1. Approval of Minutes from June 23, 2022 Meeting

MOTION: Approval of minutes

MADE BY: Gardner  SECOND: Huey  VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

2. 169 Wentworth Street | TMS # 457-03-04-012 | BAR2022-000839
Request demolition of non-compliant historic accessory structure. Site visit 8:30 am.
Category 4 | Harleston Village | c. pre-1944 | Old and Historic District
Owner: Cope and Sophie Willis
Applicant: E E Fava Architects

MOTION: Approval of demolition with Board comment to salvage historic material

MADE BY: Martin  SECOND: Wilson  VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 0
Recused: Gardner

NOTES:
- PSC – no concerns about demolition, request to salvage historic material.
- Recycled long leaf pine – recommend salvage

3. 119 – 121 Broad Street | TMS # 457-12-04-009 | BAR2021-000663
Request conceptual approval for new pool and one-story pool-house.
Category 2 | Charlestowne | c. 1803 | Old and Historic District
Owner: MCCURU Properties
Applicant: Neil Stevenson Architects

Deferred by staff

4. 95 Beaufain Street | TMS # 457-08-03-118 | BAR2022-000828
Request replacement of windows to match existing. Existing windows were installed
without BAR approval.
NS | Harleston Village | 1970s | Old and Historic District
Owner: Joshua Reda
Applicant: Ralph Reda

Deferred by staff

APPROVED  DENIED  DEFERRED
WITHDRAWN
MOTION: Approved to match existing

MADE BY: Martin  SECOND: Gardner  VOTE: FOR 5, AGAINST 0

5. 186 Saint Philip | TMS # 460-12-02-064 | BAR2021-000789
Request preliminary approval for new, three-story, mixed-use building.
New | Cannonborough – Elliottborough | Old City District
Owner: Ottoman Investments
Applicant: Ashley Jennings, AJ Architect & New World Byzantine

APPROVED  DENIED  WITHDRAWN

MOTION: Deferred with staff comment #4 and Board comments

MADE BY: Martin  SECOND: Huey  VOTE: FOR 5, AGAINST 0

BOARD COMMENTS:

- Refinement of cornice detailing
- Restudy parapet cap detailing at south volume
- Reconsider brick selection
- Consider single doors to match arched masonry openings
- Provide 3D studies of detailings
- Provide sample of materials

NOTES:

- Applicant couldn’t find previous results posted
- Doors without arch, did they consider single doors
- Do windows push out?
- Marion Hawkins
  - Concern with progression of details
  - Cornice changes, fewer details
  - Request a denial, deferral
- HOA president, Tulley Alley
  - Concern about simplicity
- Jerry Moran
  - Supported variances because of previous design
  - Urge for deferral/denial
- Previous proposal was extraordinary, now is much less refined
- Vince Graham
  - Appreciate development of corner
  - Could be much better
  - Encourage deferral
- Applicants
  - Think that these details are good
  - Couldn’t find example of saw tooth detail in City
  - Cornice material, could only find on Hotel Bennett
  - Not based on financial decisions
  - Hadn’t formalized details previously
  - Concrete / stucco is less expensive than proposed handmade brick
- Rick Hardin
  - Preferred brackets that Board requested removed
  - Prefers this design
- Board
  - Regret loss of cornices, added a degree of sophistication
  - Encourage restudy of doors
  - Form still same, good form for corner
  - Proposed materials are good, missing some refinement
  - High quality brick, but is it correct for project. Looks like old historic brick, might be too raw for project
  - Different texture and appearance than this building would like to have
  - Cornice was majestic
  - More interaction with neighborhood association
  - Want to give applicant change to work with applicant without limiting too much
  - Has demonstrated willingness to use good materials
  - May need sample board, 3D model
6. **11.5 St. Philip Street | TMS # 457-04-03-112 | BAR2021-000678**
Request new construction of mixed use building utilizing existing remnant walls of previous structure.
Not Rated  | Harleston Village  | c. 1915  | Old and Historic District
Owner: Colin Colbert/ CKC Properties LLC
Applicant: Ashley Jennings, AJ Architect

- APPROVED
- DENIED
- DEFERRED

MOTION: Final approval

MADE BY: Martin  SECOND: Gardner  VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:
- HCF
  - Currently is in violation of their easement. Request approval
- Change to the porch infill, a column will be added

7. **109 Rutledge Avenue | TMS # 457-03-01-103 | BAR2022-000840**
Request conceptual approval for renovations to piazza.
Category 3  | Harleston Village  | c. 1852  | Old and Historic District
Owner: 109 Rutledge Avenue LLC
Applicant: Ashley Jennings, AJ Architect

- APPROVED
- DENIED
- DEFERRED

MOTION: Conceptual approval with final review by staff

MADE BY: Martin  SECOND: Huey  VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:
- Neighbor would rather see hip roof than gable

8. **192 Tradd Street | TMS # 457-07-04-038 | BAR2022-000848**
Request conceptual approval for new garage to be located at rear of property
Not Surveyed  | Charlestowne  | c.1938  | Old & Historic District
Owner: Jesse and Eliza Kimball
Applicant: Sebastian von Marschall Architect, LLC

- APPROVED
- DENIED
- DEFERRED

MOTION: Conceptual approval with staff comments and Board comment and final review by staff

MADE BY: Martin  SECOND: Gardner  VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

BOARD COMMENTS:
- Remove gable on west side

NOTES:
- Neighbor would rather see hip roof than gable

9. **47 Church Street | TMS # 458-13-01-025**
Request conceptual approval for rear portico
Category 3  | Charlestowne  | c. 1767  | Old and Historic District
Owner: Peter Finnerty Jr.
Applicant: Sebastian von Marschall Architect, LLC

Deferred by Applicant
10. **31 Rose Lane | TMS # 460-08-01-125 | BAR2022-000841**

Request partial demolition of non-historic addition and conceptual approval for renovation of existing addition, renovation of historic house, new garage at rear.

Category 4 | Cannonborough/Elliottborough | c. 1767 | Old City District
Owner: Harrison Malpass
Applicant: Sebastian von Marschall Architect, LLC

- **APPROVED**
- **WITHDRAWN**
- **DENIED**
- **DEFERRED**

**MOTION:** Denial for height/scale/mass and general architectural direction

**MADE BY:** Martin  **SECOND:** Wilson  **VOTE:** FOR 5 AGAINST 0

**NOTES:**
- Access to rear yard/stairs
- Elevation heights not included
- Concern about lot coverage
- Encourage restudy of roof
- Overly complex geometry and roof lines. Hyphen is not technically a hyphen
- Concern about flat roof condition
- Refinement of hyphenated area, clean up roof lines
- Maybe pitched roof on hyphen, subordinate to other masses
- Current addition needs to go away, new doesn’t need to mimic footprint
- View simply as addition to historic house
- Opportunity to make even better
- General detaining is positive
- Garage too large, footprint doesn’t fit
- Precedents follow typical pattern, this seems too wide
- Should be evidence of hyphen on north side as well
- Maybe won’t be same kind of footprint
- Height/scale/mass of addition is off, but it’s not far off
- Maybe garage is ok if addition is smaller
- If existing wasn’t build, we wouldn’t approve proposed addition

11. **138 & 140 Wentworth Street | TMS # 457-03-04-052/457-03-04-051 | BAR2022-000710**

Request material change for 1970s infill piazza, currently stucco, to be changes to wood sheathing. Site visit 8:50 am.

Category 1 & 3 | Harleston Village | c. 1840 | Old and Historic District
Owner: Danny & Caitlin Randazzo
Applicant: Lucas & Rachel Boyd, Boyd Architects
Charles Quinn, Remark Landscape Architecture

- **APPROVED**
- **WITHDRAWN**
- **DENIED**
- **DEFERRED**

**MOTION:** Approval of material change with Board condition

**MADE BY:** Martin  **SECOND:** Huey  **VOTE:** FOR  _____ AGAINST  _____
Opposed: Gardner

**BOARD CONDITIONS:**
- Material to be with an exposure of 8” and a tight reveal.

**NOTES:**
- Siding approximately same thickness as stucco
- Issue with engaged columns, same problems exist with stucco or boral
- HCF
  - Not opposed to a different treatment options but would prefer it to encompass entire piazza area
- Larger exposure 12” would be preferable to 6”, with tight reveal
12. 48-50 Alexander | TMS # 458-01-02-002 | BAR2022-000842
Request alterations to windows and paint brick.
Category NR | c. 1939 | Old and Historic District
Owner: Joanna Pease
Applicant: Archer Construction

APPROVED
WITHDRAWN

DENIED
DEFERRED

MOTION: Approval with Board condition

MADE BY: Martin SECOND: Wilson VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

BOARD CONDITIONS:
• Applicant to contact former congregation and “rehome” stained glass

NOTES:
• HCF
  o Opposed to brick painting and stained glass removal
• Provide window inventory, subject to staff approval
• Appropriate update for the new use

13. 96 South Battery | TMS # 457-11-02-031 | BAR2022-000843
Request conceptual approval for addition to rear of house.
Not Rated | Charlestowne | c. 1918 | Old and Historic District
Owner: Jane and Everett Smith
Applicant: Becky Fenno

APPROVED
WITHDRAWN

DENIED
DEFERRED

MOTION: Conceptual approval with final review by staff

MADE BY: Wilson SECOND: Gardner VOTE: FOR 5 AGAINST 0

NOTES:
• Questions about drainage on roof, will we see gutters / downspouts
• Possibly at reveal between new and existing
• Main roof has internal gutters and downspouts at corners
• Concern about material at base, center section, wood panels
• Details about drainage and flashing to historic house, include in staff review

14. 34 Savage Street | TMS # 457-12-03-134 | BAR2022-000845
Appeal of staff decision, after the fact approval for changes to threshold.
Category 3 | Charlestowne | c. 1870 | Old and Historic District
Owner: Gary and Carolyn Gildersleeve
Applicant: Gary and Carolyn Gildersleeve

APPROVED
WITHDRAWN

DENIED
DEFERRED

MOTION: Approved after the fact

MADE BY: Huey SECOND: Martin VOTE: FOR 4 AGAINST 1
Opposed: Wilson

NOTES:
• House is in flood zone
• Need more information on what was removed
• Wouldn’t have chosen that brick or that detailing
15.  43 Hasell Street | TMS # 457-05-01-063 | BAR2022-000846
Request conceptual approval for removal of non-historic stairs, restoration of dormer, and alterations to fenestration.
Category 3 | Ansonborough | c. 1840 | Old and Historic District
Owner: Ann Reardon and Josh Sherwin
Applicant: Erin Lanier, Julia F Martin Architects

**APPROVED**  **WITHDRAWN**
**DENIED**  **DEFERRED**

**MOTION:** Conceptual approval with final review by staff

**MADE BY:** Gardner  **SECOND:** Huey  **VOTE:** FOR 4 AGAINST 0
Recused: Martin

**NOTES:**
- HCF – in support
- Mineral wash will make cohesive

16.  123 King Street | TMS # 457-12-02-048 | BAR2022-000847
Requesting conceptual approval for storefront changes, restoration of piazza, alterations to fenestration, and roof terrace and rear stair.
Category NS | Harleston Village | c. 1880-1890 | Old and Historic District
Owner: Laura Doyle
Applicant: Erin Lanier, Julia F Martin Architects

**APPROVED**  **WITHDRAWN**
**DENIED**  **DEFERRED**

**MOTION:** Conceptual approval with final review by staff

**MADE BY:** Wilson  **SECOND:** Huey  **VOTE:** FOR 4 AGAINST 0
Recused: Martin

**NOTES:**
- HCF – in support
- Piazza screen behind columns