

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT: GLEN GARDNER, BILL HUEY, JULIA MARTIN, LINDSAY VAN SLAMBROOK, FILLMORE WILSON
STAFF PRESENT: LINDA BENNETT, KIM HLAVIN, TORY PARISH



RESULTS

BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW-SMALL

April 8, 2021 4:30 P.M. "virtually via ZoomWebinar"

1. **35 Devereaux Avenue - - TMS # 463-07-00-020 APP. NO. 2104-08-1**

Request final approval for complete demolition of building due to structural failure.
Not Rated (Wagner Terrace) c. 1970 Historic Materials Demo Purview
Owner: Matthew B. Hastings
Applicant: Heather A. Wilson

WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT

2. **205 St. Philip Street - - TMS # 460-08-04-069 APP. NO. 2104-08-2**

Request final approval for rear addition.
Category 4 (Cannonborough/Elliottborough) c. pre-1840 Old City District
Owner: Star Outcomes LLC
Applicant: Julie O'Connor - American Vernacular, Inc.

MOTION: Final approval with staff comments

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: GARDNER VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0
HUEY ABSENT

Staff Comments:

1. The rear addition may be further differentiated by using a *six-over-six* window instead of *two-over-two*, but all other materials and finishes clearly delineate separate construction campaigns so this element is appropriate as proposed.
2. The hyphen has been extended since conceptual approval was granted to include a second story. Volumetrically on paper, the previous version was more appropriate and respectful of the addition, but will be too far away to perceive from St Philip, and blocked by a gable roof from Spring Street.

Staff Recommendation: Final Approval.

3. **12 Magazine Street - - TMS # 457-08-02-081 APP. NO. 2104-08-3**

Request preliminary approval for repairs, modification, and expansion of rear addition.
Category 3 (Harleston Village) c. 1783-1800 Old and Historic District
Owner: 12 Magazine St, LLC
Applicant: David Richards

WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT

4. **84 Lenwood Boulevard - - TMS # 457-11-04-492**

Requesting preliminary approval for new entry stair, new garage, and hardscaping.

Category 2 (Charlestowne) c. 1800 Old and Historic District
Owner: Boo and Isaac Morton
Applicant: EE Fava Architects / Glen Gardner

MOTION: Final Approval

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: WILSON VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0
GARDNER RECUSED

Staff Comments:

1. Although it is very handsome, unfortunately the garage is not visible from the street.
2. Much improved stair is visible, but again, an improvement on what is there and relates to building more appropriately for historic house.
3. All hardscaping is minimally visible, but appears completely appropriate and lovely.

Staff Recommendation: Final Approval.

5. **42 Charlotte Street - - TMS # 459-13-01-175**

APP. NO. 2104-08-5

Requesting conceptual approval for the new construction of a duplex at rear.

Category 1, 2 (Mazyk-Wraggborough) c. 1831 Old and Historic District
Owner: John Paul Huguley - Bahive
Applicant: John Paul Huguley

MOTION: Deferral with staff comments and Board comment that a building be detailed to its proper period rather than falsified historic details.

MADE BY: HUEY SECOND: WILSON VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 1
JM opposed

Staff Comments:

1. The most visible element of the proposal will be the roof, the westerly door, and conservatory.
2. Staff feel that the roof is overly broad, and is highlighted by the unusual depth for a rear building. Appropriate dormers might mitigate the most prominent and most visible feature of the project.
3. The building is not subordinate in mass, and seems akin to a warehouse, which is concerning. Narrowing the depth could help make the massing more traditional for a secondary structure in the neighborhood, and again, help the roof massing.
4. Restudy and balance the fenestration. The windows should be vertical in proportion rather than horizontal, and directed toward a residential scale rather than industrial.
5. The western most door pair, and typical for others, floats above the ground plane with no access, and should become windows if there is no intention for access.
6. The cupola is out of scale and should be restudied.
7. The concept of a conservatory is interesting, especially considering something of the sort was once on the property. Restudy and narrow the connection to the element from the masonry building; a delicate detailing here will be more successful. Some whimsical or folly-like details could be added, but it should remain fairly simple and relatable to the utilitarian masonry building.
8. Eliminate the brick entirely on the western end of the conservatory.

Staff Recommendation: Deferral for massing, and general architectural design.

6. 17.5 Hanover Street - - TMS # 459-09-02-087 APP. NO. 2104-08-6

Requesting conceptual approval for modifications and renovations.
Category 4 (East Side) c. 1913 Old City District
Owner: Vernon and Robin Lowndes
Applicant: Byron Geddings, RA

MOTION: Conceptual approval with staff comments noted.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: GARDNER VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. The material palate should eliminate the vinyl siding and pvc trim which is not permitted in the Old City District, in lieu of wood clapboard, as appropriate for the historic building.
2. The new addition should be differentiated with a small hyphen, which would delineate the historic portion from the new.
3. The front porch should incorporate two additional columns on the second floor front porch, and one more on the ground floor to further balance the porch, and give the porch bays a vertical proportion. This will relate to the rhythm of the bays on the piazza.
4. Reduce the scale of the columns, and construct the entire balustrade in wood.
5. Use a traditional hipped roof on the front porch instead of the trellis.
6. Retain as much of the historic rhythm of openings along the piazza as possible.

Staff Recommendation: Conceptual Approval with staff comments noted.

7. 1 Atlantic Street - - TMS # 457-16-04-080 APP. NO. 2104-08-7

Requesting replacement of wooden gate at driveway.
Category 2 (Charlestowne) c. 1830 Old and Historic District
Owner: William Beak
Applicant: Palmetto Craftsman, Inc.

MOTION: Final approval with staff comments noted

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: GARDNER VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. The design of the door as proposed is appropriate.
2. The door construction should be substantiated, as 1-3/4" seems flimsy, and will be visible when opened.

Staff Recommendation: Final Approval with staff comments noted.

8. 12 Franklin Street - - TMS # 457-12-01-548 APP. NO. 2104-08-8

Requesting conceptual approval for new addition on carriage house at rear.
Category 2 (Charlestowne) c. 1850 Old and Historic District
Owner: Chris and Amy Sercy
Applicant: Rob Hanawalt, Inspired Construction

MOTION: Final Approval

MADE BY: HUEY SECOND: MARTIN VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. This proposal is very sensitive to the modern secondary structure of this Category 2 house, and would be something staff would feel comfortable approving at staff level if not for the architectural designation.

Staff Recommendation: Final Approval.

BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW-SMALL

April 8, 2021

Page | 4

9. **26 Queen Street - - TMS # 458-09-01-064**

APP. NO. 2104-08-9

Requesting final approval for the new construction of wrought-iron balcony at second floor.

Category 2 (Charlestowne) c. 1802 Old and Historic District
Owner: Rick Wilson
Applicant: Virginia Lane

MOTION: Deferral for selective interior demolition and staff verification of precedence and final review by staff with shop drawings to be submitted from the fabricator.

MADE BY: MARTIN SECOND: GARDNER VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. This proposal is very sensitively proposed, and within historic context and staff feel that it is appropriate for approval.
2. They have included all of the details for final approval.

Staff Recommendation: Final Approval.

10. **128 Sans Souci Street - - TMS # 463-08-01-103**

APP. NO. 2104-08-10

Request final approval for window removal.

Category (Wagner Terrace) c. 1935 Historic Materials Demo Purview
Owner: Tommy Attridge
Applicant: Brenton Rueger

MOTION: Denial as proposed

MADE BY: GARDNER SECOND: MARTIN VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

Staff Comments:

1. The windows are character-defining features of the building and should be retained, in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
2. Preservation staff and the BAR have repeatedly recommended denial for the loss of the historic fabric, and these windows are in reparable condition.

Staff Recommendation: Denial.


Lindsay Van Slambrook, Chairperson

4/9/2021
date


Kim Hlavin, BAR-S Administrator

4/9/2021
date