May 27, the Board granted approval to extend an existing, non-conforming, 9-foot, 6-inch brick wall, with 10-foot, 6-inch piers partially around the property.
2. Staff will be supportive of this application provided the north wall comes into compliance with the zoning ordinance, and emulates the attractive wall that already partially surrounds the property. There is no compelling or extenuating circumstances to construct a 9-foot wall if there is no precedent for it.

Staff Recommendation: Final approval with staff comment.

4. 80 Alexander Street - - TMS # 459-13-04-045  
   BAR2021-000555

Request conceptual approval for the new construction of a one-story addition to the north.
Category 2  (Mazyck-Wraggborough)  c. 1800  Old and Historic District
Owner: Cheryl Noble and Thomas Conklin
Applicant: Glenn Keyes Architects

MOTION: Conceptual approval with staff comments and final review by Staff

MADE BY: HUEY  SECOND: WILSON  VOTE: FOR 3  AGAINST 1  
   GARDNER RECUSED, MARTIN OPPOSED

Staff Comments:

1. The concept of an addition to this historic house is certainly reasonable, and the height, scale, mass and architectural direction is appropriate.
2. While the siting is somewhat atypical there are precedents of street-parallel, secondary buildings at historic buildings. Further, the lot provides no other option for expansion and this design is handsome, relates to the street with simple detailing and modest proportions.
3. The gate and wall should recess further to break the linear frontage.
4. The stair should be relocated within that courtyard to the new construction side, to avoid further penetration into the historic wall. This will also allow the hyphen to be further recessed.
5. The additional opening into the original historic north wall of the building for a pair of doors to the terrace should be moved to the breakfast room to retain as much intact fabric as possible, in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with Staff comments and final review by Staff

5. 166 Wentworth Street - - TMS # 457-03-04-062  
   BAR2021-000552

Requesting final approval for modifications to fenestration on rear addition.
Category 2  (Harleston Village)  c. 1809  Old and Historic District
Owner: Sharon Kofmehl and Jerry Smith
Applicant: Clark Glidewell Architect

MOTION: Final approval with window selection revised and reviewed at Staff level.

MADE BY: MARTIN  SECOND: GARDNER  VOTE: FOR 5  AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. The proposed new window at the south end of the kitchen will be in the existing portion of the house and essentially replaces a window on the existing wall. The proposed window at the north end of the kitchen will be in the new construction
portion and essentially replaces the window in the new design, which received approval on November 11, 2020.
2. Several atypical windows already exist on the east elevation of the house, which is the non-piazza side.
3. The location of the proposed windows is high on the wall without affecting the privacy of adjacent properties.
4. The proposed window is stylistically inappropriate, and should be reconsidered for a product that is more residential in nature, with a raised muntin profile.

Staff Recommendation: Final Approval with window selection revised and reviewed by Staff.

6. **257 Rutledge Street -- TMS # 460-07-04-005**
   **BAR2021-000466**
   Requesting conceptual approval for new construction of duplex and pool.
   Category 4  (Cannonsborough/Elliotborough)  c. 1890  Old City District
   Owner: Courtney Anea Pauling Wagner
   Applicant: Julie O'Connor – American Vernacular
   DEFERRED BY APPLICANT

Staff Comments:
1. Our primary concern is that the building is being elevated to accommodate parking, and since this property is out of any flood zone, it is not required to be elevated at all. Furthermore, carports are not in keeping with the Historic Districts. The building should be lowered to be more relatable to the surrounding context and architecture, and less suburban in nature.
2. The cantilevered massing is contextually inappropriate and results in an awkward massing, especially in relation and proximity to the historic building.
3. While the building has a lower ridge height than the historic building the divergent and incompatible eaves results in an insubordinate scale and mass.

Staff Recommendation: Denial for scale, mass, and general architectural direction.

7. **46 South Battery -- TMS # 457-16-01-053**
   **BAR2021-000537**
   Requesting conceptual approval to replace wood steps to piazza with stone steps and iron handrail.
   Category 2  (Charlestonville)  c. 1835  Old and Historic District
   Owner: Zoe and Brys Stephens
   Applicant: Glenn Keyes Architects
   DEFERRED BY APPLICANT

8. **42 Charlotte Street -- TMS # 459-13-01-175**
   **BAR2021-000451**
   Requesting preliminary approval for the new construction of a duplex at rear.
   Category 2  (Marzik-Wraggborough)  c. 1831  Old and Historic District
   Owner: John Paul Huguley - Bahive
   Applicant: John Paul Huguley
   MOTION: Deferral for massing and general architectural direction with Staff comments and Board comment to verify code compliance.

MADE BY: MARTIN  SECOND: HUEY  VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:
1. We appreciate the changes and improvements that have been made, and some of the directives from the last Board meeting were addressed. However, we feel that the proposal requires further study.
2. A portion of the deferral was for its massing, and the building is now 6-inches taller, and includes a large, intersecting gable, effectively increasing its massing.
3. Massing could be reduced by a simple refinement in interior layout and programmatic study.
4. The current design has elements that are very formal, such as the window element above the entry, and the conservatory, which should be redesigned for simplicity.
5. Reduce windows in size and light pattern.
6. Eliminate or reduce the cupola by 50%.
7. The conservatory form should be simplified, and attached via hyphen, as previously stated in the motion.
8. Simplify the dormers and remove the extraneous surrounding brick.
9. Remove awnings, except over a door.

Staff Recommendation: Deferral for massing, and general architectural design.

9. 66 Church Street - - TMS # 458-13-01-099  BAR2021-000489
Request final approval for piazza enclosure at rear.
Category 3 (Charlestowne) c. 1784 Old and Historic District
Owner: Stanley Porter
Applicant: C. Liberatos

MOTION: Denial as submitted.

MADE BY: WILSON SECOND: MARTIN VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 1
GARDNER OPPOSED

Staff Comments:
1. The staff were comfortable with this proposal (during the April 8, 2021 meeting) on the condition that the enclosure be recessed further by about two-feet. The applicant did not alter the design to incorporate that condition and so the BAR staff cannot support the proposal.

Staff Recommendation: Denial as submitted.

10. 45 South Street - - TMS # 459-09-03-078  BAR2021-000537
Request conceptual approval for new construction of single-family residence.
New Construction (East Side) Old City District
Owner: Toni and Henry Johnson
Applicant: Kenny Craft - Craft Design Studio

MOTION: Conceptual Approval with staff comments 2, 3, and 6; and a modification of comment 5 to read “Further recess the hyphen – increase slightly on both sides to clearly delineate the volumes”; and final review by Staff.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: HUEY VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:
1. Eliminate the first section of screening on the south elevation, in favor of solid foundation.
2. Eliminate ridge cap on roof.
3. Incorporate brackets on both piazzas.
4. Incorporate shutters on all windows for consistency.
5. Further recess the hyphen – increase by 1’ on both sides to clearly delineate the volumes.
6. The grade level ground floor openings are plainly visible from the street and should be concealed. It would be best if the front volume had a smaller opening, as carports in the historic districts are contextually inappropriate.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual Approval with Staff comments noted.
11. 569-571 King Street - TMS # 460-12-02-070  
BAR2021-000556

Request conceptual approval for renovation to modify commercial and residential space.
Category 4 (Cannonborough/Elliottborough) c. 1880/1835 Old and Historic District
Owner: Jasega, LLC (Elaine Jenkins)
Applicant: AJ Architects

MOTION: Conceptual Approval with Staff comments and final review by Staff.

MADE BY: HUEY SECOND: MARTIN VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:
1. Staff are very supportive of the design, but we would like to see the hyphen element on King Street further differentiated from the second floors, and allow the existing buildings to remain articulated.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual approval with final review by Staff.

12. 26 Montagu Street - TMS #457-03-02-047  
BAR2021-000530

Request conceptual approval for rear addition to existing house, and the new construction of secondary building at rear.
Category 3 (Harleston Village) c. 1820 Old and Historic District
Owner: Rachel and Paul Alexander Crystal
Applicant: Becky Fenno

MOTION: Conceptual approval with Staff comments and final review by Staff.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: HUEY VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:
1. Staff feel that the proportions are much improved.
2. On the dependency, the fenestration on the south elevation should be increased to three bays.
3. While we appreciate the simplistic detailing, adding shutters, or other small but impactful elements will add interest.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual Approval with final review by Staff.

\[Signature\]  
7/9/2021 date

\[Signature\]  
July 12, 2021 date